Survey to determine the duties of the elementary music supervisor as recommended by selected classroom teachers in Montana

Lane Dale Justus

The University of Montana

Let us know how access to this document benefits you.

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd

Recommended Citation

Justus, Lane Dale, 'Survey to determine the duties of the elementary music supervisor as recommended by selected classroom teachers in Montana' (1955). Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers. 3823.
https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd/3823
A SURVEY TO DETERMINE THE DUTIES OF
THE ELEMENTARY MUSIC SUPERVISOR AS RECOMMENDED
BY SELECTED CLASSROOM TEACHERS IN MONTANA

by

LANE D. JUSTUS

B. M., Montana State University, 1952

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for
the degree of Master of Music

MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY

1955

Approved by:

Chairman, Board of Examiners

Dean, Graduate School

Date
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author is indebted to the cooperation of classroom teachers in Montana who supplied the material used in this study and to Mrs. Genevieve Holbrook and Professors Lloyd Oakland and James Short whose encouragement and constant guidance provided invaluable impetus in its completion. Also, I wish to acknowledge the assistance of my wife, Beatrice, whose enthusiasm and cooperation helped to make this study more successful.

L. D. J.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER PAGE

I. INTRODUCTION AND SETTING ........................................... 1
   The Purpose of the Study ...................................... 2
   Sources of Data ............................................... 2
   Definition of Terms ......................................... 3
   Questionnaire Distribution ............................... 3

II. RESULTS OF THE STUDY ............................................ 6
   The Local Situation ......................................... 6
   The Learning Process ...................................... 11
   Teacher Training Duties .................................. 18
   The Supervisor and the Community ................... 29
   The Research Duties of the Supervisor ........... 32

III. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS .......... 35

BIBLIOGRAPHY .......................................................... 38

APPENDIX ............................................................... 39
   Comments ....................................................... 39
   Questionnaire ................................................ 42
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Questionnaire Returns by Grade</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Questionnaire Returns by City</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Music Teaching Assignments</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Classroom Duties of the Supervisor in the Visitation Period</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Classroom Seating Duties of the Supervisor</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Teaching Aids in the Classroom</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. A Critique of Certain Areas of the Music Program in the Classroom</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Plan One: Written Suggestions from the Supervisor to Classroom Teachers</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Plan Two: Regular Informal Meetings Between Supervisor and Classroom Teachers</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Plan Three: Individual Conferences Between Supervisor and Teacher</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI. Demonstration Lessons by the Supervisor</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII. Demonstration Lessons by Selected Local Teachers</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII. Demonstration Lessons by Outside Music Specialists</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV. School Music Procedures Involving the Community</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV. Research Duties of the Supervisor</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE PAGE

1. Musical Training of Classroom Teachers ........ 9
2. Musical Experience of Classroom Teachers .... 9
3. Singing Ability of Classroom Teachers ......... 10
4. Piano Playing Ability of Classroom Teachers . 10
5. Comparison of Plans One, Two, and Three .... 23
6. Comparison of Popularity of Demonstration
   Lessons as a Duty of the Supervisor and
   Demonstrations by other Personnel ............ 28
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION AND SETTING

Music education specialists of the past decade have developed many different systems for the teaching of music in the elementary schools. Most of these various methods are in use in the schools today in widely scattered areas. Many are opposed one to another in theory as well as practice. Consequently, the beginning classroom teacher and the beginning music specialist alike are at a loss as to which course to follow. The new supervisor will find great difficulty in his first job unless he has a broad understanding of what is expected of him by the superintendent, the community, the training institution, and the classroom teachers with whom he must associate. Of these, the group which exerts the most influence is, by nature of its work, that composed of the classroom teachers in the local school system. The duties of the supervisor and his teachers are closely entwined and each must cooperate fully with the other in the formation of a music program which is mutually satisfying and beneficial to both parties. "Teaching may be compared to a partnership in learning between two persons, one of whom has had more
experience than the other. If only one of the partners learn, the teaching is a failure. This analogy holds good for supervision.\footnote{1}

**The Purpose of the Study.** This study was undertaken as a means of determining trends in teacher-thinking relative to certain procedures and practices current in the field of elementary music education. Special emphasis has been placed on the duties of the elementary music specialist or supervisor and his responsibilities to the students and to classroom teachers. Since the classroom teacher plays such an important role in an effective music program, this study is both important and timely. A more satisfying and comprehensive plan of procedures than those now in use may be developed as a result.

