1983

Relationship between training programs and promotion decisions | The Benue State Civil Service experience

Eugene I. Amaju

The University of Montana

Let us know how access to this document benefits you.

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd

Recommended Citation
Amaju, Eugene I., "Relationship between training programs and promotion decisions | The Benue State Civil Service experience" (1983). Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers. 3389.
https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd/3389

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at ScholarWorks at University of Montana. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at University of Montana. For more information, please contact scholarworks@mso.umt.edu.
COPYRIGHT ACT OF 1976

This is an unpublished manuscript in which copyright subsists. Any further reprinting of its contents must be approved by the author.

Mansfield Library
University of Montana
Date: 1983
THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN TRAINING PROGRAMS
AND PROMOTION DECISIONS: THE BENUE
STATE CIVIL SERVICE EXPERIENCE

by
Eugene I. Amaju
C.A.M., Ahmadu Bello University
Zaria, Nigeria, 1980

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirement
for the degree of
Master of Public Administration
UNIVERSITY OF MONTANA
1983

Approved:
Chairman, Board of Examiners

Dean, Graduate School

Date 5-12-83
VITA

The writer of this paper, a candidate for the degree of Master of Public Administration, is a visitor from Nigeria, West Africa. He obtained his primary school education in Nigeria at Saint John's Primary School, Agyaragu; his post primary education at the Clerical Training School, Otukpo; underwent the Executive Grade (General) course at the Kaduna Polytechnic, Kaduna; attended the Staff Training and Manpower Development course at the Royal Institute of Public Administration (London); participated in the Management Consultancy Course at the University of Pittsburgh. He was enrolled in the Faculty of Public Administration, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria, in 1979 and in June, 1980, he obtained the certificate in Administrative Management.

He was first appointed into the Northern Nigerian Civil Service in 1961 where he served as a clerk from 1961 to 1967. Following the creation of more states by the Federal Military Government of Nigeria in 1967, he was deployed to the Civil Service of Benue-Plateau State where he served as an Executive Officer and then as an Instructor at the Civil Service Training, Jos, from 1968 to 1976. Subsequently, his services were transferred to the Benue State
Civil Service which was created, along with six other States, by the Federal Military Government on February 3, 1976. He acted briefly as the Principal of the Staff Training School, Makurdi from 1976 to 1978. Thereafter, he was appointed the Principal Assistant Secretary responsible for Staff Training and Manpower Development in the Benue State Civil Service from 1979 until 1981 when he was granted leave of absence, by the Benue State Government, to pursue higher studies at the University of Montana, Missoula.

On his return to Nigeria, he plans to continue with his civil service career with the Benue State Civil Service.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION ................................................. 1

I BENUE STATE - GENERAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION. . . 5

Administrative Organization and Personnel
Classification System. ............................ 6

Recruitment. .............................................. 7

II TRAINING IN PRACTICE: RELATIONSHIP TO PROMOTION
DECISIONS. ........................................... 10

Causes of Training needs in the Benue State
Civil Service. ........................................ 10

Selection and Sponsorship. ....................... 17

Training Programs and Promotion Decisions. .. 23

III ANALYSIS OF PROBLEMS: TRAINING PROGRAMS AND
PROMOTION DECISIONS. ............................... 36

Training Programs. ................................. 38

Promotion Policy ................................. 41

CONCLUSIONS AND SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS ........ 47

Specific Recommendations ....................... 48

Suggested Areas of Further Research. ........... 57

APPENDIX: RESEARCH FINDINGS. ....................... 58

BIBLIOGRAPHY ................................................. 67
INTRODUCTION

The Civil Service in Nigeria had its origin in the creation of a machinery by Britain to consolidate her colonial administration in the country. Today, this relatively small colonial service has been transformed into 20—the federal and nineteen states' civil services—indigenous civil services that have more than 700,000 employees. Under the federal constitution of Nigeria, each State of the Federation shall have "powers to make appointments or to exercise disciplinary control over persons" within the civil service of the State. The independent position of the various civil services can therefore be viewed as stemming from Nigeria's Federal character.

The 20 indigenous civil services operate a unified personnel system based on the concept of a unified civil service. To provide for a unified civil service, the

---


Schemes of Service, which contain such matters as recruitment, training and promotion procedures for employees have been introduced for common use in the civil services. Unlike the United States of America, all the States' Civil Services in Nigeria are expected to strictly adhere to the Schemes in the making of personnel decisions.

However, there is a tendency among the Civil Services to differ in the degree of recognition accorded to various training programs in the making of promotion decisions for certain levels of employees. This is true for those employees in the upper ranks of administrative and professional cadres in the Benue State Civil Service. Often, those who subsequently obtain some educational qualifications such as non-degree diploma certificates, or have attended management training programs are not promoted as expected. Since the type of training programs which are desirable in the making of promotion decisions affecting these levels of employees are not explicit or written in the policy that guides their promotion, it creates morale problems as well as other problems such as high turnover.

This paper will examine the various training programs used in promotion decisions in the upper ranks of administrative and professional grades in the civil service of Benue State, Nigeria. The objective is to determine the extent to which training programs have been taken into account in the making of promotion decisions. The ultimate purpose
of the paper is to develop recommendations regarding a promotion policy that would embody the appropriate training programs required for consideration in the making of promotion decisions affecting employees in the upper levels of administrative and professional cadres.

It is recognized that other factors besides training, such as performance evaluation, length of experience and the constitutional need to have regard to the diversity of the peoples within the State, are also relevant to promotion decisions in the Benue State Civil Service. These have not been systematically analyzed in this study.

**Methodology**

Most of the facts on the historical background of Benue State are taken from State Government publications. The organization of its administrative system is based on the work of A. L. Adu. His study of the problem and principles relating to the growth and development of Civil Services in the former British colonial territories of Ghana, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Tanganyika (now Tanzania), Uganda and Kenya is perhaps one of the most detailed.

---

4 *Constitution* [Articles 14(4)], p.16.

The sources for this paper include: (a) the writer's civil service job related experience, (b) pertinent official documents of the Federal and State Governments of Nigeria, (c) the Studies and Reports of Special Commissions and Committees instituted by Nigerian Governments to study specific administrative as well as personnel problems in the public service, (d) the information obtained from personnel journals, and (e) basic administrative concepts, ideas and principles derived from textbooks on public personnel administration.

Organization of This Study

After an introductory chapter which provides the general background of the governmental structure upon which the administrative system of Benue State is based, the paper is divided into three separate but related aspects: (1) description of the training in practice and its relationship to promotion decisions; (2) analysis of the problems with the existing training programs and the existing policy that governs promotion decisions involving the upper ranks of the administrative and professional groups; and (3) conclusion and recommendations.
BENUE STATE - GENERAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION

The Benue State, along with six other States, was created by the Federal Military Government of Nigeria on February 3, 1976. It has an area of 69,740 square kilometers and a population of 3,041,193 (1963 population census). 6

The State is located in the middle of the country and shares common boundaries with six States of the Federation. The Plateau State lies to its north while it is bounded in the south by Anambra and Cross River States. It has a common boundary with Gongola State to the east and with Bendel and Kwara States on the west. Its area represents 1/16 of the total area of the Federation of Nigeria and its population 1/18 of the entire population of Nigeria. 7

There are 5 major tribal or ethnic groups in the State, each with its own distinct language or dialect. As might be expected, in the absence of a universally spoken

7 Ibid.
indigenous language group, English has become the lingua franca and an official language of the State as it is indeed in Nigeria. The largest ethnic groups, numerically speaking, are the Tiv, followed by the Igala and Idoma, in that order.

