Analysis of current beginning wind instrument class methods

Don Joseph Herbig

The University of Montana

Follow this and additional works at: http://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd

Recommended Citation

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at ScholarWorks at University of Montana. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses, Dissertations, Professional Papers by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at University of Montana. For more information, please contact scholarworks@mail.lib.umt.edu.
AN ANALYSIS OF CURRENT BEGINNING WIND INSTRUMENT CLASS METHODS

by

DON JOSEPH HERBIG

B.M. Montana State University, 1951

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Music Education.

MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY
1958

Approved by:

Chairman, Board of Examiners

Dean, Graduate School

AUG 2 1 1958
Date
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author wishes to express his appreciation to Mr. J. Justin Gray and Mr. Gerald M. Doty for their wise counsel and guidance in the preparation of this paper.

The author also wishes to thank Mr. Lloyd Oakland for obtaining and making available the materials used in this paper.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Terms Used</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delimitations</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. PROCEDURE OF ANALYSIS</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total of Ratings</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rating of Methods</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. ANALYSIS OF THE METHODS</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action Band Course</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Basic Method For The Beginning Band</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beginning Band Musicianship</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Belwin Band Builder Part I and II</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belwin Elementary Band Method</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boosey and Hawkes Band Method</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boosey and Hawkes Instrumental Course</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building The Band</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy Steps To The Band</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary Band Course</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fillmore Short-Cut Method</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Adventures In Band</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Steps In Band Playing</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guide To The Band</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Mark Hindsley Band Method</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern School Band Method</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Band Class Book</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play Right Away</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prep - A Beginning Band Method</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rote To Note Band Method</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith-Yoder-Bachman Ensemble Band Method</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting The Band</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step By Step</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. SUMMARY</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BIBLIOGRAPHY. 100
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Summary of Analyses</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

THE PROBLEM

The purpose of this study was to analyze in detail the beginning wind instrument class methods available at the time this study was done in the Spring, 1958. Since these methods are published primarily for beginning bands in the public schools, music teachers who use them as teaching materials should be familiar with the contents of each method so that they can select those which best suit their individual needs. Many teachers do not have time to analyze and become familiar with the contents of all these methods and therefore are unable to select the method which will provide them with the best possible teaching material. As an aid in the selection of these materials, this study illustrates the strengths and weaknesses of each beginning wind instrument class method.

DEFINITION OF TERMS USED

Method or Methods. Method or Methods refer to beginning wind instrument class methods. These methods are for heterogeneous classes of woodwind, brass and percussion instruments. Definitions of any other terms peculiar to the subject are given in the body of the text in conjunction with the individual aspects with which they may be associated.
DELIMITATIONS

This study covers only that material which is published for beginning wind instrument classes at approximately the fifth and sixth grade level. Individual wind instrument methods, or intermediate or advanced methods are not included.
CHAPTER II

PROCEDURE OF ANALYSIS

In order to analyze the methods objectively, a standard was established upon which the analyses could be based. The author consulted Mr. Lloyd Oakland, Director of Music Education, Montana State University; Mr. James Eversole, Director of the Marching Band and Instructor of Brass Instruments, Montana State University; Mr. William Manning, Instructor of Woodwinds, Montana State University; and Mr. Roy Lyman, Director of Instrumental Music in the Public Grade Schools, Missoula, Montana. The standard which was then established was the combined ideas of these four gentlemen plus some ideas of the author.

The standard was divided into nine separate areas with specific criteria listed for each area. The following specific criteria outline the requirements for a good wind instrument class method.

Rhythmic Content: should provide training in basic note values, time signatures, syncopation and should teach rhythmic reading through the use of rhythm patterns.

Melodic Content: should contain different types of melodies such as folk songs, nursery rhymes and excerpts from classical literature. Much of the melodic material should be familiar to the students and progressively provide examples of the problems mastered in the exercises and in general challenge the ability of the students.
Basic Musicianship: should teach fundamental musical terms, basic theory and in general should develop fundamental rudiments of musicianship.

Suitability to Individual Instruments: should start the different instruments in the easier part of their ranges and progressively work toward the outer limits of each instrument. Woodwinds should start on notes which enables the students to hold the instruments securely, and brass instruments should not be started too low as this may lead to embouchure problems when the middle and upper ranges are developed.

Key Variety: should provide training in different keys up to and including three flats and two sharps - concert pitch. New keys should be introduced through use of scales, and training should be provided in chromatics.

Conductor's Manual: should provide fingering charts for all instruments and give aid in the special problems of each instrument. Fingerings for all instruments should be given with each new note. Material should be written in open score and helpful teaching suggestions given as new problems are presented.

Illustrations and Format: should provide a fingering chart, and fingerings for all new notes should be given only once. Illustrations and explanations should be clear and concise and notations should be large and well spaced.
Quantity of Material: should provide sufficient musical examples so that there is enough exercise to master the problem involved.

Consistency of Development: should promote consistent development. Each new problem introduced must have a purpose in the overall development. Materials must be employed which lead through growth to more growth.

Total of Ratings: the ratings of each separate area are totaled at the end of each analysis.

RATING OF METHODS

Each of the nine areas listed above was allowed a maximum of four points. As each method was analyzed, it was allotted 4 points for excellent, 3 points for good, 2 points for fair, or 1 point for poor according to the extent in which the method in question satisfied the criteria. Thus, a method which satisfied all the criteria in all areas would receive a total of 36 points.

By comparing any area of one method to the corresponding area of any of the other methods, one can easily determine the relative worth of each method to any or all of the other methods.
Rhythmic Content: Most of the rhythmic training is limited to whole notes, dotted half notes, half notes and quarter notes. Eighth notes are introduced in the last three lessons. There is no training in dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes, 16th notes or triplet figures and there is very little drill material for any of the rhythmic problems.

The basic time signature of 4/4 is well presented and some training is given in 3/4 and 2/4 time. There is no training in Alla Breve time, 6/8 time and 3/8 time.

There is very little training in tied notes and there is no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: The melodic content consists of very simple nursery rhymes, folk songs and melodic exercises composed for this method.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.
RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Basic Musicianship:** A few musical terms are introduced but there is no separate provision to teach basic musical terms or basic theory.

There is little or no training in phrasing, dynamics, slurs, tempo and expression. Harmonic training is limited to four short harmonized melodies.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Suitability to Individual Instruments:** All instruments are started on concert F within the easy part of their ranges. The clarinet and bassoon are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

This method develops an inadequate and very limited range for all instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Key Variety:** A little training is provided in the keys of E flat and B flat only.

There is no training in scales or chromatics and no scales or chromatics are included in this method.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Conductor's Manual:** This manual contains no fingering charts or fingerings for new notes and gives no explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument.
All material is notated in four lines with C instruments on the top line, B flat instruments on the second line, Bass and E flat instruments on the third line and percussion on the fourth line.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**

**Illustrations and Format:** Each student book is provided with an inadequate fingering chart which includes only those notes used in this method. Fingerings for all new notes are given at the time the note is introduced and explanations of new terms and problems are given when the term or problem is introduced.

Notation and printing are clear and easy to read.

**RATING - Fair - 2 points**

**Quantity of Material:** Student books are 5 1/2"x7" and contain 16 pages. There are 14 lessons with each lesson divided into approximately 6 short exercises.

Most of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key training and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved. The entire contents of this method could easily be covered in 4 or 5 lessons.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**

**Consistency of Development:** Development is very slow and limited in this method.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**
# TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 10
Rhythmic Content: This method adequately covers most of the basic problems of rhythmic reading. The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 16th note are well presented in progressive order. Dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes and triplet figures are also well presented.

The basic time signatures of 4/4, 3/4, 2/4, 6/8 and Alla Breve time are well covered but there is no material in 3/8 time.

There is good training in tied notes but very little training in syncopation. Several exercises in rhythmic drill are provided so that the students may practice and compare the different rhythm patterns.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Melodic Content: The melodic material is quite evenly divided between familiar folk songs, nursery rhymes, Christmas carols and melodies which were evidently composed for this method.

The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, phrasing, slurs, dynamics and expression.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Basic Musicianship: Basic musical terms and rudiments are listed on two pages in the back of the book. In addition, explanations of...
terms and rudiments are given with the exercise which introduces that particular term or rudiment.

