Trends in group vocational guidance 1900 to 1952

Kathleen E. Walker

The University of Montana

1952

Let us know how access to this document benefits you.
Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd

Recommended Citation
Walker, Kathleen E., "Trends in group vocational guidance 1900 to 1952" (1952). Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers. 4860.
https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd/4860

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at ScholarWorks at University of Montana. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at University of Montana. For more information, please contact scholarworks@mso.umt.edu.
THE TRENDS IN
GROUP VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE, 1900 TO 1952

by

KATHLEEN E. WALKER
B.S., Illinois Institute of Technology, 1949

Presented in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts

MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY
1952
This thesis has been approved by the Board of Examiners in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Chairman of the Board of Examiners

Dean of the Graduate School

Date
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>THE SETTING FOR GROUP VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>THE NEED FOR GROUP VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>THE BEGINNINGS OF GROUP VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>CURRICULAR VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>WAR AND PEACE: FACTORS AFFECTING VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII.</td>
<td>RESEARCH AFFECTING VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII.</td>
<td>EFFECT OF CONFLICTING PHILOSOPHIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX.</td>
<td>OTHER FACTORS AFFECTING VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X.</td>
<td>RECENT DEVELOPMENTS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BIBLIOGRAPHY | 104 |
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

During the last fifty years, vocational guidance was founded, acclaimed, questioned, criticized, and defended. Group guidance was one of the techniques in question. Now, when educators are again citing the need for helping youth adjust to the working world, the query suggests itself: Is group guidance effective? In search of data as aids in answering the question, this study reviews the beginnings of group vocational guidance, the factors which affected the movement, and the recent developments. Since many volumes have been published on vocational guidance, a search was made first to determine to what extent the trends in group vocational guidance have been investigated.

Review of Related Literature

John Brewer, in his _History of Vocational Guidance_, which was published in 1942, traced the development of vocational guidance as a whole. It included guidance for all age groups by representatives of all agencies—school, church, industry, government, welfare organizations, civic groups, and commercial guidance centers. It was especially

---

1John S. Brewer, _History of Vocational Guidance_, (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1942)
concerned with the activities of the National Vocational Guidance Association. It brought his 1918 publication, The Vocational Guidance Movement, up to date. Since Brewer was on the defensive, he did not present the entire picture of vocational guidance in either volume. His approach was positive rather than questioning.


Many books present the principles of vocational guidance. Among the most recent are Occupational Information: Development and Application by Caroll L. Shortle, Principles of Guidance by Arthur J. Jones, Group Methods of Studying Occupations by Mildred Lincoln Billings, and Occupations, a Basic Course for Counselors by Walter J. Greenleaf. Their approach is one of methodology rather than development or trends.

This preliminary investigation did not unearth any study which traced and accounted for the trends in group vocational guidance.

Procedures

Principles and practices of vocational guidance have filled numerous journals and books; there have also been a limited number of research studies. Starting
with the 1900 edition of School and Society, any writing pertaining to group vocational guidance in any available publication was reviewed. The bounty of material obtained was classified according to the purpose of this study.

First, the original setting and need for vocational guidance was described and the varying group methods were outlined. Then the factors, both positive and negative, which affected guidance were enumerated. The final step was to determine the recent principles and practices.

Some of the practices, both past and present, were described in detail. These descriptions may serve as a practical reference for group guidance leaders.

The assumption was made that the ideas and methods that were published were representative of the actual trends. The vocabulary of the writings was also accepted, though terms such as "counseling" and "guidance" often proved ambiguous.

Delimitation of the Problem

Group vocational guidance is the emphasis of this study. But, individual guidance and vocational education were so closely related to group guidance that they received some attention.

There is not a commonly accepted definition of group guidance nor an acceptance of the term itself.  

But, since this and other ambiguous terms in vocational guidance were factors affecting the trends, the meaning is not here defined.
CHAPTER II

THE SETTING FOR GROUP VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE, EARLY 1900's

Industrial

The early 1900's climaxed more than a half century of industrial revolution. The craftsman's product had been replaced by large-scale industrial production. Individual proprietorship and the partnership had given way to the corporation; the strongest corporations had developed vast monopolistic powers.

Along with the outmoding of the craftsmen and small business was the decline of the farmer. With the hope that regular wages would raise their standard of living, farmers flocked to the cities seeking industrial employment. They crowded into meager housing in order to be near untried, unknown work. 1

Besides the nation's own displaced population, (the craftsmen, small business proprietors, and farmers) the country was deluged by job-seeking immigrants.