Administrative Organization and Personnel Classification System

The pattern of administrative system in Benue State provides that the activities of the government are carried out by Ministries. Operationally, the Ministry is composed of four groups of employees, namely, administrative, the executive, the clerical, the professional and technical groups. The grouping is based on the type of work and the level of responsibility involved, and the group at which an applicant enters is contingent upon his educational background. Therefore, the rank inheres in the person rather than in the office he holds.

There are altogether seventeen levels within the unified civil service of Nigeria from which each member of the four groups derives his position. Each grade level has a salary range with a number of steps.

This classification into seventeen positions and salary schemes was designed to solve conditions of . . . utter confusion, great waste and excessive political and personal favoritism in determining the duties and pay of public employees. There were no standard job
titles or descriptions and scores of different jobs were given the same titles. The same jobs might have different titles and pay rates. Pay had only sketchy relations to work actually performed.

Recruitment

The Civil Service of Benue State comprises all posts—established and unestablished—on the government payroll. The most recently available figure of the staff of the State government shows a total of some 27,638 employees in public employment.

The powers of appointment into these posts are shared between the Governor and the Civil Service Commission. The Governor has the constitutional responsibility to appoint to the posts of permanent secretaries, judges of high courts, members of the Civil Service Commission, directors and heads of agencies.

8 A detailed position classification description in the Nigerian Civil Services has been published in the Main Report of the Udoji Civil Service Review Commission (Lagos: Federal Ministry of Information, Printing Division, 1974).

9 Established posts are defined by the Benue State Civil Service Rules 03 (vii) as posts provided for under the personal emoluments sub-head of the estimate. Unestablished posts, under the same rule, means posts provided for in any open or one line vote, e.g., "labour" under which unspecified number of daily paid employees are engaged.

10 B.A. Agada, Half yearly return on number of civil servants in employment of Benue State Government as at July to December, 1981 (Makurdi: Civil Service Secretariat, 1982), p. 3.

11 Constitution, p. 70.
These powers may be delegated to any subordinate official in the State, e.g., the Head of Civil Service, the Civil Service Commission, who exercise such delegated authority on his behalf.

The Civil Service Commission makes appointments into posts in grade level 01 to 15 other than those for which the Governor is constitutionally responsible. In addition, the Commission is responsible for transfers of employees from one cadre to another, confirmation of appointments, promotions, disciplinary control, secondments, petitions and termination of probationary period.

The Commission is empowered to delegate its authority to any officer in the Public Service of the State. Consequently, the Commission has delegated its powers of appointment to Permanent Secretaries and Heads of non-Ministerial Departments in respect of daily paid workers and junior employees.

There is a double channel of entry to all established posts in the Civil Service: (1) direct entry, or "lateral transfers," and (2) promotion from/to lower grades. The minimum age for direct appointment to the various established posts is 16 years. Candidates of Benue State origin are appointed to the civil service on pensionable terms. Contract appointments are offered to overseas officers.
These appointments may be extended to retired indigenous officers who ask for it and are accepted only where their services are, by their very specialist or professional qualifications, urgently required and cannot otherwise be secured. All new appointments into pensionable posts must serve a probation period of two years before they are confirmed.
II

TRAINING IN PRACTICE: RELATIONSHIP TO PROMOTION DECISIONS

The contents of this part are divided into three sections. The first section shows the various reasons that have caused the Benue State Civil Service to embark on intensive training programs for its employees. Section two describes the methods used to select employees for training and the type of sponsorship that can be granted to them. This section is an indispensable background to section three as the promotion of employees after training is determined by the nature of selection and the type of sponsorship granted them. Section three is divided into three sub-sections, each dealing with a separate training program. The relationship of each program to promotion decision is traced in each sub-section.

Causes of Training Needs in the Benue State Civil Service

There is an ardent desire among professional officers, for example, accountants, education officers, and administrative officers on grade level 12, in Benue State Civil Service, to aspire to top administrative (Permanent
Secretaries) and to top professional positions (Accountant-General). This desire has provided the impetus with which these officers, individually, seek to attend various causes. These courses include: (1) university degree courses which are designed and run overseas and in Nigeria for qualified senior officers leading to Bachelor's, Master's, and Doctoral degree qualifications. (2) university non-degree courses which are designed and run overseas and in Nigeria for qualified officers leading to certificates in public administration, diploma in public administration, diploma in management studies, and (3) Management Training programs. These training programs are classified into: (a) Top Management Program (TMP) designed in 1977, in collaboration with the Royal Institute of Public Administration (RIPA) London and the University of Pittsburgh, U.S.A., for top-level administrators on salary grade level 16 and 17 in the Federal and States' public service, the aim of which is to inculcate appreciation of management problems in the top echelon, (b) The advanced management courses are designed to assist senior officers on grade level 12 and 13 in determining objectives and monitoring progress towards them, in managing the human resources in their organizations more objectively, and improving their capacity to employ modern management skills and techniques in a public sector setting. The course is in two parts. The first part, a two-week
orientation program, takes place in Nigeria and focuses attention on public policy management in Nigeria, human resources management and open-reporting system. The second part extends over a period of ten weeks and takes place either at the University of Pittsburgh, U.S.A., or at the Royal Institute of Public Administration, London. The current arrangement was phased out in July, 1978 when the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria (ASCON) Badagary took over completely all management programs: (c) Projects Management Training. The first workshop on project management training was under the auspices of CAFRAD (African Training and Research Centre in Administration for Development) conducted at University of Ife from January 23-27, 1978 with 24 officers handling development projects all over the federation particularly projects in the rural areas. The experience of the first course proved very valuable as a formative process in the design of subsequent courses: (d) Induction course for administrative and professional officers in the civil service to orient them and give them an insight into the various aspects of their duties; and (e) Management Seminar for Department Training Officers. The seminar is organized with resources personnel from CAFRAD. The purpose of the workshop is to broaden participants' knowledge of their functions and roles in training administration in the civil services of the country. The significance
of the workshop lies in the fact that participants are an assemblage of highly experienced professional trainers drawn from all the civil services of the Federation. The workshop provides a forum for an enlightened discussion on various problems relating to training and the sharing of ideas and experiences.

Most employees on grade level 12 who are selected into any of the programs so far enumerated look on such courses as the means through which their chances for promotion to grade level 13—the bottom rung of upper levels of administrative and professional cadres—are increased. Such expectations are largely based on the various recommendations of the Udoji Review Commission which have been accepted by the Federal Government and to which all the State Governments have subscribed. The Federal Government, in recognizing the need for improved performance and the need to accelerate employee advancement to senior management positions declared that:

Efforts now being made will be intensified to ensure that the best available management talents within the service are afforded appropriate opportunity to develop and regardless of previous career, to aspire to top positions.