**Sources of Data.** Material used in this study was obtained as the result of a questionnaire survey conducted in the fall of 1954 among classroom teachers of selected school systems in Montana. The six city systems having the largest school populations in the state were used to obtain a cross-section of the trend in teacher-thinking.\footnote{2} Those

---


\footnote{2}{Montana Educational Directory, (Helena: State Department of Public Instruction, 1954-1955)}
cities were as follows: Billings, Butte, Great Falls, Helena, Kalispell, and Missoula. The author conferred with school principals whose buildings had been selected at random in each of the cities listed. No special method of selection was employed, although an attempt was made to include schools from diverse economic localities. Each principal was given nine questionnaires for his or her building which were to have been distributed so that at least one teacher from each of the six grade levels would be involved. The completed questionnaires were then returned to the principals and were mailed to the author.

Definition of Terms. The term "elementary teacher" or "classroom teacher" as applied in this report signifies those teachers who are responsible for the dissemination of learning in grades one, two, three, four, five, and six. "Elementary music supervisor" is the name given to those special teachers who have responsibilities concerning the regulation of the music program in the elementary school and the supervision of the teaching therein.

Questionnaire Distribution. One hundred seventy-one questionnaires were distributed. Of these, one hundred forty were returned, at least partially completed, for an over-all return of 81.88 per cent. The numerical returns of questionnaires by grade level are presented in Table I. Great Falls received a total of thirty-six questionnaires
twenty-seven. These figures and the respective returns are presented in Table II.

The duties of the supervisor are many and varied. For the purpose of clarity, these duties are classified in this report under the following sub-headings: The Local Situation, The Learning Process, Teacher Training Duties, The Supervisor and the Community, and The Research Duties of the Supervisor.
### TABLE I
QUESTIONNAIRE RETURNS BY GRADE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRADE LEVEL</th>
<th>NUMBER OF RETURNS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>144</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE II
QUESTIONNAIRE RETURNS BY CITY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>QUESTIONNAIRES SENT</th>
<th>QUESTIONNAIRES RETURNED</th>
<th>PERCENTAGES OF RETURN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Billings</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>91.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butte</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>40.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Falls</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>94.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helena</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>91.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalispell</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>81.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missoula</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>95.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>171</strong></td>
<td><strong>140</strong></td>
<td><strong>81.88</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER II

RESULTS OF THE STUDY

I. THE LOCAL SITUATION

The first section of this report is devoted to obtaining data pertinent to the teaching situation in each locality.

The results of the questionnaire study presented in Table III show that most cities involved in the survey have an elementary music supervisor. A total of one hundred teachers indicated that there was a supervisor in their school system while thirty-four indicated that there was not. Of those who replied that there was no supervisor in their school system, twenty-six indicated that there was at least one teacher in their system who acted as a special music teacher, making visitations and assuming instructional duties.

Most teachers have the music teaching responsibility in their own classrooms. The survey shows that eighty per cent of those teachers answering the question indicated that they taught the music for their own classes. The number answering in the affirmative was one hundred four. Twenty-seven teachers indicated that they did not teach the music in their classrooms. Of those who answered that
### TABLE III

**MUSIC TEACHING ASSIGNMENTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEACHER OR SPECIALIST</th>
<th>NUMBER OF TEACHERS REPORTING</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE REPORTING EACH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ELEMENTARY SUPERVISOR</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>74.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPECIAL MUSIC TEACHER</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>19.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELF</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>80.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER TEACHER IN BUILDING</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>19.84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
they did not teach the music in their own classes, twenty-six reported that some other teacher in their building assumed those duties.

A large number of teachers indicated that they used some form of music activity at times other than the regular music period. The number of teachers who answered in this manner was one-hundred nineteen, or slightly over ninety-six per cent of the total number answering the question.

The common practice, as indicated in this survey, is to have music taught in the regular classroom. One hundred twenty-seven of one hundred thirty-seven teachers answering the question replied that music was taught in their classrooms. The number of such replies formed over ninety-three per cent of the total answering the question.

The musical training and experience of the classroom teachers, as well as their singing and piano playing abilities, are shown in Figures 1, 2, 3, and 4. The teachers were asked to evaluate their own abilities in singing and playing the piano. It is interesting to note that a substantial portion of those answering indicated that their piano playing ability was inadequate.
FIGURE 1
MUSICAL TRAINING OF CLASSROOM TEACHERS

FIGURE 2
MUSICAL EXPERIENCE OF CLASSROOM TEACHERS
FIGURE 3
SINGING ABILITY OF CLASSROOM TEACHERS

FIGURE 4
PIANO PLAYING ABILITY OF CLASSROOM TEACHERS
II. THE LEARNING PROCESS

This portion of the chapter is devoted to findings relative to the broad aspects of elementary music with special emphasis on teaching in the classroom.