The industrial revolution had promised jobs for all, but this surge of non-directed workers resulted in a maze of problems. The main problems were ones of low

pay, long hours, unhealthy working conditions, and insecurity.

Since it was no longer possible to start a business on a few hundred dollars, workers could not forget their problems by aspiring to proprietorship levels. Consequently they acted on the principle that they could not rise out of the working class. For forty years they had propagated a labor movement based on the workers' role in the new industrial order. By means of political bases, collective bargaining, the strike, and the boycott, they had attempted to ease their problems: "to secure for the workers the full enjoyment of the wealth they create, and sufficient leisure in which to develop their intellectual, moral, and social faculties." 2

Violent and costly strikes for higher wages and shorter hours had become widespread. In 1900, with the business cycle in its prosperity phase, there was further expansion of labor organizations.

Individual Vocational Guidance

While organized labor had fought for better working conditions, another group of problems was untouched: the problems of the prospective workers. With the industrial organization becoming ever more intricate, how could youth, immigrants, and farmers find occupational

placement? Ideally a worker should hold a job in which he is capable and interested, but the job seeker had no basis for evaluating either the new occupations or his own qualifications.

With industry controlling the workman by limiting his individual choice and his leadership, vocational guidance came to the foreground. Frank Parsons is credited with founding the movement. After a systematic study of occupations, character, and abilities, he wrote the book, Choosing a Vocation.

Parsons was a bit too sure in his conclusions—too prescriptive in what he told the individuals who consulted him. Bound up with this difficulty is the further fact that the "self-analysis" plan he used is over-elaborated and dependent upon a false psychology. His emphasis on choosing a vocation led many people to the belief that this is the sole function of vocational guidance.

His book did not cover school guidance, placement, or follow-up.

He began his vocational counseling in the Civic Service House in Boston in 1901. His vocational guidance work was furthered by organizing the Breadwinners' Institute (for aiding immigrants), and the Vocational Bureau of Boston.

The Vocational Bureau established vocational guidance in the Boston schools and training courses for the teachers. In 1910, the Bureau held the First National Conference on Vocational Guidance.

---

At this conference, the initial aims of vocational guidance were set forth. One aim was to develop methods and materials by which public schools could fit graduates for the work they were likely to do. It would be to the business man's interest to conserve youth's energy by expert vocational counseling at the critical period before the boys and girls left school. Professor Paul H. Hanus warned that vocations should not be "prescribed", thus curtailing the opportunity for growth and happiness.

Dr. Felix Adler went so far as to say that the whole of life stemmed on vocational training, and that the whole education system would be changed for the better when the vocational system took root.

Dr. Richard C. Maclaurin summarized the aims as follows:

Vocational guidance, as I see it, is to be of unestimable value because it will disclose what we need in vocational schools. It should drive out the undesirable in industry just as we drive out the undesirable citizen. We must make modern industry a part of the liberal education so as to give a basis for vocational choice. Vocational guidance will react on all of our vocational systems, the industrial quite as much as the un-industrial.

The setting and beginning of vocational guidance have been described. In relatively few years, the

5 Ibid.
6 Ibid.
movement spread throughout the nation; industry, church, clubs, and schools all took responsibility. Guidance was in great demand, and more was dealt out than vocational information would warrant. Guidance writings abounded, but like Frank Parsons, the authors were over-confident. Just as guidance surpassed guidance information, writing surpassed research.

Guidance in the public schools was closely related to vocational education. One view held that guidance was an outgrowth of vocational education; another held that it was vocational education's guide. Understanding the development of vocational education can clarify the relationship.

Vocational Education

While the majority of educational literature of the early 1900's was concerned with teaching English, mathematics, and the classics, there was a growing emphasis on the new, German-imported, vocational education. The classicist charged that, with vocational education, the cultural values would be neglected; the "progressives" declared that classical education neglected 90 per cent of the high school aged youth.

In 1900, Charles Thurber asked "Where Are the High School Boys?"\(^7\) He pointed out that boys accounted

for only 42.36 per cent of the high school population in
the United States. In order to hold the boys, it was
necessary to show them that high school education would
pay, and by "pay", Thurber meant financially. This
motivation, he thought, could be accomplished by manual
training, preferably in separate schools, and commercial
courses. His philosophy was more motor training and more
motive training.

Seven years later, 1907, Thurber cited the nine
agricultural states which required agricultural courses
in the high schools, and he challenged the industrial
states to do the same for industry. He thought that
industrial education should be practical and close to the
shop; it could thereby spare the slow upgrading of the
worker.