12 The concept of senior management position is defined in the Government Views on the Report of the Public Service Review Panel (Williams and Williams Report, p. 5), as employees occupying posts in salary grade level 13 and above.
posts of Permanent Secretary. As a matter of fact, the concept is in line with the current practices in the Federal and State Civil Services where senior officers drawn from different cadres and occupational groups are exposed to the same management training to prepare and equip them for top management positions later in their careers. The Government notes the Review Commission's suggestions that entry into the senior management group be on the basis of selection and successful completion of a senior management training.\textsuperscript{13}

In addition, the Udoji Civil Service Review Commission further propagated the new style Public Service for which the report contended that the Governments of the Federation (Federal and States) should embark on large-scale training programs considered essential to meet the needs of the result-oriented service. The Federal Government pledged its commitment to the proposal and declared that:

\begin{quote}
. . . . the needed change can only be brought about by well-designed and well-implemented staff training programs.\textsuperscript{14}
\end{quote}


\textsuperscript{14} Ibid., p. 3.
The significance of the need for staff training in Benue State Civil Service can be seen from the Nigerian Government's acceptance of a new style of result-oriented Public Service recommended by the Udoji Public Service Review Commission. The Commission had observed that the majority constraint to the development in the country was the lack of skilled and experienced men and women to carry out the required task. It emphasized improved personnel management to get, develop and deploy the manpower needed to get the job done, as well as planned systematic training as a vital means of meeting manpower shortages in all the civil services of the country. It can be argued that the massive training of employees to meet the manpower needs required for socio-economic development has not resulted to any direct benefit to the majority of the citizens who do not have the opportunity for such a training. The present training of Benue State employees by the University of Kansas in key agricultural areas in irrigation, seed multiplication, farm mechanization, etc., is to meet the demand imposed by the Nigeria's Green Revolution program. Undoubtedly, the desired result of the training scheme is to man those key agricultural areas that are aids to increased food production for the Nigeria's teeming population. Today, the agricultural activities of those trained under the scheme have not resulted to the desired increase in food production
in the State. The benefit derived from, and the amount of money spent on, the training of such employees are still in the main confined to a few. Accordingly, there is need to keep the cost of training down because benefits are not spread widely to the society.

The Commission noted that not everything can be learned in a work situation. There is an important role for institution-based training. But this must link to and support work-centered training. This means re-designing both the curricula and the methodology to ensure their relevance. For example, more sandwich-type courses will be needed in balancing classroom training in theory with work-site training in practice. This approach would apply to senior and middle management training as well as to technicians, operators, craftsmen, clerks and the like. The Commission further recommended that emphasis in this regard should, as far as possible be placed on management development training which is very crucial to the success of an organization since managers have the ultimate responsibility for meeting the "objectives" of the organization. This emphasis has removed the conduct of training from a departmental responsibility to a centralized personnel function. Today, the training function in the Benue State Civil Service is lodged with the Office of the Head of Civil Service. The advantage of this is that more attention is now being paid to research
methods necessary to identify a training need with a view to determining the training required to meet specific organizational objectives.

**Selection and Sponsorship**

Since the inception of Benue State in 1976, the State Civil Service has provided university-based courses as well as management training to 857 employees of various grades (01-17) in the service.\(^{15}\) Of this number, 450 employees received a combined top, advanced, middle and supervisory management trainings of varying duration (2 weeks to 9 months) 210 were trained on non-degree certificate and diploma courses; 150 got university degrees in various disciplines. The figures indicate that attention is being paid to management training by the Benue State Civil Service.

**Selection**

Every year, the Benue State Civil Service selects about 100 employees for training on various courses. The number is not fixed and may vary depending on the budget situation and the pressing need for employee training in any one particular year. In 1981, 125 employees in the State Civil Service were sent on various training programs. The increase, as compared to the 100 employees trained in 1980,

was necessitated by the creation of two Ministries—the Ministry of Rural Development and that of the Water and Electricity—which needed to be manned by qualified and competent staff.

There are a number of safeguards that are provided in making selection of employees into training programs. First, the course must be relevant to the needs of the Service. Second, the officer must have all the basic necessary qualifications relevant for admission to the institution of his/her choice, to enable him/her to pursue the course and complete it successfully within the given time. Third, officers who had performed very well on previous courses or who consistently showed competence and diligence in performance of duties are given preference. In other words, hard work and ability are rewarded. Undoubtedly, fairness in determining "ability and hardwork" depends on the use of a performance evaluation system. This system requires that there are pre-determined assignments agreed to between an officer and his supervisor. The successful completion of such assignments within a given time would then adjudge the officer as "competent and hardworking." The advantages derived from the use of this type of performance evaluation system in determining a productive employee far

---

outweighs the use of Annual Confidential Report System, currently in use in the Benue State, which focuses more on employee personality traits with less emphasis on the employees' job performance. Hence the need to replace the existing Annual Confidential Report with the Performance Evaluation System was called for by the Udoji Civil Service Review Commission.\textsuperscript{17} To this, the Governments in Nigeria (Federal and States) agreed that:

\begin{quote}
there is need to modify the existing Annual Confidential Report so that it is possible to assess performance on the basis of quantifiable targets. Accordingly, the Performance Evaluation System should be introduced.\textsuperscript{18}
\end{quote}

But the absence of the Performance Evaluation System in Benue State Civil Service has rendered "competence in performance of duties" hard to determine and, therefore, has become an arbitrary yard-stick for the purpose of selecting employees for training.

On the other hand, by relying on "hard work," among other things, as a yard stick for selection, the safeguards have failed to consider the need to enable the employee to meet the needs of the service, when assessing requests for training. The implications are that employees have been selected for training, not on the basis of the need to meet


\textsuperscript{18}Ibid., p.8.
their current job performance and future potential job duties. Rather, selection was determined in preference to the employee who has not "performed well" but who logically requires training to meet the expected performance standard! Consequently, the use of "hard work" and other safeguards—confirmation of appointment, admission into institution of the employees choice, good performance on a previous course—as a yard stick for selection would indeed lead to misuse of resources since such courses are perhaps less needed to improve the employee's performance to the benefit of the service.

Selection for promotion of professional and administrative officers on grade level 12, in Benue State Civil Service, begins with selection for training. Officers who are sponsored on degree programs are promoted, under normal circumstances, after successfully completing such programs. For this reason, the Benue State Civil Service is meticulous in selecting officers on grade level 12 for further training. Before selections are made, service records of employees are examined, by selecting officers, for details such as previous conduct and performance. Officers who reveal substantial defects in their conduct are often not selected for further training. The objective is to ensure that officers selected possess the desired qualities of behavior expected in those high level positions to which they
will likely be considered for promotion after their various training. Other conditions that are given critical consideration in selecting employees for various courses include: (1) such employees must be on permanent and pensionable appointments, and (2) employees must have had their permanent and pensionable appointments confirmed. The objective is to ensure that only bona fide staff committed to career in the civil service receive government support.

**Sponsorship**

The largest amount of allocation for any single recurrent item in the Benue State Budget is spent each year on employee training programs.\(^{19}\) For instance, in 1981 fiscal year, N1,696,000 was voted for training.\(^{20}\) Overseas courses take the highest toll, averaging N20,000 per year to train an employee, while the cost for training an employee in a Nigerian University is N2,000 (One Naira (N) = US dollar $1.40).

To ensure that officers undertake their courses with the ease of mind required in a learning situation, the government provides sponsorship to those who secure admission into various training programs. Sponsorship is granted

---


\(^{20}\) Ibid.
on the basis of the following principles:

. . . it must be made absolutely clear that the maximum period for in-service training is two years. No extension will be granted. Courses that are likely to last for more than two years must not be on in-service. They may have to be on scholarships.

Therefore, sponsorship to employees for course is provided in two ways. The scheme for in-service award and that for the State open scholarship. The in-service scheme requires that the Government bear all the expenses of the course including payment of the employee's salary. This has the tendency to reduce the number of employees that would benefit from training programs. The scheme is administered by the Office of the Head of Civil Service, Makurdi, which also controls all aspects of employee training in the entire civil service of Benue State. Officers granted in-service award must be bonded for a specified period. For instance, for courses lasting for a period of one year, a two year bond was brought into effect. The bond provides that the employee sponsored on a course returns to the Civil Service of the Government on completion of his course. In the event of the trainee failing to return, he is required to pay to the Government as liquidated damages, the equivalent in money of such sum expended by the Government on the course.