An attempt was made in this study to ascertain the duties of the supervisor within the classroom as seen by the various classroom teachers. In addition, many questions regarding general practices and areas of dispute were submitted to the teachers in an effort to devise a smoother program in general.

Table IV indicates that most teachers feel that the supervisor should, when visiting the classroom, assume some teaching responsibilities but should also observe the teaching of the regular teacher and give appropriate helpful suggestions through which the quality of presentations might be improved. A large number of teachers indicated a desire to have the supervisor do all of the teaching during the visitation period. A small percentage indicated that the supervisor's duties should be limited to observation alone.

The question of classroom seating is presented in Table V. Fifty-one of 123 teachers answering the question believed that the supervisor should assign special music seats for part-singing only. Thirty-nine of 130 answering
### TABLE IV
CLASSROOM DUTIES OF THE SUPERVISOR IN THE VISITATION PERIOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Affirmative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Affirmative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should teach only</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>79.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should observe only</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>9.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should teach and observe</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>79.69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE V
CLASSROOM SEATING DUTIES OF THE SUPERVISOR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Affirmative</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>Affirmative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should assign seats for part-singing only</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>41.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should assign seats for all singing</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should use heterogeneous seating for all singing</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>18.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
indicated that they thought the supervisor should assign special music seats for all singing activities. Twenty-one of 116 teachers were in favor of heterogeneous seating for all singing activities.

The question of the extent to which the supervisor should dictate matters of procedure is one that has caused considerable debate among music educators and classroom teachers. The results of this survey indicate that the detailed plan or course of study is not desirable from the viewpoint of the average teacher of the grades. Thirteen of 132 teachers who answered the question approved of a detailed music teaching plan. The use of guide sheets, which contain suggested goals, helps and teaching procedures, seems much more favorable as indicated by the responses of 126 teachers out of a total of 132 who replied to the question.

Seventy-two of 128 replying to the question felt that the classroom teacher should decide what phase of the music instruction needs to be emphasized. Ninety-five felt that students should remain in their own classroom for music. Thirty-five of 131 said that music should always be taught at the same time each day, while 26.35 per cent felt that the use of music should be confined to the regular music period.
Teaching aids, or the lack of them, form a grievance point in many schools. The author attempted to ascertain by questionnaire the requirements for the average classroom situation.

The question was asked "Do you believe that there must be a piano in any room where music is taught?" A total of 134 teachers replied, 24 affirmatively and 110 negatively. "Each classroom must contain a phonograph" replied 40 of 133 teachers who answered the question. The majority of the teachers replying indicated that each classroom teacher must have and use her own pitch pipe. The number answering affirmatively to this question was 126 of 138, or 91.30 per cent. These returns are shown in Table VI.

**TABLE VI**

TEACHING AIDS IN THE CLASSROOM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirement</th>
<th>Affirmative</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any room where music is taught must have a piano</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>17.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Each classroom must have a phonograph</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>30.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher must have own pitch pipe</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>91.30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The content of the elementary music program is most important in the formation of a well-rounded individual. Several questions were asked the cooperating teachers with the hope that their answers would lead to the formation of a curriculum suitable to the needs of all elementary school children.

By far the majority of those answering the questionnaire indicated that the music program should be inclusive of more than one activity. Two of 136 felt that music for the grades should be confined to singing activities. Instrumentalists in the classroom should have the opportunity to perform along with the singing activities of the class as indicated by 91.60 per cent of 120 of 131 teachers who answered the question. The question of whether there should be dancing or some other form of bodily movement met the approval of 127 teachers as against seven who were opposed. Unanimous approval was accorded the teaching of the fundamentals of music at the elementary level. The most popular device for learning music reading in the grades is the syllable system as the responses of 89.98 per cent of the teachers show. The next device in order of popularity is the use of numbers. This method received the sanction of 27.66 per cent of the teachers who responded to the question. It is interesting to note that 8.13 per cent or ten of 123 who answered, reasoned that music will teach
itself without the aid of any helping devices. This finding is in direct opposition to a current theory among some music educators that learning music is but the natural outgrowth of the child's experience.

Another subject which frequently causes criticism is the practice of taking time out from the school day to provide instrumental training for students. When asked whether they thought this practice to be advisable the preponderance of the classroom teachers involved in this survey indicated their approval. Percentage-wise, those who favored the practice amounted to 83.58 per cent of the total.

Public performance by grade school students found favor among the majority of teachers questioned. "All-city" performing groups were approved by 86.92 per cent of those answering. The formation of select vocal ensembles, small groups, and grade school glee clubs were favored by 100 of the 129 who answered the question.