W.B. Hunter held that schools should be so viva-
lized that graduates could be of immediate service to
business men. The prevailing professional minded education
produced boys who no longer wanted trades; they wanted
to "dress up and shine". By emphasizing the financial
gains resulting from mechanical training, he believed
that the boys would be better directed and economic demand
would be better satisfied.

Vocational education was opposed by unions and

8Charles Thurber, "Industrial Education", School

9W.B. Hunter, "The Fitchburg Plan of Industrial
Education", The School Review, XVIII, (March, 1910),
pp. 169-74.
union leaders, for high school graduates would thereby receive too quick advancement and social preference.

Besides the unions, vocational education had other critics, though the criticism stemmed from contrasting reasons. A typical view was expressed by Ernest Henderson:

1. Vocational education encourages differentiation before the child has revealed or discovered himself.
2. It initiates premature specialization.
3. Since the young boy isn't yet motivated by practical need, it wastes learning time.

He felt it was more important for the boy to understand economic interdependence than to master manual skills, though he did not expand on how this understanding was to be attained.

Another critic, Harlow S. Person, conceded that vocational education was a means of lowering the drop-out rate, but held that the emphasis should continue on the general course. This would be accomplished by organizing separate vocational schools for only those students who were unable to continue the general courses. While the vocational students would receive a brief, distinctly practical course, of training, prestige factors would induce students to stay out of it.

---

Another view contested that vocational education would lower the drop out rate; that the lack of school interest in the child came from inadequate knowledge and insufficient preparation on the part of teachers. The rapid increase in education for livelihood therefore seemed alarming. By 1912, the talk of what subjects would best serve the children thereafter was uppermost at all education meetings; this talk crystallized into vocational courses and proposed legislation. Duane Mowry reflects his disapproval:

But is not a broad and generous culture vastly more important to the community than mere reaching to gather shekels which in fairness and justice belong to a less fortunate, because not so shrewd, brother?  

Contrasting Mowry's view, Robert A. Woods states:

The apparent smallness and narrowness which seem to go with vocational training, with having the teacher apply himself to the guidance of young people vocationally, is all in the appearance. Actually it is the fulcrum through which the teacher can accomplish marvelous results, which have previously been impossible to him, not only of youths' economic opportunities, but of their souls as well.

Even as supporters acclaimed vocational education, they neglected the phase of the vocational choice of the student. Nor did the trade schools have a method of selecting their students.

---

12 Duane Mowry, "Vocational or Cultural Education—Which?", Education, XXXII, (February, 1912) p. 374.

Summary

The early 1900's saw the climax of the industrial revolution, but only the beginnings of the vocational guidance which the new industrial order necessitated. Vocational training in the public schools, too, was in its initial stages.

Favorable opinions held that vocational education would: (1) hold the boys in school, (2) spare slow industrial upgrading, (3) result in financial gains for both the boy and the business man, and (4) be the setting for full and general learning.

Opposing opinions held that vocational education would (1) be unfair to the adult workers of industry, (2) initiate premature specialization, (3) waste learning time because of immaturity of students, (4) fail to lower the drop-out rate, for drop-outs are caused by poor teaching, and (5) diminish moral and cultural values.

Vocational education was concerned mainly with the boys and primarily with the retarded and drop-out boys. The concept of vocational education as general life adjustment of both boys and girls had not yet come to focus.
CHAPTER III

THE NEED FOR GROUP VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE, EARLY 1900'S

Personality Factor in Industry

The emphasis of industrial education had always been to train children in order to save American industry. The keynote of the joint conference of vocational guidance and industrial education in 1911, however, differed from previous years. The emphasis was that the children's entry into industry be happy, and that to prepare for this happy entry, the children should develop an early vocational interest.

Lack of Educational Motivation

Charles W. Eliot deplored a lack of vocational motivation in the public schools.

Multitudes of American children, taking no interest in their school work, or seeing no connection between their studies and the means of later earning a good livelihood, drop out of school far too early of their own accord, or at least offer no effective resistance to the desire of unwise parents that they stop study and go to work.1

He further observed that professional and commercial students and apprentices were interested because they had chosen their career. Yet, he felt that occupational

choice should be postponed till the student was past sixteen, for too early a choice would have insufficient basis. Typical bases for students' choices were the parents' occupations, personal observations, and recommendations by the teacher.

Elliot was aware of the problems of occupational choice, but he made no recommendations as to classes or other group meetings on occupational information.