---

which he has attended. Cases of infringement of this agreement are not common among employees.

The scholarship scheme is administered by a Board whose membership is appointed by the Governor of the State for a term of three years. The responsibility of the Board concerns manpower training in the entire economy of the State. Therefore, the scholarship scheme is available to all the citizens of the State—employees of the Government as well as non-employees. The Benue State Scholarship Board has been very active in ensuring that all citizens of the State who secure admissions into various courses are provided with sponsorship.

Employees who benefit from scholarships awards are not obligated to return to their civil service jobs after their training. This means that they are obliged to seek for employment in an organization of their choice. But many have often preferred to return because of the assured tenure in the civil service career.

Training Programs and Promotion Decisions

All training programs generally are not given sufficient consideration in promotion decisions, under normal conditions. Where such courses are considered in promotion

---

decisions, successful employees are granted promotion on the basis of marks or grade achieved at the end of the course. Unsuccessful employees at the course revert to the original posts which they held prior to their nomination. In most cases they are denied immediate opportunity for further training.

Recommendation for promotion of successful employees after a course generally emanate from the Head of Department and are sent to the Civil Service Commission who makes the final decision. The Civil Service Commission rarely differ from the recommendation submitted by the Head of Department. But there are instances when the Commission can use its judgment to discharge the obligation imposed upon it by the constitution.

University degrees and promotion

These courses cover a wide range of disciplines such as medicine, law, liberal arts, engineering, etc., leading to the award of Bachelor's, Master's, and Doctoral degree qualifications. The courses are available to civil servants who are required to advance to top administrative and professional positions calling for acquaintance with a broad body of knowledge. Degree courses are very popular with employees who perceive the courses as offering the best opportunity for promotion advancement in their various cadres.
Selection for degree course from among non-graduate officers on grade level 12, is made often with a view to promotion of the employee concerned after his/her successful completion of the degree course. In 1980, five professional officers in the Ministry of Education, Makurdi, were promoted to various grades, ranging from grade level 13 to 15 after successfully completing their degree programs at the Ahmadu Bello University in Zaria. Prior to their proceeding to the university, their basic qualification was the Nigerian Certificate in Education (NCE)—a non-degree qualification.

There is an "unwritten" condition in the Ministry, which also has been widely recognized by all employees in the Ministry, that non-degree holders desiring promotion beyond grade level 12 must seek to obtain a university degree. Not only is lack of a university degree a barrier for promotion to grade level 13, it is also an obstacle for those non-graduate employees who make it to grade level 13 but must now compete with graduate officers for posts in the higher grade levels.

The frequently observed problems regarding admissions of non-degree holders into degree programs of Nigerian universities need be recognized. There is a growing tendency in Nigerian universities to model every aspect of

---

23 The information cited here was obtained from Mr. D. D. Agbara, a Principal Assistant Secretary in the Ministry of Education, Makurdi, on August 16, 1982.
entry qualifications into degree programs after that of British. For instance, entry qualifications for a bachelor degree requires the possession of an advanced level general certificate of education in not less than two subjects while entry into a Master's degree program in Great Britain requires the prior possession of a Bachelor's degree. The educational qualification held by non-graduate employees on grade level 12 are usually non-degree certificate and non-degree diploma in particular specialization. Officers who obtained "credit pass or distinction" at the end of a non-degree diploma/certificate course are accepted for master's degree program in Nigerian universities. From the writer's experience, however, some capable officers who obtained a "pass" at such non-degree diploma/certificate courses but with potential for Permanent Secretary have not had the same opportunities with graduates or those possessing "credit" non-degree certificates to enter into master's degree programs. This is because British standards, procedures and qualifications are stressed, and they have become the established models for entry into Nigerian universities. Advertisement for Nigerian universities' Bachelor's and Master's degree courses place undue emphasis on the British standard qualification for entry into such programs. This has increased the difficulties for accepting a large number of non-graduate government employees, whose only qualifica-
tions (a "pass" non-degree certificate) as noted earlier, fall short of meeting the universities' entry requirements into degree programs. Viewed from this point, it is difficult to expect that Nigerian universities would train a substantial number of government employees and produce the needed staff at the rate and expertise desired to meet the increasing government activities.

University non-degree courses and promotion

The Benue State Civil Service utilizes a number of non-degree courses for the training of her professional and administrative staff. These programs include: (1) Diploma in Public Administration run by various universities and the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria, (2) the various stages of Diploma in Local Government Studies organized by the Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, (3) Diploma in Management Studies and the Professional Grade Accountancy courses run at the Kaduna Polytechnic. The objective for these course is to provide employees with the skills required for organizational effectiveness, and where necessary, for the promotion of the employee in the cadre concerned.

With the exception of officers on grade 01 to 10, non-degree certificate courses are sparingly used as a basis for promoting an employee on grade level 12 to senior management positions. As an example, the advancement of a
Higher Executive Officer (a grade level 08 post) to Senior Executive Officer (a grade 09 post) is determined by the following promotion policy statement:

By promotion of a confirmed and suitable Higher Executive Officer.

By direct appointment or promotion of a candidate possessing . . . Diploma in Business Studies from a recognized institution. 24

By this statement, Higher Executive Officers who attended and obtained the Diploma in Business Studies are eligible for promotion to the next grade.

For officers on grade level 12, the policy that determines their advancement states as follows:

By promotion of a confirmed and suitable . . . officer. 25

The educational qualifications relevant for consideration in the promotion of the employee beyond grade level 12 has not been specifically stated in the above policy statement that determines promotions at that level. Since the policy statement has failed to lay down the ground work for a decision, individual decision makers treat training programs differently in making promotion decision involving even employees within the same grade level 12.

The major promotion decisions involving those professional and administrative officers who possess no university degrees are summarized in the following categories:

1. Administrative officers. In November of 1980, a number of non-graduate administrative officers on grade level 12, were nominated for the Diploma in Public Administration at the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria, Badagary. This plan had no relationship to the need to provide the officers with the required qualifications essential to enhance their future advancement. The officers were holders of Diplomas and Certificates in Public Administration. This plan met with stiff opposition from the affected staff. Much of their argument was based on the fact that they were already in possession of an equivalent qualification (some had diploma in Public Administration, others with the certificates in Public Administration). Furthermore, their argument was conditioned by the perception which they hold that their current educational qualifications have doubtful linkage to promotion decisions involving advancement to senior management positions.

An examination of the record of the administrative officers on grade level 13—a senior management position—to which officers on grade level 12 aspire to be promoted, provided an interesting revelation. In 1981, there was an establishment in the estimate for 18 administrative officers
on grade level 13.\textsuperscript{26} Thirteen of these posts were filled, out of which 11 were held by officers with first or second university degrees, the remaining 2 positions went to those who were in possession of certificates/diplomas. This is an indication of more senior management positions going to those with university degrees.

Of the seven positions that were filled in grade level 12, four were held by officers with diploma/certificates, while the remaining 3 positions were occupied by officers with university degrees. This suggests that positions in grade level 12, which are posts immediately below the senior management positions, were dominated by non-graduate administrative officers.