One significant factor brought out by this study was the reluctance of classroom teachers in general to assist in the preparation and presentation of musical programs outside of school time. Thirty-nine point five one per cent thought this practice advisable. These returns are presented in Table VII.
### TABLE VII

**A CRITIQUE OF CERTAIN AREAS OF THE MUSIC PROGRAM IN THE CLASSROOM**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED ACTIVITY</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SINGING ONLY</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>1.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSTRUMENTS WITH SINGING</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>91.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DANCING OR BODILY MOVEMENT</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>94.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MUSIC FUNDAMENTALS</strong></td>
<td>135</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SYLLABLES</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>89.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUMBERS</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>27.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO DEVICES</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>8.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSTRUMENTAL TRAINING DURING SCHOOL HOURS</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>83.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;ALL-CITY&quot; PERFORMING GROUPS</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>86.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SELECT SMALL GROUPS AND ELEMENTARY SCHOOL GLEE CLUBS</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>77.52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
III. TEACHER TRAINING DUTIES

"In the performance of the training function, the supervisory agent places his expert knowledge, power, and skill at the service of any person in the system who is attempting to carry out the instructional policies of the administration."\(^1\) It is therefore apparent that the supervisor has inescapable duties in regard to the enlightenment of and assistance to the classroom teachers in his school system.

This portion of the chapter deals with the activities of the supervisor which are concerned with assisting the classroom teacher to become more efficient in the teaching of music subjects.

The first question asked in the survey which deals with this area was "Should all visitations by the supervisor be scheduled?". In response, ninety-four of 134 teachers who answered replied in the affirmative. Fifty of 125 indicated that they felt that occasional visits which had not been previously scheduled would be helpful.

---

Slightly more than thirty-two per cent of those who answered the question felt that suggestions from the supervisor should always be written and presented to the individual teacher concerned. Of those who answered in this manner, forty-nine of fifty-four indicated that they would also like a conference with the supervisor. Thirty-nine of the fifty-four said the conference should take place immediately following the visit. Forty-three indicated that time should be made available for the conference after the written suggestions have been received. This method is Plan One in Table VIII.

The second plan discussed in the survey involves regular informal meetings with the supervisor and all classroom teachers in attendance. Sixty-three of the 103 teachers participating in the question approved of this method. The affirmative replies constituted 61.16 per cent of the total. Approximately ninety-two per cent of those in favor felt that this should be the time to discuss suggestions from the supervisor. However, only thirty-one of seventy-one were in favor of holding these meetings after school hours and the same number disapproved of compulsory attendance by all the classroom teachers.

Results contrary to what might be expected were shown in response to the next plan. Eighteen of the one
hundred replies approved of private conferences between 
the supervisor and the individual classroom teacher as 
being the only means of presenting suggestions. Eighty-one 
per cent of those in favor indicated that these conferences 
should become a part of each visitation period.
TABLE VIII

PLAN ONE: WRITTEN SUGGESTIONS FROM THE SUPERVISOR TO CLASSROOM TEACHERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALWAYS WRITTEN</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>32.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IF SO, CONFERENCE ALSO</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>90.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IF SO, CONFERENCE IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING VISIT</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>72.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONFERENCE AFTER RECEIPT OF WRITTEN SUGGESTIONS</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>86.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE IX

PLAN TWO: REGULAR INFORMAL MEETINGS BETWEEN SUPERVISOR AND CLASSROOM TEACHERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>REGULAR INFORMAL MEETINGS WITH ALL TEACHERS AND SUPERVISOR</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>61.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IF SO, DISCUSSION OF SUGGESTIONS AT THAT TIME</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>91.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEETINGS AFTER SCHOOL HOURS</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>43.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REQUIRED ATTENDANCE</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>56.34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE X

PLAN THREE: INDIVIDUAL CONFERENCES BETWEEN SUPERVISOR AND TEACHER.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INDIVIDUAL CONFERENCES</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>18.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IF SO, AS PART OF EVERY VISIT</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>81.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FIGURE 5

Comparison of Plans One, Two, and Three
Undoubtedly, one of the most frequent and important ways of assisting the classroom teacher to become a better teacher of music is through the use of demonstration lessons. Several procedures are possible in this area. In an effort to find the most suitable, three plans were submitted to the co-operating teachers for approval.

One hundred seventeen teachers from a total of 127 who answered the question indicated that they felt that the presentation of demonstration lessons was a part of the duties of the elementary supervisor of music. Of those replying in this manner, forty-nine of 109 felt that the demonstrations should be presented at a group meeting after school hours. Exactly half of 108 replied that attendance should be required of all classroom teachers at these meetings.