Good training is provided in phrasing, dynamics, tempo, slurs and expression. This method begins in unison and then progresses to two part, three part, four part and full band arrangements.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. The bassoon and clarinet are started on open fingerings which give the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

Special exercises are provided with lip slurs for brass instruments, register slurs for clarinets and interval slurs for the other instruments. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert E flat, B flat or F and a few exercises and songs are in concert A flat. One page contains scales in concert B flat, E flat, A flat, D flat, F and C. In addition, several exercises provide training in scales and chromatics.

RATING - Fair - 2 points
Conductor's Manual: The conductor's manual is written in two parts with each part covering one-half of the material. The first part provides fingering charts for each instrument, fingerings for all new notes and detailed explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. All exercises are written in open score and helpful teaching aids are given with each exercise.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a good fingering chart and fingerings for each note are given at the time the note is introduced. Explanations of rhythmic problems, musical terms and rudiments are given at the time each one is introduced. Illustrations and explanations are clear and concise and notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 34 pages. There are 32 lessons, with each divided into approximately 10 exercises. Lesson 10 contains 6 songs for concert material, lesson 17 contains 5 songs for concert material and lessons 29 through 32 contain a total of 11 songs for concert material. Several songs can be used as solos, duets and trios. There are sufficient musical examples to master most of the problems involved.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Consistency of Development: The material in this method is presented in logical order and is consistent in development throughout.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points
## TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 33
Rhythmic Content: This method covers only part of the basic problems of rhythmic reading. The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 8th note are presented in progressive order. There is no training in dotted 8th notes, 16th notes or triplet figures.

The time signatures of 4/4, 3/4 and 2/4 are the only time signatures used.

There is some training in tied notes but no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material is either familiar folk songs, nursery rhymes or melodies which were evidently composed for this method. There are a few excerpts from classical literature but these are quite short and very simple.

The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, phrasing, slurs, dynamics, tempo and expression.

The melodic material does not appreciably advance in difficulty and in general does not challenge the musical ability of the students. To illustrate this, by the last lesson one of the most difficult songs
to be presented is "America The Beautiful."

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Basic Musicianship: Explanations of musical terms and rudiments are given with the lesson which introduces that particular term or rudiment. There is no separate provision to teach musical terms or basic theory as such.

Good training is provided in phrasing, dynamics, tempo, slurs and expression. Accents and articulation are also stressed in several exercises. Most of the exercise material is in unison but much of the melodic material, beginning with the first lesson, is harmonized.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: Most of the instruments are started on concert F within the easy part of their ranges. The flute and possibly the oboe are started on A. The bassoon and clarinet are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instrument.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert B flat, E flat and F. Concert A flat is used in two lessons and concert D flat is used in one lesson. Several exercises provide training in scales,
chromatics and chord studies, but there is no separate page for scale practice.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Conductor's Manual: A master chart at the beginning of the manual shows which keys, time signatures, rhythms and musical terms are used in each lesson. Another chart shows the development of pitch ranges for each instrument in each lesson. The fingering charts for all brass instruments give the harmonics for each fingering. Fingering charts for the woodwinds show only the keys and their numbers.

There are no explanations of problems peculiar to each instrument and no fingerings are given as the different notes are introduced.

Each lesson is divided into two parts. Part A is the exercise material and part B is the melodic material. Part A, the exercise material, is not given in the conductor's manual and all harmonized material of part B is written in closed score with much of the material showing no voicing of instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a fingering chart identical to those in the conductor's manual. Woodwind books have an additional chart in the back of the book which shows the visual fingerings for the notes introduced in each lesson. All student books have a fingering work chart so that the students may write down the fingerings as each new note is learned. Fingerings are given with each new note and explanations of musical terms
are given at the time each one is introduced.

Except for the woodwind fingering charts, all illustrations and explanations are clear and concise and notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 31 pages. There are 14 lessons with each lesson divided into two parts. Part A of each lesson contains approximately 8 exercises of drill material while part B of each lesson contains approximately 6 melodies.

Many of the basic problems in rhythmic reading and a few of the basic problems in key training and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Consistency of Development: Development is quite slow especially in rhythmic training. Also, as noted previously the melodic content does not appreciably advance in difficulty.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS: 17
Since this method is in two parts, the cost of using this method will be double that of a beginning method in one volume. This method was rated on the total material contained in the two parts.

**Rhythmic Content:** This method uses the quarter note approach and Part I presents quarter notes, whole notes, dotted half notes, and half notes in progressive order. Eighth notes are introduced in the last three pages of the book. Part II continues on from Part I and progressively presents dotted quarter notes, triplet figures, 16th notes and dotted 8th notes. There is very little training in dotted 8th notes, 16th notes and triplet figures.

The time signatures of 4/4, 3/4, and 2/4 are covered in Part I. Part II introduces 6/8, 3/8 and Alla Breve time, but very little training is provided in these time signatures.

There is good training in tied notes, but syncopation is used only two times.

**RATING - Fair - 2 points**
Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material in both parts is familiar folk songs, nursery rhymes and melodies which were composed for the method. There are a few easy marches and a few easy melodies from classical literature.

The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings and rhythmic problems. There is some training in slurs, but very little training in phrasing, dynamics, tempo and expression.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Basic Musicianship: The musical terms and rudiments used in Part I are listed in the back of the book. Part II has a more complete list of musical terms. There is no separate provision to teach basic theory.

There is some training in slurs, but little training is provided in phrasing, dynamics, tempo and expression. Harmonic training is started in the form of duets and progressively expands to include full band arrangements.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. However, each student book is provided with a page of "Optional Preparatory Tones" which starts the different instruments such as the clarinet and bassoon on notes other than those with open fingerings. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.
At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

**RATING - Good - 3 points**

**Key Variety:** Most of the material in Part I is in concert E flat and B flat. Concert F is used a few times and concert A flat is used only in the last exercise. In Part II, most of the material is in concert E flat, B flat and F and concert A flat is used 13 times.

There is very little exercise material in scales or chromatics in either part and Part I does not provide a separate page for scales. The only scales included in Part II are the major scales in concert F, B flat, E flat, A flat and chromatic scales in concert B flat and E flat.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**

**Conductor's Manual:** This manual, Part I & II, does not provide fingering charts or explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. Fingerings are given for all new notes and helpful teaching suggestions are given with some of the exercises.

Harmonized material is written in closed score with inadequate indications of the instrumentation for the different parts.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**

**Illustrations and Format:** Each student book, Part I & II, is provided with a fingering chart and the fingerings for each note are given at the time the note is introduced. As each new problem is introduced in Part I it is numbered so that the student may refer to
the indexed explanations in the back of the book. Part II does not give explanations of new problems.

The pages are neat looking and all notation is easy to read.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 27 and 23 pages respectively. Part I is divided into 168 exercises and Part II is divided into 133 exercises. In addition, Part II contains 2 program pieces and a solo number.

Several of the basic problems in rhythmic training, key training and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Consistency of Development: This method is quite slow in development especially through the first half of the material. Development in the last part of the method is quite rapid, but does not thoroughly develop all of the problems involved.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 18
Rhythmic Content: The basic note values and their respective rests, from the whole note through the sixteenth note are presented in progressive order. However, there is little training in dotted quarter notes, dotted eighth notes, sixteenth notes or triplet figures.

The time signatures of 4/4, 3/4 and 2/4 are well covered. There is some training in Alla Breve time, but 6/8 time is only presented in six short exercises and 3/8 time is only presented in three short exercises. Ties are well presented, but there is little or no training in syncopation.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material is either familiar folk songs or nursery rhymes. Any other songs appear to be melodic exercises which have been assigned a title.

The melodic material progressively expands in range to cover new notes as they are learned and also provides training in each new rhythmic problem that is introduced. The melodies also provide good training in slurs.

The melodies do not provide training in phrasing, dynamics,
tempo or expression. In the last half of the book, the melodies do not appreciably advance in difficulty and in general do not challenge the ability of the students.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Basic Musicianship: Basic musical terms and fundamentals are listed on two pages in the back of the book. Two pages are provided to give the students a written test on notation, note values, accidentals, clef signs, and other basic fundamentals.

A little training is given in phrasing, but there is no training in dynamics, tempo or expression. There is a little training in two and three part harmony and two melodies at the end of the book are harmonized for full band.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All of the instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. The bassoon and clarinet are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments.

Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper range is developed.

At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Fair - 2 points
Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert E Flat, B flat and F. Concert A flat, which is used only four times, is the only other key used.