2. Professional officers (Accountants). The accountants in the civil service of Benue State are exposed to non-graduate courses at the University of Strathclyde in the United Kingdom. The course is essentially a certificate course in accountancy. Those selected for these courses are largely from non-graduate accountants. A B.S. (Accountancy) and/or an ACCA (Association of Chartered and Corporate Accountants) are regarded as graduate qualification for the

\textsuperscript{26}Benue State, Administrative Officers' Seniority List as at June, 1982 (Makurdi: Civil Service Secretariat, Administration Department, 1982), p. 1.
Accountants. Completion of the program at the University of Strathclyde is not usually regarded as a condition for promotion to higher posts within the accountant cadre. Rather, it is generally regarded as a skill improvement course for the accountants.

Nevertheless, attendance at such a course was given an important consideration in promotion decisions in later stages of the employee's career. For instance, attendance at the course was used to resolve a case in which two candidates of equal ability in performance of duties, but with varying educational background, have to vie for one position in the senior management group. But such cases rarely occur.

The case of promotions involving accountants who had to vie for one position points to a substantial issue in policy decision highlighted earlier in this paper. Whereas education officers were considered for advancement past grade level 12 on the basis of obtaining a university degree, the Accountants on the other hand who are required to progress beyond grade level 12 are considered on the basis of a non-graduate certificate.

Management Training and Promotion

The Benue State Civil Service participates on various management development programs so as to put into
effect the declared policy of the Federal Government on management training earlier explained in this paper. The programs are run principally by the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria. In one instance, the Benue State Civil Service had contracted out one management training program to the Nigerian Institute of Management, Lagos. This was in November, 1980. Twenty officers from Ministries and Departments attended the course.

A senior management program, if not specifically designated, is attended by both professional and administrative officers. Where such courses are specifically designated, one is always designed for the professional officers and another for the administrative officers. Two such separate management programs were organized for the professional and administrative officers respectively in 1980 at the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria. Two accountants and four administrative officers on grade level 12 took part on these programs. As of today in the Benue State Civil Service, not many officers on grade level 12 are enthusiastic about management training programs. Part of this attitude is conditioned by the belief that the program is irrelevant to promotion decisions involving their advancement to higher posts.

In November of 1981, twenty-five professional and administrative officers benefited from a joint management
training program organized by the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria and the Executive Training Program in Washington, D.C. Twenty of the course participants were High Court Judges, Permanent Secretaries and other top professional officers. The remaining five were officers drawn from grade level 13. No officer on grade level 12 was at this time selected to participate on any of the programs. But, as indicated by the statement of the Federal Government on management training program, the intention of the program is to serve as a means through which senior officers on grade level 12 can aspire to senior management positions. In actual practice, this program has not been recognized in promotion decisions in the manner desired by the policy statement of the Federal Government. Obviously, management training for employees on grade level 12 appears to be of limited value for promotion in Benue State Civil Service when compared with the Federal Government statement which requires that the program be used to advance employees into senior management positions. There is the general assumption in the Benue State Civil Service today that the top administrative positions must be occupied by the "best" administrators, who have had general liberal education. This assumption seems only to follow the lead of the British Civil

\[27\text{Ibid., p. 27-37.}\]
Service as expressed in the words of Lord Haldane stating in the hearings before a Royal Commission on the British Civil Service:

"... we will still consider it worth while for our administrators to know their Aristotle and Plato."

Undoubtedly, after 20 years of Nigeria's independence, the past colonial tie with the British Civil Service still lingers in most Nigeria's bureaucratic thinking. The result is that the cream of non-graduate employees with a reservoir of knowledge and diversified experience built over years of related job experience have found it increasingly difficult to compete for top level positions where there is a strong preference for university degrees. Psychologically, they (non-graduates) are a misfit and consequently have been forced into early retirement! The danger is that the service is replete with leadership made up of "inexperienced" but "university" educated elite, some of whom possess questionable administrative competence in the positions they hold.

It is equally true that survival on the job which leads to years of job related experience provides no assurance that the employee possess the competence for top managerial positions. Therefore, it is the competence to

---

28 Staff Development, Training and Organizational Analysis, Institute of Training and Organization Development, University of Pittsburgh, op. cit., p. 6.
perform in a given position that should determine who occupies that position. In other words, a non-degree certificate is as good as a university degree so long as both holders possess proven ability to perform on that job.
III

ANALYSIS OF PROBLEMS: TRAINING PROGRAMS AND PROMOTION DECISIONS

The establishment of training programs in the Benue State Civil Service is a direct consequence of the training needs identified by the Udoji Civil Service Review Commission. In addition, the Benue State Civil Service has intensified training programs as a means of providing up-to-date skills that are particularly important in a growing civil service.

The impact which these training programs—university courses, management training—have produced in the making of promotion decisions have highlighted a number of complexities. Furthermore, areas of concern and controversy still remain with regard to the training process—training needs, training facilities—and the nature of promotion policy which produces promotion decisions. The lack of connection between training programs and promotion decisions earlier identified in some specific programs—non-degree certificates and management training—assumes added importance when viewed as a problem which could re-occur. For these reasons, it appears useful to examine those problems
inherent in both the training process and the nature of promotion policy.

Before appraising the problems of the training programs and promotion decisions, it is useful to present the bright aspects produced by: (1) training programs undertaken thus far, and (2) the outcome of promotion policy which produces promotion decisions in the civil service of Benue State.

1. Training programs. First, a substantial number of employees in the State Civil Service, who otherwise would not have had the benefit of university education, have been trained under the State's liberal in-service scheme. Through the various training programs, an employee who had been recruited into the service with an initial qualification of a primary leaving certificate (grade school in the United States of America) can now hope to advance to the highest post in the service. Second, as the rapidly expanding service resulting from economic and social developments proceed, new departments are created to cope with the expanding activities of the Government. The manpower output from Nigerian educational institutions has failed to keep pace with the rate of expanding establishments, and as such it proved extremely difficult to man the services fully from the scarce resources of Nigeria. Hence, the Benue State Civil Service has built into its personnel system, a well-developed training scheme to cope
with the shortage of manpower and ensure the continued expansion of government activities.

2. **Promotion policy.** First, the maintenance of double channel of entry which provides for promotion from within and outside, is a commendable one. This has given deserving personnel in the Civil Service an opportunity to rise to key policy making posts. Also, the recruitment of candidates from outside means an influx of persons with outside experience into the service. Second, the appointment of overseas personnel as well as retired officers on contract, has widened a field of promotional opportunity for the indigenous staff as the non-Nigerian and retired employees can leave the service when their terms of contract expire. Now, let us examine the other side of the coin.

**Training Programs**

As noted earlier in this paper, a considerable number of training programs are made available to the Benue State Civil Service each year by various institutions in the country. Notably, the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria has played a significant role in meeting the manpower development needs of the State Civil Service. The major training areas in which the college has provided programs include Senior Management and the Diploma in Public Administration.
Each year, the institution makes available to the State civil service a substantial number of courses in various fields to cover all classes of employees. Selection for these courses is then based on the type of program on which the state wishes to take part.

Identification of training needs

Although the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria is established principally to serve as a center for staff development for the high level officials of the civil services in the country, but most of the programs are often concerned with the general needs in the economy. This includes the needs of the private sector. Consequently, the specific needs of the individual States must be assessed by the State concerned and on that basis determine the relevance of programs passed to it by the institutions. But the process of identifying and establishing training needs in the Benue State Civil Service lacks a well-developed pattern. This process should involve: (a) observation of such signs as slow service, lack of movement of personnel in terms of promotion, poor morale, lack of coordination, and the like, and (b) classify these signs first of all as to the objects of the training; such as, to increase present employees' effectiveness, prepare them for advancement, give new employees general orientation and preparation for specific job duties.
Training program announcements received in the State are circulated to Ministries and Departments for nomination. In practice, nomination for courses are based on assumed training needs, as such needs have not been specifically written in a formal training document required to guide selection and to determine the suitability of a particular training program. The absence of written training needs for the civil service has meant that training programs on which employees take part are often unrelated to their jobs and the needs of the service.