The selection by the supervisor of certain teachers from within the local school system to present demonstration lessons in areas where they have done exceptional work met the approval of 62.60 per cent of the teachers replying. Thirty-one of eighty-eight who responded indicated that these demonstrations should be given after school hours. Thirty-seven of a total of eighty-two replied that attendance should be required of all classroom teachers.
The suggested plan of importing music specialists for the purpose of presenting demonstration lessons was well received among the teachers involved in this study. One hundred of 127 replies favored this plan. However, forty-seven of 117 replied that these demonstrations should be given after school hours and fifty-five of 105 teachers favored required attendance.

Slightly more than half of the replies to the question indicated approval of the supervisor selecting the teacher who would be responsible for music instruction in each classroom. Fifty-seven of a total of 110 replies approved.
# TABLE XI

**DEMONSTRATION LESSONS BY THE SUPERVISOR**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEMONSTRATION LESSONS: A DUTY OF THE SUPERVISOR</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>92.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIVEN AT GROUP MEETING AFTER SCHOOL HOURS</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>44.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATTENDANCE BY ALL TEACHERS REQUIRED</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# TABLE XII

**DEMONSTRATION LESSONS BY SELECTED LOCAL TEACHERS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEMONSTRATION LESSONS BY LOCAL TEACHER</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>62.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIVEN AFTER SCHOOL HOURS</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>35.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATTENDANCE BY ALL TEACHERS REQUIRED</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE XIII
DEMONSTRATION LESSONS BY OUTSIDE MUSIC SPECIALISTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEMONSTRATION LESSONS BY OUTSIDE MUSIC SPECIALISTS</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>78.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIVEN AFTER SCHOOL HOURS</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>40.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATTENDANCE BY ALL TEACHERS REQUIRED</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>52.35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FIGURE 6

COMPARISON OF POPULARITY OF DEMONSTRATION LESSONS AS A DUTY OF THE SUPERVISOR AND DEMONSTRATIONS BY OTHER PERSONNEL.
IV. THE SUPERVISOR AND THE COMMUNITY

Since music is an art which must frequently be presented in public, it follows that certain standards or rules must be maintained which will curtail public criticism. The public schools are often viewed quite critically by the public eye in many areas of endeavor, so the supervisor especially must be ever-watchful lest he invoke the wrath of the community in music matters.

In order to perfect a more acceptable set of standards, the author submitted a series of questions to the co-operating teachers for consideration based on their years of invaluable experience in the teaching profession. The results of this portion of the study are presented on this and subsequent pages of this chapter subdivision.

A question regarding the advisability of taking elementary school pupils to perform outside the community brought thirty-eight replies in favor of the procedure and ninety-one against. One hundred thirteen of 135 teachers who participated in the question indicated that the music activities of the school should be open to observation by the parents at all times. Following this suggestion, seventy-eight of 127 teachers expressed favor in the institution of an "open house" at which time all music instruction would be open to observation by any adult member of the community.
Most of the participating teachers were in favor of allowing elementary school pupils to take part in musical programs outside of school time. Seventy-two of 133 replies approved of this procedure. Over seventy-one per cent, or ninety-two of 128 teachers, thought that select musical organizations should be asked to perform for special civic and professional groups in the community.

Slightly more than half of the teachers answering the question felt that the supervisor is obligated to accept invitations to speak to outside groups regarding the music program of the schools. Numerically, sixty-three of 123 teachers replied in this manner.

These returns are presented in Table XIV.
### TABLE XIV
SCHOOL MUSIC PROCEDURES INVOLVING THE COMMUNITY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STUDENT PARTICIPATION IN PROGRAMS OUTSIDE THE COMMUNITY</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>29.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL MUSIC INSTRUCTION OPEN TO OBSERVATION AT ALL TIMES</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>83.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;OPEN HOUSE&quot; FOR MUSIC INSTRUCTION</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>61.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUDENT PARTICIPATION IN PROGRAMS AFTER SCHOOL HOURS</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>54.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELECT STUDENT GROUPS APPEARING BEFORE CIVIC GROUPS</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>71.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUPERVISOR OBLIGATED TO SPEAK BEFORE OUTSIDE GROUPS CONCERNING THE SCHOOL PROGRAM</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>51.22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
V. THE RESEARCH DUTIES OF THE SUPERVISOR

The duties of the supervisor regarding research are becoming increasingly more important as a means of educating both teachers and students relative to current trends in the field of elementary music education. Certain practices which are currently in use were referred to in this survey in an attempt to garner opinions from classroom teachers as to the advisability of their use. These practices will be discussed in this chapter.