This method provides little or no training in scales and chromatics and no scales are included on a separate page.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains no fingering charts and gives no explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. Fingerings are given for all new notes.

The first 48 exercises plus all harmonized material are written in open score. All other material is written in one line, concert key, with the drum part written below.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a fingering chart and the fingerings for each note are given at the time the note is introduced. As each new problem is introduced, it is numbered so that the student may refer to the indexed explanations in the back of the book. The pages are neat looking and all notation is easy to read.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 39 pages. Teaching material is divided into 221 exercises plus a solo for each instrument. In the back of the book there are an additional two harmonized pieces for full band.
Many of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key training and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Consistency of Development:** Development is very slow and inconsistent in this method. As an illustration, out of the 221 exercises, the first 54 contain only whole notes, half notes and dotted half notes. Quarter notes are introduced in exercise 55 and continue through exercise 158.

This leaves only 63 exercises in which to introduce and master 8th notes, 16th notes, dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes, triplet figures and syncopation. Also, as previously noted in Melodic Content, the melodies in the last half of the book do not appreciably advance in difficulty.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**TOTAL OF RATINGS**

|                           |        |   
|---------------------------|--------|---|
| Rhythmic Content          | fair   | 2 pts.|
| Melodic Content           | poor   | 1 pt. |
| Basic Musicianship        | fair   | 2 pts.|
| Suitability to Individual Instruments | fair | 2 pts.|
| Key Variety               | poor   | 1 pt. |
| Conductor's Manual        | fair   | 2 pts.|
| Illustrations and Format  | excellent | 4 pts.|
| Quantity of Material      | poor   | 1 pt. |
| Consistency of Development | poor | 1 pt. |

**TOTAL POINTS** 16
Rhythmic Content: This method uses the quarter note approach which means that the quarter note is used as the basic time unit and all other note values are considered as multiples or divisions of the quarter note. All of the basic note values and their respective rests, from the whole note through the 8th note are well presented. The 16th note is not covered as thoroughly as the other note values. There is good training in dotted half notes, dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes and triplet figures.

The basic time signatures of 4/4, 3/4, 2/4 and 6/8 time are well covered. There is some training in Alla Breve time and no training in 3/8 time.

Tied notes are well presented and there is a little training in syncopation. In each lesson there is at least one exercise of rhythm drills so that the students may practice and compare the different rhythm patterns.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material is either familiar folk songs, nursery rhymes or melodies which were composed for this method.
The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, phrasing, slurs, dynamics, tempo and expression.

The melodic material is a little too easy to challenge thoroughly the musical ability of the students.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Basic Musicianship: Basic rudiments are listed in the front of the book and are to be memorized as soon as possible. Musical terms are listed in the back of the book.

Good training is provided in phrasing, dynamics, tempo, slurs, expression and tone development.

This method is based on the rhythmic and harmonic approach and provides good training in harmony. In addition to the harmonized exercise material, there are 5 pages of program material which is scored for full band.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: The instruments are divided into 4 groups. Group I is C flute and oboe; group II is all B flat instruments plus bassoon, trombone and E flat tuba; group III is all E flat instruments plus horns in F; group IV is percussion.

The clarinet and bassoon are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.
Special exercises are provided for lip slurs, register slurs, tone development, tonguing and articulation. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Good - 3 points

**Key Variety:** Most of the material is in concert F, B flat and E flat. Some training is provided in concert C, A flat and D flat and Group I, C flute and oboe, are given a little training in concert G.

Several exercises provide training in scales, chromatics and chord progressions. In addition to this, there are 10 key studies in concert C, F, B flat, E flat and A flat.

RATING - Good - 3 points

**Conductor's Manual:** This manual provides fingering charts for each instrument, fingerings for all new notes and explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. All material is written in open score.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

**Illustrations and Format:** Each student book is provided with a good fingering chart and the fingerings for each new note are given at the time the note is introduced. In addition, harmonics are shown for cornet, baritone and trombone.

Basic rudiments are listed in the front of the book and musical terms are listed in the back of the book. Illustrations and explanations are clear and concise and notation is large and easy to read.
RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 32 pages. There are 2½ lessons with each divided into approximately 11 exercises. In most of the lessons, the first five exercises are designed for individual group playing and the last 6 exercises are for full band. In addition, there are 5 pages of program material which contain 1½ melodies scored for full band. There are sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Consistency of Development: The exercise material in this method is presented in logical order and is consistent in development throughout. The melodic material does not advance enough in difficulty to develop consistently the maximum musical ability of the students.

RATING - Good - 3 points

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>4 pts.</th>
<th></th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>3 pts.</th>
<th></th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>4 pts.</th>
<th></th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>3 pts.</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 32
Rhythmic Content: This method uses the quarter note approach which means that the quarter note is used as the basic time unit and all other note values are considered as multiples or divisions of the quarter note. All of the basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 16th note are well presented. There is also good training in dotted half notes, dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes and triplet figures.

The basic time signatures of 4/4, 3/4, 2/4 and 6/8 time are well covered. There is some training in Alla Breve time and no training in 3/8 time.

There is good training in tied notes and a little training in syncopation. There are several exercises of rhythmic drills so that the students may practice and compare the different rhythm patterns.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material is either familiar folk songs, nursery rhymes or melodies which were composed for the method.
The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, phrasing, slurs, dynamics, tempo and expression.

The melodic material is a little too easy to challenge thoroughly the musical ability of the students.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Basic Musicianship: A few basic rudiments such as the staff, clef sign, note values from the quarter note through the whole note and the lines and spaces are listed in the front of the book. No other rudiments or musical terms are listed or explained in this method.

Good training is provided in phrasing, dynamics, tempo, slurs, expression and tone development.

Most of the exercise material is in unison or on an individual basis. Spaced throughout the book are four lessons of duet material and eight lessons of ensemble material which are scored for full band.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: Most of the exercise or drill material is written for individual study, which if used as class material will leave most of the students sitting idle while the individual parts are rehearsed.

All instruments are started on notes within the easy part of their ranges. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of
their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

A few exercises are provided for lip slurs, register slurs, tone development and tonguing. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Key Variety:** Most of the material is in concert F, B flat and E flat. Some training is provided in concert C and D flat. Concert G and D are introduced, but not developed.

Several exercises provide training in scales and chord studies. In addition to this, the major scales of C, F, B flat, E flat and D flat with their respective minor scales are included in the back of each book.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

**Conductor's Manual:** This manual contains no fingering charts, fingerings for new notes or explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument.

The exercise material is not given in the Conductor's Manual and the ensemble material is written in closed score with no indications for instrumentation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Illustrations and Format:** Student books for brass instruments contain no fingering charts and woodwind books contain only an illustration of the instrument and the keys. Fingerings are given for all new notes.
A few basic rudiments are listed in the front of the book, but these are the only explanations given in this method. Notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 148 pages. There are 32 lessons with each divided into approximately 6 exercises. In addition, there are 4 sets of duets which contain 10 melodies and 8 sets of ensemble material which contain 15 melodies and 33 drill exercises for full band. There are sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Consistency of Development: The exercise material in this method is presented in logical order and is consistent in development throughout. The melodic material does not advance enough in difficulty to develop consistently the maximum musical ability of the students.

RATING - Good - 3 points

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 24
Rhythmic Content: Most of the training in this method is in whole notes, half notes and quarter notes. Dotted half notes, dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes, 8th notes, 16th notes and triplet figures are introduced, but not developed. There are no explanations or exercises for training in any of the rest values. Rhythmic reading is not taught through the use of rhythm patterns and there is very little drill material for any of the rhythmic problems.

Most of the material is in 4/4 time. The other time signatures of 3/4, 2/4, Alla Breve time, and 6/8 time are each used only 5 or 6 times. There is no training in 3/8 time.

There is very little training in tied notes and there is no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: The Melodic Content consists of 4 easy marches, 1 waltz, 1 novelette and 2 overtures, all composed by the author. These 8 melodies are included in the back of the book as concert material.
This method does not use melodies for training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems or problems in basic musicianship. All training material is in the form of scale passages, chromatic runs or arpeggios.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Basic Musicianship: A few musical terms are introduced, but there is no separate provision to teach the basic musical terms or basic theory.

There is very little training in phrasing, dynamics, tempo and expression. A few exercises are written in two and three part harmony and the 8 melodies are scored for full band.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Suitability to Individual Instruments: This method does not include horn in F in its instrumentation. All instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. The clarinet and bassoon are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed. The flute and oboe are started from F¹ down to middle C which puts them in the weaker part of their ranges.