The High Drop-Out Rate

Erville B. Woods\(^2\) cited that only one-fourteenth of the boys who went to second grade ever graduated from high school. Half the male population was not carried far enough to see, much less understand, vocational opportunities. In their preference for an occupation, the boys were guided by whim, contagious admiration, and ambition divorced from sound reason. But, their actual occupational choice was determined by the first opening in local industry. Therefore, Woods believed that every boy, before leaving elementary school, should be given an accurate idea of the nature of the principal kinds of human work, the qualities demanded, the preparation required, the rewards offered, and the opportunities for usefulness afforded.

Frederick J. Allen analyzed the need for vocational guidance as follows: fifty per cent of the children leave school by the end of sixth grade, 25 per cent more by the end of eighth, and 50 per cent of those left before school graduation. Vocational guidance would be a force to keep them profitably in school and facilitate leaving under conditions favorable to worthwhile employment.

Further necessity for guidance resulted because the American family was less capable than formerly of giving children vocational direction, the public school had had difficulty keeping pace with the changing needs, and society at large had failed to understand and take responsibility. By giving careful study to problems of occupational life, vocational guidance could offset false methods of advertisement, phrenology, selfishness, and ignorance. Allen recommended that any plan of vocational education and guidance include a study of common occupations and their problems.

The Allure of High Wages

In reviewing the Third National Conference on Vocational Guidance, 1913, Frederick G. Bonser noted that hundreds of jobs offered wages alluringly high for

---


boys in their early teens (16, 18, or even 20 cents an hour). But, these high paying jobs also offered a "blind alley".

In 1920, seven years later, the Department of Labor found that a million children between fourteen and sixteen left school each year to become wage earners. Only a few received employment advice from their parents, for their parents did not know of job openings or job advantages. Therefore, nine-tenths of these youngsters went into "blind alley" jobs which required no skill. Frequently they drifted from job to job, so becoming unstable.

Drifting

The history of most men, wrote J.B. Davis, was one of drifting. That was because, as youths, they had not been inspired with the necessity for an aim in life. Schools had formerly held out the educated ideal as a means to professional careers; they had ignored the necessity of preparation in other careers. When the schools responded with rapidly growing curricula, the problem still existed. Once specializing in a field, the subject matter diverged so widely that the student could not turn back. Davis held that the remedy to drifting would

be early and continued vocational guidance.

After interviewing ten successful though middlec
class men, Merill R. Lott drew the following conclusions:
(1) Education was a most important factor in success, and
those who started without had to make it up. To be
effective, education had to be planned along definite
lines. (2) A careful analysis of their boyhood abilities
and aptitudes, together with wise, vocational counseling,
would have hastened their progress to their present
positions. (3) Without a definite life-work goal, there
was hesitation, uncertainty, and wasted effort. All of
these became sources of regret later on in life.

The role of schooling, thought Lott, was to help
the boy and girl find the field in which his abilities
might lie. "So let every boy and girl make a choice of
work early in life, plan for it, and stick to it through
thick or thin."

Deficient Occupational Information

H.D. Kitson felt that the vocational guidance
movement had grown too popular without its having a
sufficient backing of vocational information. The first

---

7 Merrill R. Lott, "When Is a Job a Real Job?" Educational Review, LXX, (November, 1925), pp. 201-10.
function should be to give information on a vast number of the commoner occupations in order that choice would be based on real knowledge, not a mere guess.

Several studies of boys' vocational aspirations showed that too large a proportion chose the professions. J.B. Sears' study noted that boys tend to choose occupations other than their own fathers'. Though they were stable, nineteen of the fathers' sixty occupations were not desired by any boy.

According to John M. Brewer, even the boys in technical schools did not know for what they were preparing; some even thought it was training for electrical engineering, law, or medicine. Seniors in commercial courses didn't know the commercial pursuits. Therefore, he advocated that the discovery of the vocational world would be best facilitated by providing classes in occupational information.

The technical schools failed to have any type of selective guidance. When a student presented himself for a specific form of preparation, nothing was done to see that he was the right individual for that preparation.

---

10J.B. Sears, "Occupations of Fathers and Occupational Choices of 1,039 Boys in Grades Seven and Eight in Oakland Schools," School and Society, I, (April, 1915) pp. 750-56.

Misdirected Vocational Education

Another need was to serve as a guide for vocational education.

Vocational guidance, when rightly understood and adequately developed, serves to secure more effective vocational education at a lower cost to the community. It is serving the purpose of developing a twentieth century curriculum to serve a twentieth century social and economic situation. It is at once a guide and a challenge, becoming an essential part of the vocational education program.