The issuance of periodic informative bulletins which contain current trends and practices in music education was highly favored by the majority of the teachers who replied. One hundred fourteen from a total of 129 teachers approved of this procedure. Approximately ninety-nine per cent of the replies advocated experiments in the classroom with new materials and methods of instruction. Two of a total of 128 teachers did not approve. Four of 129 replies said these experiments should always be made involving the same classroom group. One hundred nineteen of 121 felt that experiments should be rotated, using all available classroom groups which are relatively similar. Eight replies from a total of ninety-nine expressed the opinion that experiments should be conducted with an "ideal" class composed of representatives from all classrooms.
The replies of 118 of 129 teachers indicate that the supervisor has the responsibility for the acquisition of a central library of phonograph records. Likewise, 122 of 130 teachers saw the acquisition of pertinent library and resource materials as a duty of the supervisor. One hundred six of a total of 133 teachers favored the supervisory practice of arranging for authorities in the field of music education to speak to the local school personnel.

The returns discussed in this section are found in Table XV.
## TABLE XV

**RESEARCH DUTIES OF THE SUPERVISOR**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUGGESTED PROCEDURE</th>
<th>REPLIES IN FAVOR</th>
<th>REPLIES AGAINST</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE IN FAVOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ISSUE INFORMATIVE BULLETINS</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>89.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXPERIMENT WITH NEW MATERIALS AND METHODS OF INSTRUCTION</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>98.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-- WITH SAME CLASSROOM GROUP</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>3.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-- ROTATE BETWEEN ALL SIMILAR CLASSES</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>95.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-- WITH &quot;IDEAL&quot; CLASS FORMED BY REPRESENTATIVES FROM ALL CLASSES</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>8.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACQUIRE CENTRAL PHONOGRAPH RECORD LIBRARY</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>91.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACQUIRE PERTINENT LIBRARY AND RESOURCE MATERIALS</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>93.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARRANGE FOR MUSIC EDUCATION AUTHORITIES TO SPEAK LOCALLY</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>79.70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER III

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Most teachers indicated in the returned questionnaires that the major portion of the cities involved in the study have at least one member of the school staff who assumes the role of elementary music supervisor or similar position. At least one system studied applies the term "music consultant" to the elementary specialist. Nevertheless, the positions are similar enough to permit comparison. The term "supervisor" is used in this report because of its rather universal usage.

The musical training and experience of classroom teachers, as evaluated by the individuals concerned, seems to be adequate for the teaching of the subject at the elementary school level. However, a surprisingly large number judged their singing and piano abilities to be inadequate. This is undoubtedly a result of low requirements on the part of teacher training institutions. This situation could be remedied by increasing the quality of instruction and the number of hours required in music subjects for certification at the state level.

Supervision as it was known when the practice was first inaugurated is not now well received, as the results
of this study indicate. This fact is probably responsible for the general rebellion against the term. Only slightly more than nine per cent of the teachers involved in this study felt that the duties of the supervisor should be confined to the practice of observation in the classroom. Therefore, the term "supervisor" no longer applies to the extent that it once did. It is the opinion of the author that some other term be given the elementary music specialist, such as "co-ordinator" or "consultant".

The concept of the elementary music specialist as something other than a true supervisor was given further impetus in the matter of courses of study or detailed lesson plans. One hundred twenty-six teachers preferred guide sheets to strict lesson plans and more than seventy per cent felt that the classroom teacher should decide upon the phase of music instruction to be emphasized.

The results of this study indicate that the music curriculum for the classroom has also undergone considerable change since its first use. The addition of dancing, musical instruments, phonographs, the teaching of music fundamentals, and the formation of select performing groups has met with widespread approval, transforming the drab, uninteresting music period of a "tune a day" into a complete school day filled with many diverse but delightful musical activities.
Classroom teachers in general do not favor unannounced visits by the music specialist. Slightly more than seventy per cent of those who replied to the question felt that all visitations should be scheduled. Again, rebellion against pure supervision was indicated.

In Part III of Chapter II, the reader may notice that the numerical results of the survey do not always follow in a consistent order. This is due in part to failure by the author to give complete instructions to those who answered the questionnaire. Several questions were dependent upon previous answers for their effectiveness and in many cases teachers answered opposing questions.


APPENDIX
"Each teacher should teach her own music."

"I think instrumental training should be after school hours. It is a form of extra-curricular activities in my opinion. (Except for junior high)."

"Music is important but not so much as to spend money to import specialists. If a teacher feels she can teach her own music fairly well, then let her. However, I am inclined to believe in a music instructor for each school as in a platoon system."

"Maybe a semi-annual or quarterly pamphlet could be prepared giving new ideas on the teaching of music or ways in which it can be used in other subjects. Also a pamphlet for each grade on what is to be taught and in what order and how to present that material to be taught. Should be concise yet could be very helpful—especially order—. I think teaching of music fundamentals should be fairly uniform in each grade—just as there is a certain amount of basic number learning at each level. If a definite and brief plan were presented supplemental to the music book guides, then teachers in succeeding grades will know exactly what children have learned or at least what has been presented in (the) previous grade."