Five short exercises provide training in register change for woodwinds, but there are no lip slur exercises for brass instruments and the cornet is very seldom taken above C¹.
At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Key Variety: The 8 melodies are written in concert F, B flat or E flat with 3 of the trios in concert A flat.

Any other training in key signatures is limited to scales or scale like passages in the keys mentioned above. Several of the beginning exercises are in chromatic runs of four or five notes and one lesson provides training in four chromatic scales.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Conductor's Manual: This manual provides partial fingering charts for all instruments, fingerings for all new notes and explanations of problems peculiar to each instrument. Helpful teaching aids are also given with some of the lessons.

All exercise material is scored for C, B flat, E flat and bass instruments. The 8 melodies are written in closed score with no instrumentation given. None of the material contains a score for percussion.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with an inadequate fingering chart which includes only those notes used in this method. Fingerings for all new notes are given at the time the note is introduced, but these fingerings are not visual and are inadequate for the woodwinds.
Explanations of musical terms and problems are given when the term or problem is introduced, but many of these explanations are not clear or adequate.

Notation and printing are quite small and difficult to read.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Quantity of Material: Student books are 5"x7" and contain 24 pages. The first 16 pages contain the exercise material and the last 8 pages contain the melodic material. There are 15 lessons with each lesson divided into approximately 7 short exercises.

Since the exercise material is mostly scale passages, the only actual musical examples are the 8 melodies included in the back of the book.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: Development is very inconsistent and is limited mostly to learning to play scales. There is no development of melodic material.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 10
Rhythmic Content: This method adequately covers most of the basic problems of rhythmic reading. The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 16th note are presented in progressive order, and the dotted half, dotted quarter, and dotted 8th notes are very well presented. There is very little material on triplet figures.

The basic time signatures of $\frac{4}{4}$, $\frac{3}{4}$ and $\frac{2}{4}$ are well covered, but there is very little material in $\frac{6}{8}$ and Alla Breve time, and no material in $\frac{3}{8}$ time.

There is some training in tied notes, but very little training in syncopation.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material is familiar folk songs and nursery rhymes.

The first few melodies are diatonic, very easy and provide practice in playing each new note as it is learned. The rest of the melodic material is primarily designed to provide practice in rhythmic reading.
Breath marks and phrasing are indicated in most of the melodies, and some training is given in slurs. There is some training in dynamics, tempo and expression.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Basic Musicianship: Explanations of musical terms and problems in basic theory are written below the exercise which introduces that particular term or problem. There is no separate provision to teach musical terms or basic theory as such.

Good training is provided in slurs and phrasing and there is some training in dynamics, tempo and expression.

This method begins in unison and then progresses to duets, three-part arrangements and full band harmonization.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All of the instruments are started on concert E flat within the easy limits of their ranges. The oboe is started on low concert E flat which is harder to produce than notes up around C\textsuperscript{1}. The clarinet is started on F\textsuperscript{1}, thumb only, which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Fair - 2 points
Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert E flat, B flat and F. A little training is given in concert A flat and concert D flat is used 4 times. There is no training in concert C, G and D. Several of the exercises provide training in scales, chromatics and accidentals. In addition, the Major scales from C through 6 flats plus several chromatic scales are included in lesson 25.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Conductor's Manual: This manual provides fingering charts for all instruments, fingerings for all new notes and detailed explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument.

All exercises are written in open score and helpful teaching aids are given with each exercise.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book contains a fingering chart and fingerings for all new notes. Illustrations and explanations are clear and concise and notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"xl2" and contain 32 pages. There are 25 lessons, with each divided into approximately 10 exercises. In the back of the book there are an additional three pieces for solo, duet, or trio and eleven harmonized pieces for full band. In most cases, there are sufficient musical examples to master the problem involved.
-41-

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

**Consistency of Development**: This method progresses at a moderate rate of speed and is quite consistent in development throughout.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

**TOTAL OF RATINGS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 28
Rhythmic Content: The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 16th note are introduced in progressive order. Dotted half, dotted quarter and dotted 8th notes and triplet figures are also introduced in progressive order. However, there is very little exercise or drill material for the mastery of rhythmic reading and most of the training in rhythms is presented in the Melodic Content.

The basic time signatures of 4/4, 3/4 and 2/4 time are well covered, but 6/8 and Alla Breve time are each used only 5 times and there is no training in 3/8 time.

There is some training in tied notes, but no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material is either familiar folk songs, nursery rhymes or melodies which were evidently composed for the method.

The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, phrasing, slurs, dynamics, tempo and expression.
Much of the melodic material is very easy and does not challenge or develop the ability of the student.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Basic Musicianship: Musical terms which are used in the method are listed on the back cover and are briefly explained as they are introduced. There are no explanations or provisions to teach any basic theory.

Good training is provided in phrasing, dynamics, tempo, slurs and expression. Some training is provided in harmony, but most of this is in the form of duets.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All instruments are started on concert F within the easy part of their ranges. However, there is a "Special Optional Preliminary Exercise" for the B flat clarinet, oboe and bassoon. This exercise starts the clarinet on E₁, D₁ and middle C; the oboe on G₁ up to C₂ and down to E₁; the bassoon on small c up to small f. This optional exercise starts these instruments on notes which enables the students to grip firmly their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert E flat, B flat and F. Concert A flat is used 6 times, concert C 5 times, concert D flat
once and concert G once.

In the back of the book are included the major scales and arpeggios through 6 flats and 2 sharps; the minor scales and arpeggios of A, D, G and C; and some chromatic scales.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains no fingering charts or fingerings of notes, but does give explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. Harmony parts are lettered A, B, C, D and E with indications of which parts the different instruments can play.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Illustrations and Format: Woodwind books show the instruments with the numbered keys, but give no fingering charts of the notes. Visual fingerings are given only as new notes are introduced. Many of the explanations seem inadequate. As an example: When Alla Breve time is introduced, the only explanation given is "New Time Signature".

Notation and printing are easy to read.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 7"x10" and contain 32 pages. Of the 123 exercises, 29 are drill material, 69 are melodic material and 26 are the scales included in the back of the book. Many of the exercises are very short and 17 of the 29 drill exercises are in whole notes. This leaves only 12 exercises to introduce and master all of the remaining rhythmic problems.
As one can readily see, there is insufficient material to master the problems involved.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: The material is presented in logical order, but there are not enough musical examples for consistent development.

Also, as previously noted, much of the melodic material is very easy and does not challenge or develop the ability of the student.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 17
Rhythmic Content: Whole notes, half notes and quarter notes are introduced on the first page.

There are no actual exercises in rhythmic drill and dotted half notes, dotted quarter notes and 8th notes are introduced in the melodic material. There is no training in dotted 8th notes, 16th notes or triplet figures and training in the other rhythmic problems is very inadequate.

The time signatures of 4/4, 3/4 and 2/4 are the only time signatures used in this method.

There is no training in syncopation and tied notes are used only a few times.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: The Melodic Content consists of very simple nursery rhymes, folk songs and melodic exercises composed for this method.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
Basic Musicianship: This method provides no explanations of musical terms or basic theory.

There is little or no training in any of the fundamental rudiments of basic musicianship. Some of the material is arranged in very simple harmony.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All instruments are started in the easy part of their ranges on tones which form a B flat triad. The bassoon is started on open fingering which gives the student no chance to secure a firm grip on his instrument. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

This method develops an inadequate and very limited range for all instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert E flat, B flat and F and concert A flat is used in a few short melodies. In the back of the book there are 23 very short technical studies which give the first five tones in the Major scales through 6 flats and 1 sharp. There are also 4 short exercises in chromatics.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains no fingering charts or explanations of problems peculiar to each instrument. Fingerings are given with each new note, but these fingerings are inadequate for the
woodwind instruments. A few helpful teaching aids are given with some of the exercises.

Some of the material is written in semi-open score with a separate line for C instruments, B flat instruments, E flat instruments, bass instruments and percussion instruments. All other material is written in one line with the percussion parts written below.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Illustrations and Format: Student books contain no fingering charts or explanations of musical terms and basic rudiments. Fingerings are given with each new note, but these are not visual fingerings and are inadequate for woodwind instruments.