Whatever the method of selection, it is usually unwise for training officers to proceed with specific training programs until the need for it is recognized. In a small organization, the development of training need can be done through observation of the work performed without any formal analysis. But in large organizations, such as Civil Service, the need is brought more sharply into focus if a little time is spent on the survey of the problem which are then written into a training need document and entrenched as a guiding document in all aspects of selection. Unplanned, unstructured training results in job behaviors that may or may not contribute to organizational goals. Formal training process on the other hand, can be managed so that the resulting job behaviors support these goals.
Promotion Policy

The promotion policies which guides promotion decisions applicable to employees on grade level 12 in Benue State Civil Service are derived from the policies designed by the National Council on Establishments. The Council was established in 1957, primarily as a body charged with the responsibility of ensuring that a common service condition for employees was applied in all the four Regional Public Services at that time. The objective had been to cut down the problem of migration of employees from one civil service to another, which was prevalent prior to the establishment of the Council, particularly where conditions of one service was better than others. The Council is composed of a Chairman, who is also the Vice-President of Nigeria, and representatives from the nineteen States Civil Services. The Council provides a scheme of service which guides all the State Civil Services in personnel policy decisions.

The scheme outlines the plans which shows how entry to a particular cadre in the civil service is made. It also outlines the training facilities provided after entry, and the method by which and the posts to which an officer may obtain promotion at various defined stages in his career. The scheme thus provides a clear understanding of the recruitment, staffing and training nature of the various posts in the cadre. Through it employees are clearly informed of
the posts to which they can aspire. For some groups of employees, the provision in the scheme as regards to their future advancement/promotion is clear to the understanding of all the employees within the affected group. For instance, an administrative officer VII (State) who is to be promoted to administrative officer VI has the following provision in the scheme guiding such promotion:

3.2.1. By promotion of a confirmed and suitable administrative officer, grade VIII (Federal) or Grade VII (State).

3.2.2. By lateral transfer of a confirmed and suitable . . . officer who has satisfied the required selection process.

3.2.3. By direct appointment of a candidate possessing a degree from a recognized university plus at least three years of post-qualification cognate experience.

Here, the criteria that must be considered in making promotion decisions for this level of employees have been established and made specific. In this way, the staff know what aspects of the policy to take advantage of to advance themselves. But as the employees move up the career ladder, the policy that determines their future advancement/promotion becomes riddled with lack of clarity. For instance, the promotion of an administrative officer on grade level 12 to grade level 13 is determined by an eight-worded policy statement.

---

29 Scheme of Service, p. 30.
By promotion of a confirmed and suitable officer.\textsuperscript{30}

Such a statement not only is unclear, but in addition has failed to establish a series of criteria that need be considered in the making of promotion decisions that involve employees at that level. As explained earlier, the advancement of the non-graduate education officers was based on their acquisition of a university degree. On the other extreme, non-graduate certificate courses were considered for the advancement of Accountants, both of whom (accountants and education officers) are within the professional group on grade level 12. Additionally, graduate administrative officers were found to have occupied the posts in grade level 13 more than the number of non-graduate employees. Thus uncertainty as regards the type of educational qualification that is best considered as essential before an employee on grade level 12 can be advanced/promoted to grade level 13, continues to surround those employees on grade level 12.

Furthermore, different types of management training programs earlier enumerated cannot all be considered as relevant programs that can be used in the making of promotion decision to senior management based on the Federal Government statement on management training. What, for instance, prevents an officer who has attended a two-week

\textsuperscript{30} Ibid., p. 31.
management course to aspire to promotion to senior management position? By the same token, can an officer who has attended a nine-month management course be advanced to senior management position? This is a matter that requires serious consideration and needs to be resolved if a management training program, or any general training for that matter, can meaningfully be related to a promotion decision for high level employees.

It is in the best interest of the civil service that the policy guiding promotion decisions be made clear particularly for officers on grade level 12 who must advance to grade level 13—a senior management position—as a starting point for possible selection for the top post of Permanent Secretary. Lack of clear promotion policy for these level of officers has caused promotion decisions to shift back and forth in several directions, among which are:

1. **Ethnicity.** As explained earlier, there are at least five tribal groups in Benue State, three of which (Tiv, Idoma, and Igala) constitute the biggest tribes. Tribal loyalty is a competing force in Benue State. Schwartz notes that "if a chap did not look after one's own people (Tribe) who else would."\(^{31}\) For instance, State "A" may employ other Nigerians from State "B" to fill job

openings (doctors, engineers, and the like) for which no indigenous of State "A" is readily available to fill. By this employment, State "A" has also demonstrated his tacit consent of non-discrimination against the employment of other Nigerians. From the writer's experience, as soon as educated employees of State "A" origin emerge, they are promoted to posts for which the indigenous of State "B" with identical qualification would not have been considered suitable. Tribal interests tend to overshadow the Service interest to the extent that there is a constant attempt in key personnel decisions to balance tribal representation in high level administrative and professional posts.

Undoubtedly, this is in keeping with the Federal character clause in the Constitution which provides that:

The composition of the Government of a State, a local government council, or any of the agencies of such government or council, and the conduct of the affairs of the government or council or such agencies shall be carried out in such manner as to recognize the diversity of the people within its area of authority and the need to promote a sense of belonging and loyalty among all the peoples of the Federation.\(^\text{32}\)

We may well be reminded that inter-tribal rivalries have often proved a factor to be reckoned with in all phases of our public life. Those who hold responsible positions in the Government do their best to see that people from their own tribal groups are promoted in an increasing number to

\(^{32}\text{Constitution, (Articles 14[4]), p. 16.}\)
top level positions even if such promotions means over­
looking the standard requirements for it. This may lead to
putting wrong people in certain positions. Hence, the ser­
vice runs the danger of becoming the preserve of a specially
privileged tribal group.

2. Experience. In theory, the Benue State Civil
service has endorsed the principle that promotions must be
based on merit, ability, seniority and official qualifica­
tions without regard to race. But in practice the seniority
factor in the promotion of employees especially those in the
lower rank seems to outweigh all other considerations. It
is clear that too great emphasis on seniority negates the
whole principle of promotion on the basis of merit. To ap­
ply this principle indiscriminately provides a favorable
ground for mediocrity and discourages ability and initia­
tive. Its rigid application means that chances of advance­
ment of competent employees are blocked by old-timers.
CONCLUSIONS AND SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS

In the Benue State Civil Service, educational qualifications obtained through various in-service training programs are a key to employees' promotion to senior management positions. This is in keeping with the objectives of training outlined in the various Federal Government statements on employee training and manpower development. The existence of the non-degree training programs have not changed the strong bias to university degree in promotion decisions to high level positions. At the present time, the civil service faces a situation where there is an apparent weakness in giving consideration to training programs--general management, non-degree diplomas and certificates--in the making of promotion decisions involving the upper levels of administrative and professional employees. This is because of the failure of the system to embody essential training programs required in the existing promotion policy.