"Records should be available in every school on a moments' notice."

"Supervisors should comment to the teacher privately."

"Instrumental instruction should be outside of school. There isn't time for the teacher to get in regular subjects as it is."

"Music should primarily be for enjoyment and learning in the classroom, not to 'show off' young children in the community."

"Demonstrations with my own class or another I find to be most helpful service of the music supervisor."
"I have gained more by having the supervisor teach my class once a month. I need to observe him, he doesn't need to observe me."

"I feel it is very good for children to perform publicly in the community."

"While I think select groups and individuals should be encouraged, I think there is a tendency to overdo this that is not matched by giving children talented in other ways the same feeling of importance to the schools---."

"Material and music used in the classroom should fit the needs for a public program."

"Music should be as carefully planned (by the classroom teacher) as any other subject if it is to be of value. It's too often only a 'fun session' or a 'fillin' with not too well-planned goals or aims."

"Demonstration lessons in the classroom are helpful--often help clarify suggestions given in meetings."

"If scheduled during school hours (clinics) attendance should be compulsory; outside of school hours they should not (be)--unless they are something really new or special or unless they form a phase of indoctrination."

"I feel that it makes little difference whether syllables or numbers are used--each is equally good."

"I do not feel that any demonstration lessons should be after school hours. Such demonstrations are an inherent part of the program."

"Perhaps in 'research', a 'Research Committee' might do the suggested activities. This might create a more co-operative feeling with the supervisor as a person. The supervisor should be a member of such (a) committee."

"I do not approve of much work after school as a day of teaching is strenuous enough without many meetings."

"I feel the supervisor should use ideas on classrooms where he feels progress might be made on a new idea---some teachers are so sure a new idea will not work and
that 'her' idea or way is the way that new suggestions and ideas are 'failures' even before tried."

"Should we just continue to let the child who just can't get syllables dislike singing?"

"A special music teacher in each building but no supervisors."

"If ever I have a room of 25 pupils, I would be willing to do outside music. With more, such participation is impossible."

"I favor use of notes rather than syllables or numbers."

"No more should be expected of the supervisor than the teacher."

"It would help the classroom teacher very much if the supervisor could put his finger on material we need right away."

"Much more music appreciation should be taught."

"Music should co-ordinate with units in reading, science, (and) language. It should be relaxing and enjoyable."

"---A supervisor should be an inspiration as well as a good teacher."
Dear Colleague:

How effective is the music program in your school? Is your music supervisor or specialist doing all that you think she (or he) should for the schools? If not, do you have some helpful suggestions?

This study is designed to permit you, the classroom teacher, the opportunity to make your thoughts known regarding the duties of the elementary music supervisor (or specialist). It is assumed that you do have certain opinions in this field and that you will not hesitate to make them known.

It is hoped that the results of this study will form a nucleus from which can be drawn a more satisfying and helpful plan of procedures for the prospective as well as the experienced music specialist.

When answering the accompanying questionnaire, please be assured that your answers will in no way be percussive—you are asked not to sign your name unless you feel it would be of some benefit. However, your earnest cooperation will be greatly appreciated and will be considered of the utmost importance in determining the effectiveness of this study. Thank you.

Lane D. Justus
School of Music
Montana State University
QUESTIONNAIRE

Section I: The Local Situation (Please encircle)

1. In which grade do you teach? 1 2 3 4 5 6

2. Do you have an elementary music supervisor in your school system? Yes No

3. If not, do you have a special music teacher who makes visitations and assumes instructional duties? Yes No

4. Do you teach your own music? Yes No

   (a) If not, does some other teacher in your building assume the music instructional duties in your class? Yes No

   (b) Do you use some type of musical activity at times other than the regular music period? Yes No

5. Is music taught in your own classroom? Yes No

6. State your musical training. considerable adequate little none

7. State your musical experience. considerable adequate little none

8. Evaluate your singing ability. excellent above average adequate inadequate

9. Evaluate your piano playing ability. excellent above average adequate inadequate

Section II: The Learning Process

Do you believe---

1. That the music supervisor should do the music teaching during visits to your class? Yes No

2. That the supervisor should only observe, later giving you any pertinent suggestions? Yes No

3. That a combination of teaching and observations with appropriate suggestions would be more helpful? Yes No
4. That the supervisor should assign special music seats to children for part singing only? Yes No

5. That the supervisor should assign special music seats for all singing activities? Yes No

6. That heterogenous seating be used for all singing activities? Yes No

7. That the supervisor should give you a detailed plan for your music teaching and expect you to adhere to it? Yes No

8. That guide sheets containing suggested goals, helps, and teaching procedures would be more beneficial than the plan in #7? Yes No