Notation and printing are clear and easy to read.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Quantity of Material: Student books are 5 1/4" x 7" and contain 16 pages. The material is divided into 88 short exercises and most of these are melodic material. This method does not contain enough musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: Development is very limited and slow in this method. The entire contents could easily be covered in 4 or 5 lessons.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
## TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 9
Rhythmic Content: Most of the rhythmic training is limited to whole notes, half notes, dotted half notes and quarter notes. A little training is given in 8th notes and dotted quarter notes, but there is no training in 16th notes, dotted 8th notes or triplet figures. There is very little drill material for any of the rhythmic problems.

The basic time signatures of 4/4 and 3/4 are well presented and there is a little training in 2/4 time. Alla Breve time is introduced, but not developed. There is no training in 6/8 or 3/8 time.

Tied notes are well presented, but there is no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: The Melodic Content consists of very simple nursery rhymes, folk songs and marches which were composed for this method.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
Basic Musicianship: A few musical terms and basic rudiments are listed in the back of the book, but many of the explanations are inadequate. There is no provision to teach basic theory as such.

There is some training in phrasing, slurs and dynamics, but no training in tempo or expression. Harmonic training is started in the form of duets and progressively expands to include full band arrangements.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: Each student book is provided with a page of "Starting Tones" which starts each instrument on one of the easiest tones to produce. The bassoon is started on small f which gives the student no chance to secure a firm grip on the instrument. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

This method develops an inadequate and very limited range for all instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Key Variety: Concert F, B flat and E flat are the only keys used in this book. There are 3 or 4 exercises of scale passages and the scales of the 3 keys used in this method are included in the back of the book.

There is no training in chromatics or in minor scales.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
Conductor's Manual: This manual contains no fingering charts or explanations of problems peculiar to each instrument. Fingerings are given for all new notes and a few helpful teaching suggestions are given with some of the lessons.

Most of the unison material is scored for B flat instruments, C instruments, bass clef instruments and percussion. Some of the unison material has a piano accompaniment in which case only the melodic line and percussion line are given.

The last four melodies are written in open score. All other harmonized material is in closed score with no indications for instrumentation.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a good fingering chart and fingerings are given with each new note. As each problem is introduced it is indicated by an arrow so that the student may look up the explanation in the back of the book. Many of these explanations are inadequate.

Notation and printing are clear and easy to read.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 5"x7" and contain 32 pages. There are 103 short exercises and melodies plus 4 program pieces at the back of the book.

Many of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key training and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.
RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Consistency of Development:** This method is so slow and inconsistent in development that only a few of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key training and basic musicianship are developed.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**TOTAL OF RATINGS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 12
Rhythmic Content: This method presents training in whole notes, half notes and quarter notes. Dotted half note are introduced, but not developed. There is no training in dotted quarter notes, 8th notes, dotted 8th notes, 16th notes or triplet figures.

The basic time signature of $\frac{4}{4}$ is well presented and $\frac{3}{4}$ time is used 8 times. There is no training in $2/4$, $6/8$, $3/8$ and Alla Breve time.

There is a little training in tied notes and no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: Most of the Melodic Content consists of very easy folk songs and nursery rhymes. There are a few short excerpts from classical literature.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Basic Musicianship: There is no provision to teach basic theory or basic musical terms. The only 3 rudiments which are explained are whole notes, half notes, quarter notes and their respective rests.
There is a little training in tied notes and slurs, but there is no training in phrasing, dynamics, tempo or expression. Harmonic training is provided only in 6 short melodies at the back of the book.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Suitability to Individual Instruments: Each student book is provided with a page of "Starting Tones" which starts each instrument on one of the easiest tones to produce. The bassoon is started on small f which gives the student no chance to secure a firm grip on the instrument. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

This method develops a very limited range especially for brass instruments. The highest note given for cornet is D111 and very little training is given above A1. The highest note given for trombone and baritone is E flat1 and very little training is given above small b flat.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Key Variety: Most of the material in this book is in concert B flat. Out of the 75 exercises, concert B flat is used 61 times, concert F is used 8 times and concert E flat is used 6 times. There is no training in any other keys.

There is no training in major or minor scales or chromatics.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains a fingering chart plus the "Starting Tones" for each instrument. Fingerings for new notes are
not given and there are no explanations of problems peculiar to each
instrument or any helpful teaching suggestions.

All of the material is scored for B flat clarinet, E flat alto
saxophone, cornet, baritone, trombone and drums.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book contains a good
fingering chart and fingerings are given for all new notes.
The only three explanations given in this method are for whole
notes, half notes, quarter notes and their respective rests.
Notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 5"x7" and contain 2¼
pages.

Many of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key training and
basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to
master the problems involved.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: Development is very limited and
slow in this method.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
### TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS**  11
Rhythmic Content: The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 8th note are well presented. There is no training in dotted 8th notes, 16th notes or triplet figures.

The basic time signatures of $4/4$, $3/4$ and $2/4$ are the only time signatures used. Out of 181 exercises, $2/4$ time is used 27 times and $3/4$ time is used 21 times. There is no training in Alla Breve time, $6/8$ time and $3/8$ time.

There is very little training in tied notes and there is no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: The Melodic Content consists of very simple nursery rhymes, folk songs and melodies which were composed for this method.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Basic Musicianship: A few basic rudiments are listed at the beginning of the book and a few musical terms are explained as they are
introduced. In the back of the book there are 4 short quizzes on note values, time signatures, accidentals and dynamics.

Good training is provided in phrasing and some training is provided in slurs and dynamics. There is no training in expression, tempo or tone production. This method begins in unison and then progresses from two-part harmony to full band arrangements. Three or four exercises provide training in playing chords.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. The clarinet and bassoon are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

This method develops a very limited range, especially for the brass instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Key Variety: Most of the material in this method is in concert F, B flat and E flat. Concert A flat is used 9 times, concert D flat is used 5 times, concert C is used 6 times and there are 3 short exercises in concert D.

There is no training in scales. One exercise gives the chromatic scale starting on F.

RATING - Fair - 2 points
Conductor's Manual: This manual provides fingering charts for each instrument, fingerings for all new notes and detailed explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument.

The material is either written in open score or on 4 to 7 lines with clear indications for instrumentation. Helpful teaching suggestions are given with many of the exercises.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with an excellent illustration of the instrument and a good fingering chart. Fingerings are given for all new notes.

Explanations are clear and concise and notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 31 pages. The material is divided into 181 exercises.

Since there is no training in many of the basic problems in rhythmic reading and basic musicianship, this method does not provide sufficient musical examples to advance a beginning student to an intermediate level.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: Development is very slow and inconsistent in this method.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 17
Rhymic Content: The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 8th note are very well presented. There is some training in triplet figures, but no training in dotted 8th notes or 16th notes.

The time signatures of 4/4, 3/4 and 2/4 time are well covered and the last 3 lessons are in 6/8 time. There is no training in Alla Breve time or 3/8 time.

A little training is given in tied notes and syncopation. There are several exercises of rhythmic drills so that the students may practice and compare the different rhythmic patterns.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Melodic Content: The Melodic Content in the first half of the method consists mainly of easy nursery rhymes and folk songs. In the last half the melodies are mostly excerpts from classical literature and religious hymns.

The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, phrasing, slurs, dynamics and expression.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points
Basic Musicianship: A few basic rudiments are listed in the front of the book and a few musical terms are listed after lesson 10. In addition, several basic rudiments are explained as they are introduced.

This method provides excellent training in phrasing, slurs, articulation, dynamics and expression.

Most of the material in the last half of this method is written in four-part harmony and each instrument is given the four separate parts so that the students may learn to play all of the parts.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All woodwinds are started individually in lesson I. Brass instruments are started in groups with B flat instruments and trombone in one group, E flat instruments in another group and horn in F alone.

In lesson II through lesson X, woodwinds in C are in one group, B flat instruments and trombone are in another group, E flat instruments are in another group and horn in F is alone. The percussion section is grouped separately from wind instruments in the first 10 lessons. Most of the material from lesson XI through lesson XXIII is for full ensemble.

Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges, but begin to develop the middle register by lesson IV.

Special exercises are provided for lip slurs, register slurs, tonguing and articulation. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points
Key Variety: This method provides good training in concert F, B flat, E flat, A flat, D flat, C, G, D and A. All key training is introduced through scales, chords and arpeggios. The Major scales up through 5 flats and 3 sharps are included in the back of the book and there are 2 pages of chromatic exercises.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains excellent illustrations and fingering charts for all instruments. Fingerings are given for each new note and there are excellent explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. Helpful teaching aids are given with many of the lessons.