The need for training in the Benue State civil service has increased more in the present decade than at any previous time. As the rapidly expanding service resulting from economic and social service proceed, new departments are created to cope with the expanding activities. Hence,
the need for more trained employees to man the expanding establishments.

This manpower output will be more meaningful if training programs undertaken are related to the needs of the service and as well as of the employee. These needs require to be identified and established as a permanent feature of the employee training.

The future recognition of training programs in the making of promotion decisions depends upon the embodiment of specific courses, derived from a written training need, into the promotion policy that determines advancement in the upper levels of the professional and administrative cadres.

Specific Recommendations

The principal recommendations based on this research are the following:

1. The Office of the Head of Civil Service should establish a written list of training needs for organized training in the Benue State Civil Service and direct training programs according to these needs. The identification of training needs can be accomplished through a more specific operations analysis and individual performance appraisal.
Operations Analysis

This will take the form of job analysis of the employees on grade level 12 and as well as those on grade level 13. It will identify the skills, knowledges and abilities employees need to perform their job duties and meet specified standard of performance. This analysis, however, differs substantially from job analysis in that it will not be confined to immediate job duties. Skill needs for future job duties would be assessed as well. The analysis will establish the difference between the present job skills of employees on grade level 12 and the job demands in grade level 13. The demand in grade level 13 will then be classified into the future training needs for employees on grade level 12 whose promotion is to grade level 13. This analysis will be used to specify the training objectives.

Performance Appraisal

This will be used to determine if an individual performance deficiency exists which could be corrected by training. The mere appearance of deficient job performance does not necessarily indicate a training need, since inadequate performance may occur for a variety of reasons other than lack of knowledge and skills. Organizational barriers such as lack of positions to which employees from grade level 12 can be promoted to grade level 13 may have an impact on an employee's motivational level which may result
in deficient performance that cannot be corrected by training. Performance appraisal for training purposes would require three separate assessments: (a) determining how well employees on grade level 13 perform the job or progress toward the standard expected of them in the job, (b) determining deficiencies in skills, knowledges, and abilities of employees responsible for ineffective performance identified which can be corrected by training, and (c) with the experience in (b) above, determining the type of skills, knowledges and abilities which employees on grade level 12 require to perform effectively in grade level 13 to meet the expected standard and which can be corrected by training. All three assessments would be accomplished by objective examination of the confidential reports (performance appraisal reports) of the individuals. Determining individual training needs is necessary in planning training programs. Most training programs are group-directed—training of all employees on grade level 12—which is convenient for courses scheduling purposes. But assigning employees to group training without regard to individual training needs wastes resources, time and manpower.

Performance appraisal will be used not only to identify an initial training need, but also to determine the effectiveness and continued need for training already provided. In addition it will be used to modify ongoing training programs to meet the realities of a prevailing
situation. The information obtained from operation analysis and the individual performance assessment, which at this time have been written into a training need, would then be utilized to develop training programs for employees on grade level 12.

Development of Training Programs

The training content would be based on indications of the training need assessment. The first step is to identify the key concepts involved, those which are to be transmitted during the training process. For instance, if the problem earlier identified in respect of Accountants concerned "improper recording in accounting books," the key concept that might be dealt with in planning their training program will be "Bookkeeping and Accounts" within the area of Public Financial Management. Similarly, where there is frequent failure in dispute settlement between Unions and government representatives, this may suggest a lack of skills on the part of government officials in collective bargaining. The key concept to deal with in the training process will be "Public Employee Unionism and Collective Bargaining" within the area of Public Personnel Administration. The second step is to determine the general course title that will embrace all the key concepts. Third, the objective for which the program is designed to achieve will be specified.
It is not anticipated that future training programs of the type to be designed for grade level 12 will include a guaranteed higher position for every course participant. However, the program will provide a "management bank" from which to draw as managerial ability of the type provided in the program is required in grade level 13. The program will increase advancement opportunities for non-graduate employees as well as providing the managerial ability to graduate employees in high level positions. This avenue of upward advancement for all employees—graduates and non-graduates—with the potential and desire shall result in improved employee satisfaction and self-esteem. To the civil service, the program shall enable employees on grade level 13 to apply the new knowledge they have gained to their new positions, as the training has been particularized to the needs of the service. Fourth, to ensure maximum effectiveness of the program, any of the following methods of training—structured classroom, and on-the-job training, etc., will be selected with care.

On-the-Job Training

It is unlikely that trainers will be found within the civil service who possess the time and expertise to impart to the trainees the knowledge and skills identified in the key concepts to be addressed. Moreover, training in those management concepts may require extensive use of re-
sources for information—reference to books and other materials—which are available only in an ideal academic environment.

Structured classroom training

The principal objective of the program is to provide and update skills in key management concepts. In addition, the long-term aim of the program is to give to eligible graduates and non-graduates program participants the option of receiving continuing education, up to university degree level, in specific fields covered in the program. Because of the intensive nature of the proposed program, better learning facilities and more attention to details in the program would be assured if carried out in a well-structured classroom situation.

Implementation of Program

Two options would be examined in the implementation process: (a) use of institutions outside the State, and (b) utilizing on-site facilities.

(a) Use of institutions outside the State. The entire package is intended to meet the specific managerial needs of the State. The curriculum of the program is not likely to fit into any of the programs of an institution outside the State. Furthermore, the overhead cost that would be involved, should an institution be required to develop a program along the line of this proposal, together
with the cost of tuition and allowances to course participants outside the state, will add unbearably on the overall cost of executing the program. As indicated earlier, Benue State is relatively new and its need for better roads, more hospitals and schools, etc., for the benefit of her citizens probably outweighs the need for extensive training of employees. Consequently, it will be financially unwise to utilize an institution outside the State for the purposes of executing the proposed program.

(b) Utilizing on-site facilities. The State has a Staff Development Centre where courses for clerical staff, typists, storemen and stenographers are conducted. The present infrastructural facilities available at the centre are sufficient to permit future additional courses. It is not likely, however, that the training skills for higher courses are found among the existing staff at the centre. On the other hand, it will likely take two to three years to train sufficient number (about four to five) of the present staff at the centre to acquire the required skills to assume responsibility for the proposed program, which may delay program take off. Alternatively, an attempt would be made at recruiting from the labor market. Again given the experience and expertise required in the key concepts identified in the program it will be extremely difficult to find the number of qualified applicants (about four) for early appointment. Another way of ensuring early program take off
is to enlist the cooperation of a university in running the program on site. A university will almost certainly have the desired expertise to make available. Most important of all is the fact that such cooperation will provide for smooth accreditation of the program with the university. This will increase the opportunities of the program participants who have the option of receiving continuing education up to university degree level. Under the cooperation arrangement, a university will second, for a specified period, an agreed number of staff to organize and conduct the program. During the period of the cooperation, arrangements would be made to train some staff of the Staff Development Center for the future eventual take over of the program.

The advantages of on-site training are many. First, employees nominated for the program would not be entitled to tuition and allowances. Undoubtedly, this will result to substantial cost saving for the government. Second, it will be possible to conduct the course during a particular period in the day in such a way as to allow the officers to work and at the same time attend classes. This will minimize the need for having to obtain replacements for those employees selected to participate in the program.

2. A clear promotion policy for grade level 12 employees would consist of the following information aimed at giving recognition to training programs:
(1) By promotion of a confirmed and suitable Administrative officer, Grade VI (Federal) or Grade V (State) who possess any of the following qualifications from a recognized institution:

(a) Bachelor's degree in Public Administration, Political Science or Social Science

(b) Diploma/Certificate in Public Administration of not less than six months duration plus eight years of relevant experience

(c) Master's degree in Public Administration, Political Science or Social Science.