9. That the classroom teacher should decide what phase of the music instruction needs to be emphasized? Yes No

10. That children should remain in their own classroom for music? Yes No

11. That music should always be taught at the same time of day? Yes No

12. That the use of music should not be confined to the regular music period? Yes No

13. There must be a piano in any room where music is taught? Yes No

14. That each classroom must contain a phonograph? Yes No

15. That each classroom teacher must have and use her own pitch pipe? Yes No

16. That the music for your class should be confined to singing? Yes No

17. That instrumentalists in your classroom should have the opportunity to perform along with the singing activities of your class? Yes No

18. That some form of "dancing" or bodily movement should be a part of the music program of the public schools? Yes No
19. That the fundamentals of music should be taught in the elementary school?  Yes  No

20. That syllables should be taught as devices for learning music reading in the elementary school?  Yes  No

21. That numbers should be used as devices for music reading?  Yes  No

22. That music will teach itself without the aid of devices?  Yes  No

23. That time should be made available for children to receive instrumental training during school hours?  Yes  No

24. That special "all-city" or "all-system" performing groups have a place in the music program of the schools?  Yes  No

25. That select vocal ensembles, small groups, and grade school glee clubs play an important role in the school program?  Yes  No

26. That classroom teachers should assist in the preparation and presentation of musical programs outside of school time?  Yes  No

Other suggestions:__________________________________________
__________________________________________
__________________________________________

Section III: Teacher Training Duties

1. Should all visitations by the supervisor be scheduled?  Yes  No

2. Would occasional unannounced visits by the supervisor be helpful?  Yes  No

3. Should suggestions from the supervisor always be written and presented to the individual teacher concerned?  Yes  No

   (a) If so, would you like a conference with the supervisor also?  Yes  No
(b) If so, should the conference take place immediately following the visit? Yes No

(c) Should time be made available for the conference to be held after you receive the written suggestions? Yes No

4. Should regular informal meetings between the supervisor and classroom teachers be held (as opposed to the plan in question #3)? Yes No

(a) If so, should suggestions from the supervisor be brought up and discussed at that time? Yes No

(b) Should such meetings be held after school hours? Yes No

(c) Should attendance be required of all classroom teachers at such meetings? Yes No

5. Should conferences between supervisor and individual teacher be the only means of presenting suggestions (as opposed to the plans in questions #3 and #4)? Yes No

(a) If so, should this become a part of every visitation period? Yes No

6. Should demonstration lessons for classroom teachers be a part of the job of the supervisor? Yes No

(a) If so, should they be given in a group meeting after school hours? Yes No

(b) Should attendance be required of all classroom teachers at these demonstrations? Yes No

7. Should the supervisor select certain teachers from within your school system to present demonstrations in areas where they have done exceptional work? Yes No

(a) If so, should they be given after school hours? Yes No

(b) Should attendance be required of all classroom teachers? Yes No
8. Should music specialists from outside your school system be imported to give teaching demonstrations and to conduct clinics?  
   (a) If so, should they be given after school hours?  
   (b) Should attendance be required of all classroom teachers?  

9. Should the supervisor determine who should teach the music in each classroom?  

Other suggestions:
__________________________________________
__________________________________________
__________________________________________

Section IV: The Supervisor and the Community

1. Should elementary pupils be taken from the community to perform elsewhere?  

2. Should the musical activities of the school be open to observation by the parents at all times?  

3. Should an "open house" be instituted at which time any adult of the community can observe the music instruction?  

4. Should elementary school pupils be asked to take part in musical programs outside of school time?  

5. Should select musical organizations from grade schools be asked to perform for special civic and professional groups in the community?  

6. Is the supervisor obligated to accept invitations to speak to outside groups regarding the music program of the schools?  

Other Suggestions:
__________________________________________
__________________________________________
__________________________________________
Section V: The Research Duties of the Supervisor

Should the supervisor—

1. Issue periodic informative bulletins relative to recent trends and practices in music education? Yes No

2. Experiment with new materials and methods of instruction which might appear to be better than those in use? Yes No
   
   (a) If so, should the experiments always be used with the same classroom group? Yes No
   
   (b) If not, should the experiments be rotated between all available relatively similar classes? Yes No
   
   (c) If not, should the "ideal" class be formed from representatives of all classrooms? Yes No

3. Be responsible for the acquisition of a central record library? Yes No

4. Assume the responsibility for the acquisition of pertinent library and resource materials? Yes No

5. Arrange for authorities in the field of music education to speak to the local school personnel periodically? Yes No

Other Suggestions: ____________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________