In lesson I through lesson X there is a separate score for each group of instruments. Full ensemble material is either in open score or in 4 parts with adequate indications of instrumentation.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with an excellent illustration of the instrument and a good fingering chart. Fingerings are given for all new notes.

Explanations are clear and notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 36 pages. There are 23 lessons with each divided into approximately 9 exercises.

Some of the basic problems in rhythmic reading are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.
All other problems are thoroughly and excellently covered.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Consistency of Development: This method is a little slow in the development of rhythmic reading. However, the general overall development is very thorough and consistent and presents a solid foundation for the beginning students.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 34
Rhythmic Content: The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 8th note are presented in progressive order. Dotted 8th notes, 16th notes and triplet figures are introduced, but not developed. There is very little drill material for any of the rhythmic problems.

The basic time signatures of \( \frac{4}{4} \) and \( \frac{3}{4} \) are well covered and a little training is given in \( \frac{2}{4} \), \( \frac{6}{8} \) and Alla Breve time. There is no training in \( \frac{3}{8} \) time.

A little training is given in tied notes and one melody contains examples of syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material consists of easy folk songs and nursery rhymes. In the back of the method there are 21 "Recreational Melodies" which consist of popular dance ballads such as "The Waltz You Saved For Me", "Good Night Sweetheart" and "My Blue Heaven".

The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems and dynamics. They provide only a little training in slurs and expression, and tempos are marked, "slowly", "moderately" and
"brightly".

The melodic material up to the "Recreational Melodies" does not appreciably advance in difficulty.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Basic Musicianship: Basic note values and accidentals are explained at the beginning of the book and many common musical terms are listed in the back of the book. All other problems and terms are explained when they are introduced. There is no separate provision to teach basic theory.

Good training is provided in dynamics and some training is provided in slurs, tempo and expression. There is no specific training in phrasing or tone development.

Harmonic training is provided only in the "Recreational Melodies". There are 4 melodies arranged as quartets, 3 melodies for solo with rhythm accompaniment and 6 melodies for full band.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. The bassoon and clarinet are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

Two short exercises provide register slurs for clarinet. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.
RATING - Fair - 2 points

Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert F, B flat and E flat. Concert C and A flat are each used 5 times and concert D flat is used twice. The scales for the above mentioned keys are given in the exercises. There is no training in concert G or D.

The major scales of C through D flat plus the relative harmonic minor scale for each are included toward the back of the book. Several chromatic scales are included on another page.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains no fingering charts, fingerings for new notes or explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. A few helpful teaching suggestions are listed in the front of the book.

All unison material is written on one line with the percussion part and the piano accompaniment written below. The 6 melodies harmonized for full band are written in open score.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Illustrations and Format: Each student book contains an excellent illustration of the instrument and a good fingering chart. However, the fingering chart is on a different page from the illustration so that a page must be turned in order to refer from one to the other. Fingerings are given with all new notes.

Explanations are clear and concise and notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points
Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 40 pages. The material is divided into 178 exercises.

Many of these exercises do not contain musical examples and many more are padded so that the volume of actual teaching material is much less than the number of exercises indicate. To illustrate this, 27 exercises contain only the fingerings for the new notes, and 2 exercises contain explanations of musical terms. Scales and scale passages are presented in 50 exercises, but they could easily be presented in 30 exercises.

Many of the basic problems of rhythmic reading and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: This method is not very thorough or consistent in development. There are only 20 short exercises of drill in technique and many of these are in whole notes, half notes and quarter notes. There is no gradual development of harmonic training and the melodies do not consistently advance in difficulty.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 16
Rhythmic Content: The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 8th note are well presented. A little training is given in dotted quarter notes and 16th notes are introduced, but not developed. There is no training in dotted 8th notes or triplet figures.

The basic time signatures of 4/4 and 3/4 are well presented and a little training is given in 2/4 and Alla Breve time. There is no training in 6/8 or 3/8 time.

A little training is given in tied notes, but there is no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: Most of the melodic material is either familiar folk songs, nursery rhymes or melodies which were composed for the method. There are a few excerpts from classical literature, but these are very short and easy.

The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, phrasing, slurs, tempo, dynamics and expression.

The melodic material does not appreciably advance in difficulty and in general, does not challenge the musical ability of the students.
RATING - Fair - 2 points

Basic Musicianship: A few basic rudiments are listed in the front of the book. All other rudiments and musical terms are explained as they are introduced. There is no list of common musical terms or any provision to teach basic theory as such.

This method provides good training in phrasing, dynamics, tempo and expression. Harmonic training is started in the third lesson and continues throughout the rest of the book.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: The instruments are divided into 3 groups with C instruments in group I, B flat instruments in group II and F horn, E flat and bass instruments in group III.

The bassoon and clarinet are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

In lesson III all instruments may play together. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Key Variety: Practically all of the material is in concert E flat, B flat and F. Concert C is used 3 times and concert A flat is introduced in the next to the last lesson. There is no training in G or D.

The major scales of C, F, B flat, E flat, A flat, D flat, G and a two octave chromatic scale are included on one page. In addition, 4
or 5 exercises provide training in scales and chromatics.

**RATING - Fair - 2 points**

**Conductor's Manual:** This manual contains fingering charts for each instrument, fingerings for all new notes and explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. In addition, helpful teaching suggestions are given with many of the lessons.

All material is either written with a line for C instruments, B flat instruments, E flat instruments, bass instruments or is written in open score.

**RATING - Excellent - 4 points**

**Illustrations and Format:** Each student book is provided with a good fingering chart, however, the fingering chart is in the middle of the book. Good visual fingerings are given with each new note. A few rudiments are explained at the beginning of the book and all other problems are explained as they are introduced. The explanations are excellent and notation is large and easy to read.

**RATING - Excellent - 4 points**

**Quantity of Material:** Student books are 9"x12" and contain 34 pages. There are 15 lessons with each divided into approximately 11 exercises.

Several of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key variety, and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

**RATING - Fair - 2 points**
Consistency of Development: This method is a little slow in development, but it is quite thorough in the problems it does develop.

RATING - Good - 3 points

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 23
Rhythmic Content: This method provides training in whole notes, half notes, dotted half notes and quarter notes. Dotted quarter notes and 8th notes are introduced, but not developed. There is no training in dotted 8th notes, 16th notes or triplet figures.

Most of the material is in 4/4 time. There is a little training in 3/4 time, and there is no training in 2/4, 6/8, 3/8 and Alla Breve time.

A little training is given in tied notes, but there is no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: The Melodic Content consists of very easy nursery rhymes, folk songs and melodies which were composed for this method.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Basic Musicianship: Basic note values are explained in the front of the book and a few basic rudiments are listed in the back of the
book. There are no explanations of common musical terms and no provision is made to teach basic theory as such.

A little training is given in slurs, but there is no training in phrasing, dynamics, tempo, expression or tone development.

Harmonic training is limited to 6 short harmonized melodies.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**

**Suitability to Individual Instruments:** This method does not include french horn or D flat piccolo in the instrumentation.

All instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. The clarinet and bassoon are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges and the lower register is the only register which is developed.

No provision is made for register slurs for clarinet or lip slurs for brass instruments. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**

**Key Variety:** Most of the material is in concert B flat. Concert E flat is used 1½ times, concert F is used 8 times and concert A flat is used 7 times. There is no training in concert C, G or D.

Several exercises provide training in scale segments, but there is no training in chromatics. There is no separate page of scales or chromatics in this method.

**RATING - Poor - 1 point**
Conductor's Manual: This manual contains fingering charts for each instrument and gives the fingerings for all new notes. There are no explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument and no teaching suggestions are given.

All material is scored for C instruments, B flat instruments, E flat instruments, bass clef instruments and drums. Individual parts are not indicated in the harmonized material.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book contains a fingering chart and fingerings are given for all new notes. Basic note values are explained in the front of the book and a few basic rudiments are explained in the back of the book. There are no explanations for any of the common musical terms.

Notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 5 1/2"x7" and contain 36 pages. The material is divided into 100 exercises.

Most of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key variety and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: Development is very slow and limited in this method.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
### TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 11
Rhythmic Content: This method uses the quarter note approach to rhythmic reading. This means that the quarter note is introduced first and all other note values are compared to it. All of the basic note values from the whole note through the 16th note are presented in this method. Some training is given in triplet figures and very little training is given in dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes and 16th notes. There is very little exercise or drill material in rhythm patterns and the half note and dotted half note are presented in melodic material without first being introduced in any exercise.