(2) By direct appointment of a candidate possessing a degree in the relevant discipline from a recognized university plus at least eight year post-qualification cognate experience.

3. Since personnel policy changes are the exclusive reserve of the National Council on Establishment, a memorandum will be submitted to the Council. Specifically, the memoranda will request for the inclusion in the existing promotion policy for grade level 12 employees, those educational qualifications that must be considered in promotion decisions.
Suggested Areas of Further Research

This study has dealt with the role of training in the making of promotion decisions. Other factors, particularly performance evaluation and length of experience, are also major criteria for promotion but have not been addressed in this study. Therefore, the recommendations regarding the relationship between training and promotion which are presented in this paper should only be regarded as a partial policy. Other criteria—performance evaluation and length of experience—also merit further study and immediate attention by the government.
APPENDIX
RESEARCH FINDINGS

In attempting to determine which one of the training programs has a positive effect on promotion decisions involving professional and administrative officers on grade level 12, a number of factors must be considered. What is the present educational level of each employee on grade level 12? Are there differences in individual educational qualification among employees on the grade level under study? What type of educational qualifications that are generally considered as essential in advancing employees on grade level 12? Do employees require further training to qualify for promotion to senior management positions? The answers to these questions will indicate the extent to which importance is attached to a particular training program in the making of promotion decisions and to which future training programs would be directed.

Two standards of educational qualifications were identified among the present employees on grade level 12. First, there are those who possess university degrees and who were recruited directly into the administrative and professional cadres by virtue of that qualification. They began their career at the bottom ladder of the cadres (that is on grade level 08) and have progressed through normal promo-
tion to their present ranks on grade level 12. Second, em-
ployees who had transferred from other cadres--from Execu-
tive Officers (general and accounts cadres)--to Administra-
tive and Accountants cadres and have progressed, through
promotions, to grade level 12. This group consists of em-
ployees who are holders of Advanced Diploma in Management
Studies, Certificates in Administrative Management, and Di-
ploma in Secretarial Studies. The transfer process from one
cadre to another is conditioned by career flexibility pro-
vided in the scheme of service.¹

Theoretically, there is no discrimination as regards
the type of educational qualification that has to be given
consideration in promotion decisions involving advancement
of employees from grade level 12 to higher posts. During the
period of study, responses obtained from officers respon-
sible for making promotion decisions for officers on grade
level 12, showed the following trend:

¹Details regarding "advancement beyond the cadre" is
discussed in the Approved Schemes of Service for Use in the
TABLE 1

PRESENT POLICY ON PROMOTION: THE DEGREE TO WHICH EMPHASIS IS PLACED ON EDUCATIONAL QUALIFICATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Emphasis (Total of eight responses)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-degree Diploma/Certificates</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor Degree</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master's and Doctorate Degree</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the opinion of those making recommendations for promotions, Bachelor degrees ranked highest among those educational qualifications considered essential for making promotions beyond grade level 12. In the other two cases in which non-degree diploma/certificate, the Master's, and Doctoral degrees were rated high, this may have reflected the background of those making promotion decisions. For instance, a degree holder making the decision to promote an employee may place emphasis on university degrees. By the same token, a non-graduate may tend to consider non-degree diplomas/certificates as more important in promotion decisions. On the other hand, if the officer making promotion decisions applied the "university degree" criterion, he used, as a standard of judgment, comparison of the graduate and non-graduate employees in terms of their respective ability to handle issues in high level positions.
requiring a high degree of analytical skills. In other words, when using "university degree" criterion, the recommending officer has ignored "experience" and "performance appraisal" criteria which may be as valuable in determining ability to perform in high level positions. Additionally, when using the "university degree" criterion the recommending officer made recommendations based on his knowledge of a requirement which the civil service may not be willing to sacrifice.

Moreover, the fact that five (62.5%) of the responses from the recommending officers had opined Bachelor's, Master's and Doctorate degrees as a necessary requirement for promotion beyond grade level 12 tend to confirm the perception which non-graduate employees at that level hold regarding lack of recognition to non-degree diplomas and certificates in promotion decisions affecting them. The following statement is a representative of the views of most responses from non-graduate administrative officers and accountants:

Educational qualification creates a great deal of tension/problems with co-workers (graduate employees).

On the basis of this assumption, "university degrees" was rated by all the non-graduates on grade level 12 as the only type of qualifications that can enhance their chances for advancement into senior management positions. Non-graduate employees more often tended to think that ac-
quiring a university degree had a substantial effect on their future promotion to top level positions. The impressive connection which was earlier noted between university degrees and promotion decisions has lent credence to this assumption. However, the absence of a clear statement in the existing promotion policy which determines promotion for employees on grade level 12 makes it difficult to compare it with the opinion expressed thus far by those responsible for making promotion decisions.

Given that most non-graduate employees on grade level 12 have embraced university degree (as also indicated by officers making promotion recommendations) as the only sure route for their promotion to senior management position, the type of training for them is an important factor which cannot be overlooked. Training officers were asked to indicate the type of training programs frequently used for employees on grade level 12. In the six responses (one hundred percent), training officers reported the existence of a general trend which is to provide sponsorship to employees on grade level 12 to pursue university degree courses. This indicates that the emphasis placed on university degree courses by officers making promotion decisions has also influenced the nature of training provided to employees on grade level 12.
The responses from training officers concerning whether the existing training programs are tied to any promotion policy for employees on grade level 12 were often varied. In some responses, one party reported that training was tied to promotion decisions while the other party reported none. When asked to indicate the type of training most relevant to the needs of the employees on grade level 12 to enhance their chances for promotion to higher posts, the following responses emerged:

**TABLE 2**

**FUTURE APPROPRIATE TRAINING FOR GRADE LEVEL 12 EMPLOYEES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Training</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Of six responses)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On the job training</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University degree (Bachelor's, Master's, Ph.D.)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Management courses</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the opinion of the training officers, chances for further advancement of employees on grade level 12 are hindered by existing promotion policy if they (employees) are not provided with the opportunities for university degree courses. Table 2 also indicates the irrelevancy of "on-the-job training" and "management training" in the making of promotion decisions (33.3%) when compared with degree courses (66.6%).
Research indicates that there is heavy reliance on university degree courses in making promotion decisions involving employees on grade level 12. Various responses also suggest that "university degrees have been over-used in deciding who is best qualified for promotion to higher positions. In the process these decisions have tended to neglect the importance which other training programs--management training and non-degree certificates/diplomas--can play as regards the ability of the individual possessing them to perform in equally high level positions.

In summary, any educational qualification possessed by an employee on grade level 12 is suitable for judging his competence in performing in a high level position. However, the biggest failing of all training programs to meaningfully relate to the promotion of employees on that grade level appears to be caused by lack of acceptance of some programs by those who make promotion decisions in the Benue State Civil Service. The absence of a clear statement on training in the existing promotion policy has facilitated this lack of acceptance.

While 37.5% of those making promotion decisions accepted other training programs as good in deciding who gets promoted, 62.5% opined that "university degrees" were the best criteria acceptable for promotion to high level positions. Thus, university degrees scored high among other training programs in promotion decisions involving employees
on grade level 12 in the Benue State Civil Service. Therefore, the more we think of this over-dependence on university degrees in promotion decisions to high level positions in the Benue State Civil Service, the more it becomes necessary to direct training for employees on grade level 12 to meet this requirement.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS


OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS

1. Federal Government


2. **Benue State Government**