Most of the material is in 4/4, 3/4 and 2/4 time. A little training is given in 6/8 and Alla Breve time, but there is no training in 3/8 time.

There is good training in tied notes, but syncopation is presented only 2 times.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Melodic Content: Most of the Melodic Content consists of excerpts from Classical and Romantic literature. There are several folk songs, but many of these are unfamiliar. The remainder of the melodic material consists of 5 marches, 2 nursery rhymes and 1 hymn.
The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, slurs and articulation, but provide very little training in dynamics, tempo and expression. There is no training in phrasing. Much of the melodic material is unfamiliar and may be uninteresting to the students.

**RATING - Fair - 2 points**

**Basic Musicianship:** The musical terms and basic rudiments used in this method are indexed in the back of the book. There is no separate provision to teach basic theory as such.

There is no training in phrasing and only a little training in dynamics and expression. Good training is given in slurs and articulation.

Harmonic training includes 3 duets and 5 melodies arranged for full band.

**RATING - Fair - 2 points**

**Suitability to Individual Instruments:** All instruments are started on concert D within the easy limits of their ranges. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

Several exercises provide training in register slurs for clarinet and lip slurs for brass instruments. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

**RATING - Good - 3 points**

**Key Variety:** Most of the material is in concert B flat, E flat and A flat. A little training is given in concert F and concert C is
used 3 times. There is no training in concert G or D.

The major scales from C through 6 flats and 2 sharps are included on one page. In addition, several exercises provide training in scales and chromatics.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Conductor's Manual: This manual provides no fingering charts, fingerings for new notes, explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument or helpful teaching aids.

All unison material is written on a single line with the drum part and piano accompaniment written below. The 5 harmonized melodies are written in 6 parts with the instrumentation given for each part.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a fingering chart which is placed in the middle of the book. Fingerings are given for all new notes, but these are not visual fingerings and the students will have to refer to the chart, especially for notes which use numbered keys.

As each new problem is introduced it is assigned a number which corresponds to the indexed explanations in the back of the book. This method contains no separate list of common musical terms or basic rudiments.

Printing and notation are large and clear and easy to read.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 40 pages. The material is divided into 180 exercises.
Several of the basic problems in rhythmic reading and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Consistency of Development: In general, this method progresses moderately and is quite consistent in development throughout. A few problems in rhythmic reading are not developed thoroughly and harmonic training is not consistent and gradual in development.

RATING - Good - 3 points

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 20
This method is designed to precede any Beginning Wind Instrument Class Method, and its main objective is to gradually make the change from rote reading to note reading.

Since "Rote To Note" is a pre-beginning method, it was not rated as the other methods were. Analysis was made merely to illustrate the content and the manner in which it is presented.

**Rhythmic Content:** Whole notes, half notes and quarter notes are the only note values used in this method. These 3 note values are first introduced as phrase patterns from familiar nursery rhymes. Only after the students have played many of these familiar phrase patterns are the actual note values introduced.

The basic time signatures of $\frac{4}{4}$, $\frac{3}{4}$ and $\frac{2}{4}$ are introduced in conjunction with the actual note values.

Tied notes are also introduced at this time and good training is provided in tied notes throughout the last half of the method.

**Melodic Content:** Most of the Melodic Content, especially in the first half of the method, consists of very easy and familiar nursery rhymes. In the last half of the method, there are several easy folk songs and marches.
The melodies are very easy and are primarily designed to provide training in rhythm patterns and new fingerings.

The words are provided for all of the melodies through the first 37 exercises so that the students may first sing the phrases before they play them on the instruments.

**Basic Musicianship:** Several basic rudiments such as the staff, clef signs, key signatures, note values and notation are explained as they are introduced. A few common musical terms are also listed in the back of the book. In addition, there are 5 quizzes in basic theory on notation, note values and fingerings of notes previously learned.

Slurs are introduced in the last 28 exercises. Dynamics, tempo and expression are purposely omitted until the students attain a higher level of development.

Good training is provided in two part harmony and full band arrangements with harmonic accompaniment.

**Suitability to Individual Instruments:** The instruments are divided into 3 groups through the first 32 exercises after which all material is written for full ensemble. All instruments are started within the easy limits of their ranges and at no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

**Key Variety:** Concert E flat and B flat are the only 2 keys used in this method.

The scales for these 2 keys are given in the exercise material and in addition, the major scales of F, B flat, E flat and A flat are included on one page.
Conductor's Manual: This manual contains fingering charts for all instruments, fingerings for all new notes and many helpful teaching suggestions. There are no explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument.

All material is written in open score.

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a good fingering chart and fingerings are given for all new notes. Fingerings are given for all of the notes through exercise 37.

All explanations and illustrations are clear and concise and notation is large and easy to read.

Quantity of Material: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 27 pages. There are 132 exercises of which approximately 32 give only new fingerings or explain new problems. This leaves approximately 100 exercises of musical examples.

The first 37 exercises contain the "Rote" material and the rest of the exercises contain the "Note" material.

There are sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

Consistency of Development: This method is quite slow and limited in development. However, each problem is thoroughly developed so that the students are given a solid foundation in basic fundamentals.
Rhythmic Content: The basic note values and their respective rests from the whole note through the 16th note are well presented. Dotted quarter notes, dotted 8th notes and triplet figures are also well presented. Several exercises provide training in rhythm patterns. The basic time signatures of 4/4, 3/4, 2/4, 6/8 and Alla Breve time are all well covered. There is no training in 3/8 time.

There is good training in tied notes, but syncopation is used only once.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Melodic Content: Most of the Melodic Content consists of familiar nursery rhymes and folk songs. In the back of the book there are 3 harmonized pieces which were evidently composed for this method. The melodies progressively provide training in new fingerings, rhythmic problems, slurs, phrasing, dynamics, tempo and expression.

Except for rhythmic texture these melodies do not appreciably advance in difficulty. To illustrate this, some of the melodies toward the end of the method are "Three Blind Mice", "Humpty Dumpty", and "Hickory Dickory Dock".

RATING - Fair - 2 points
Basic Musicianship: Basic rudiments are explained as they are introduced and many common musical terms are listed in the back of the book. In addition, there are 8 lessons or tests in basic theory, which contain instruction in notation, note values, clef signs, time signatures, accidentals, ledger lines and enharmonic notes.

Good training is provided in phrasing, slurs, dynamics, tempo and expression.

Harmonic training is started in duets and progresses to full band arrangements.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Suitability to Individual Instruments: All instruments are started on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. The clarinet and bassoon are started on open fingerings which gives the students no chance to secure a firm grip on their instruments. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges, but they soon begin to expand toward the middle register.

Several exercises provide training in lip slurs and register slurs. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert F, B flat and E flat. Concert C, A flat and D flat are introduced, but they are used only 4 or 5 times each. There is no training in concert G or D.

Several exercises provide training in scales and the major scales from C through D flat are included on one page. Good training is pro-
vided in chromatics, accidentals and enharmonic tones.

RATING - Good - 3 points

**Conductor's Manual**: This manual contains no fingering charts, fingerings for new notes or explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. A few brief teaching suggestions are given with some of the exercises.

All unison material is written on a single line with the drum part and the piano accompaniment written below. Full band arrangements are written in 4 lines with inadequate indications for instrumentation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**Illustrations and Format**: Each student book is provided with a fingering chart and fingerings are given with all new notes. However, woodwind fingerings are not visual fingerings and are quite small and difficult to read.

All new problems and terms are explained as they are introduced and the common musical terms are listed in the back of the book.

Except for the new fingerings, all notation and printing are large and easy to read.

RATING - Good - 3 points

**Quantity of Material**: Student books are 9"x12" and contain 32 pages. There are 100 exercises of drill material plus 71 melodies. One of these melodies is an individual solo and the last 5 melodies are full band arrangements for program material. In addition, there are 8 lessons or tests in basic theory and 6 scales are listed on one page.

Most of the basic problems are assigned sufficient musical
examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Excellent - 4 points

Consistency of Development: In general, this method progresses moderately and is quite consistent in development throughout. The Melodic Content, however, does not appreciably advance in difficulty.

RATING - Good - 3 points

TOTAL OF RATINGS

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>excellent</td>
<td>4 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POINTS 27
Rhythmic Content: This method presents training in whole notes, half notes, dotted half notes and quarter notes. There is no training in dotted quarter notes, 8th notes, 16th notes or triplet figures.

The basic time signatures of 4/4 and 3/4 are well covered, but there is very little training in Alla Breve time and 2/4 time is used only once. There is no training in 6/8 and 3/8 time.

There is very little training in tied notes and there is no training in syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: The Melodic Content consists of very simple nursery rhymes, folk songs and melodic exercises composed for this method.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Basic Musicianship: This method provides little or no training in Basic Musicianship. A few basic rudiments are listed in the back of the book, but musical terms are not explained or listed.
There is no training in dynamics, tempo or expression, and even though phrasing, slurs and accents are introduced, they are not developed. This is an unison method and provides very little harmonic training.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Suitability to Individual Instruments: Each instrument is provided with a page of preparatory notes which gives each student a chance to learn 5 or 6 fingerings before the class begins on lesson one. The first lessons start all instruments on concert F within the easy limits of their ranges. Brass instruments are started in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the upper register is developed.

One exercise provides training in lip slurs, but this is in the lower register. At no time are the students forced into the difficult ranges of their instruments.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Key Variety: Most of the material is in the key of B flat. The only other key training is in A flat which is used 15 times and F which is used 11 times. There is no page of scales or chromatics and the only scales used are in the 3 keys mentioned above.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains a fingering chart plus the preparatory tones for each instrument. Fingerings for new notes are not given and there are no explanations of problems peculiar to each instrument or any helpful teaching suggestions.
Exercise material is written in semi-open score with a separate line for C, B flat, E flat, F and bass clef instruments and a separate line for percussion. Unison melodies are written on a single line and harmonized melodies are written in closed score with no indications of instrumentation.

RATING - Fair - 2 points

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a good fingering chart and the fingerings for each new note are given at the time the note is introduced.

A few rudiments are explained in the back of the book and the 4 problems which are introduced in the method are explained at the time each problem is introduced. There are no explanations of the common musical terms.

Notation is large and easy to read.

RATING - Good - 3 points

Quantity of Material: Student books are 5 1/2"x7" and contain 36 pages. The material is divided into 113 exercises.

There are sufficient musical examples to master the few problems in rhythmic reading introduced in this book. However, many of the important fundamentals in rhythmic reading, basic musicianship and key training are not even introduced. Therefore, this method does not contain sufficient musical examples to develop the students to an intermediate level.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
Consistency of Development: This method is very slow and inconsistent in development and does not lead from growth to more growth.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

**TOTAL OF RATINGS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor's Manual</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>2 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>3 pts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 14
Rhythmic Reading: The basic note values from the whole note through the 16th note are presented in this method. The quarter rest and the 8th rest are the only 2 rests used in this method. There is very little training in dotted quarter notes, 16th notes and triplet figures and there is no training in dotted 8th notes. There is very little exercise or drill material in any of the rhythmic problems and the dotted quarter note and 8th note are presented in the melodic material without first being introduced in any rhythmic drill.

Most of the material is in 4/4 time. A little training is provided in 3/4, 2/4 and 6/8 time. There are 4 exercises in 3/8 time, 2 exercises in 4/8 time, 2 exercises in Alla Breve time and 1 exercise in 6/4 time.

There is very little training in tied notes or syncopation.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Melodic Content: Most of the Melodic Content consists of melodic exercises which have been assigned a title.

The melodies are so easy that they offer no challenge to the students and foster very little development of musical ability.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
Basic Musicianship: This method gives no explanations of basic rudiments or common musical terms and there is no provision to teach any basic theory.

There is no training in phrasing, dynamics, tempo or expression.
All of the material is written in two and three part harmony.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Suitability to Individual Instruments: This method does not include horn in F in the instrumentation. All instruments are started within the easy limits of their ranges. Brass instruments are started and kept in the lower part of their ranges which may lead to embouchure problems when the middle and upper registers are developed.

This method develops an inadequate and very limited range for all instruments.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Key Variety: Most of the material is in concert B flat and E flat. Concert F is used 14 times and concert A flat is used 10 times. There is no training in concert C, G or D.

This method provides no training in scales or chromatics.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Conductor's Manual: This manual contains no fingering charts, fingerings for new notes or explanations of the problems peculiar to each instrument. A few suggestions on posture, breathing and discipline are given in the front of the manual.

All of the material is written in 2 lines with the piano accompaniment below. The 1st line is for B flat instruments and the 2nd
line is for E flat instruments. There is no part for C instruments, bass instruments or percussion.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Illustrations and Format: Each student book is provided with a fingering chart and fingerings for all new notes. However, new fingerings for woodwinds are indicated by a number which corresponds to the fingerings in the fingering chart.

There are no explanations of basic rudiments, common musical terms or any of the problems which are presented in the material. Notation and printing are small and difficult to read.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Quantity of Material: Student books are 5"x7" and contain 16 pages. There are 86 exercises of which 14 are only 2 measures long, 15 are 4 measures long and 26 are only 8 measures long.

Most of the basic problems in rhythmic reading, key training and basic musicianship are not assigned sufficient musical examples to master the problems involved.

RATING - Poor - 1 point

Consistency of Development: Development is very inconsistent and limited in this method. There is such a limited amount of material that none of the problems presented are thoroughly developed.

RATING - Poor - 1 point
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melodic Content</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Musicianship</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability to Individual Instruments</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Variety</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and Format</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity of Material</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency of Development</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>1 pt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS** 9
CHAPTER IV

SUMMARY

The purpose of this study was to analyze the Beginning Wind Instrument Class Methods available at the time this study was done in the Spring, 1958.

In order to analyze the methods objectively, a standard was established upon which the analyses could be based. The standard was divided into nine separate areas with specific criteria listed for each area.

Each of the nine areas allowed a maximum of 4 points. As each method was analyzed, it was allotted 4 points for excellent, 3 points for good, 2 points for fair, or 1 point for poor according to the extent to which the method met the requirements. Thus, a method which satisfied all criteria in all areas, would receive a total of 36 points.

The analyses revealed that most of the methods were extremely deficient in terms of the criteria used. Of the twenty-two methods analyzed and rated, only five satisfied most of the criteria, and four methods satisfied approximately half the criteria. The remaining thirteen methods were extremely deficient and received a rating of poor in most of the nine areas. The five methods which rated highest received a total rating ranging from 27 points to 34 points.

Table I lists the methods in the respective order of their total points and shows the rating of each area for each method. The total points of all methods in each area are shown at the bottom of the table.

-97-
Thus, using Table I, it is possible to make several general comparisons of the methods.

1. Any or all areas of each method may be compared to the standard.

2. Any or all areas of each method may be compared to any or all of the other methods.

3. The total points of each area may be compared to any or all of the other areas.

Detailed comparisons can be made by referring to any of the above areas as they are illustrated in the analyses.

Each teacher must decide for himself which of the specific areas are of greatest importance and then select the method which serves these areas best.
### TABLE I

Summary of Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating Points</th>
<th>Excellent Rating</th>
<th>Fair Rating</th>
<th>Good Rating</th>
<th>Poor Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 points</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 points</td>
<td>3 points</td>
<td>1 point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 points</td>
<td>Total Points</td>
<td>Possible</td>
<td>For Each Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Rhythmic Content</th>
<th>Melodic Content</th>
<th>Basic Musicianship</th>
<th>Suitability to Individual Instruments</th>
<th>Key Variety</th>
<th>Conductor's Manual</th>
<th>Illustrations and Format</th>
<th>Quantity of Material</th>
<th>Consistency of Development</th>
<th>Total Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Mark Hindsley Band Method</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Basic Method For The</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beginning Band</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boosey and Hawkes Band Method</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy Steps To The Band</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith-Yoder-Bachman Ensemble</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Band Method</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boosey and Hawkes Instrumental</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Band Class Book</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prep - A Beginning Band Method</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Belwin Band Builder</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part I and II</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beginning Band Musicianship</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary Band Course</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guide To The Band</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belwin Elementary Band Method</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern School Band Method</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting The Band</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Adventures In Band</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Steps In Band Playing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play Right Away</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action Band Course</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building The Band</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fillmore Short-Cut Method</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step By Step</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL POINTS IN EACH AREA**

|                      | 41 | 41 | 48 | 44 | 42 | 47 | 60 | 43 | 42 |
BIBLIOGRAPHY