Gearing schools to the demands of factories and trades did not solve the problem, for as many boys and girls were employed in other fields. Since most would never need high skills, the school's mediation role was to contribute a broad, general training in dealing with people and industrial problems—a more specific notion of just what work meant.

Economic Complexities

Vocational guidance, if based on sound research, could also inform children on the complexities of occupational life. It could simplify the principles of economics and sociology. It could explain overhead, costs of distribution, wages, unemployment, capital, business cycles, taxation, and the development of the labor movement.

---

Summary

The need for vocational guidance came with the need for many other reforms. The conditions which, hypothetically, vocational guidance should remedy were: (1) unhappy work entry, (2) lack of educational motivation, (3) the high drop-out rate, (4) allure of high wages, (5) blind alley futures, (6) drifting, (7) deficient occupational information, (8) misdirected vocational education, and (9) economic complexities.
CHAPTER IV

THE BEGINNINGS OF GROUP VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

While individual vocational guidance was still in its initial stages, there was a felt need for guidance on a larger scale—a need for group vocational guidance. As evidenced from the different plans from many parts of the country which developed, this need was general. Chapter V will describe the many ways in which guidance was brought into the regular curriculum. This chapter is concerned only with special classes in occupations.

Vocational Guidance Meetings

Believing that schools should at every opportunity relate to work, H.B. Wilson, principal at Decatur, Illinois, in 1907 met the last term seniors every Monday afternoon for vocation centered discussions. His aims were to contrast primitive and modern societies and their independence and dependence; to clarify the laws of society on the individual; and to discover job callings in the light of knowledge of open fields and labor demands.

A three month course of lectures for boys and

girls seeking to choose their careers was held Sunday nights at the civic Service House in Boston in 1908.

The lectures described professions, business, industrial work, special fields for women, and careers in art, music, and drama.

Occupational Information Course

W.A. Wheatly\(^2\) is credited with being the originator of the school course in occupations. His plan included the following: (1) A careful consideration of the importance of vocational information, (2) A detailed description of 80 or 90 professions, trades or occupations, and (3) Choosing and securing an occupation.

His method of presenting a unit on an occupation was to describe its industrial setting and its nature—its status and earnings. He then made a text book reading assignment for everyone. He felt a good text book so necessary that at one time he had postponed giving the course for two years in hopes of finding a satisfactory book. He also made special report and personal interview assignments. Regular class recitations on the unit were supplemented by reports, discussions, speakers, and tours.

Wheatly motivated class recitations with questions. Typical questions following a mechanical engineering unit were: Which of the three types of engineering studied

render society the greatest service? Which type is the most necessary to the community? Which work is most attractive? What qualifications, education, and special training are required? What high school subjects are prerequisites? What are the advantages or disadvantages in a cooperative school or shop course preparation? What summer work would be helpful? What is the difference between an expert machinist and a mechanical engineer?

Wheatly recommended this course as being practical everywhere, inexpensive, intrinsically interesting, and helpful in choosing life work. Also, it would give respect for all kinds of work; it convinced the student of the absolute necessity for thorough preparation, and held to the end of the high school course many who would otherwise drop.

Should we then apologize when we urge educators and the tax-paying public that this branch of vital human knowledge be given a place in our high schools, especially when it will require only as much time as commercial arithmetic or geography, or one-half as much as algebra, or, finally, one-eighth as much as Latin?3

Together with E.B. Cowin, Wheatly published a text book, Occupations, in 1916. They recommended the text for a half-year occupations course in the first or second year of high school. In their introduction, they made the following statement:

"... the method of surveying in a way the various occupations usually brings about a natural adjustment of the young man to his life career;"
and the reason for writing this text was the belief that similar results might quite readily be duplicated in other classrooms. 4

Each chapter contained numerous exercises, readings, and references. The purpose of the exercises was to localize the information.

Development of the Course

The 1913 guidance program of Cincinnáti included an eighth grade course in occupations, the purpose being to develop the life career motive. Occupational needs of the community and the interests of the class were considered first. The method was to use student reports (supplemented by teacher investigation), reading, and industrial excursions.

By 1915, Wheatly 5 reported that fifty American cities and towns were giving youth systematic vocational guidance. He advocated that this number be raised to 500 by 1917, and include all schools by 1920.

But, in practice many occupations courses were not of Wheatly's ideal. In the technical schools of Chicago, 1915, only the boys and girls who were over age but behind in school work were instructed in vocations. This practice tagged the course as being sub-standard.


5 W. A. Wheatly, op. cit., School Review.
John H. Brewer's opinion of the occupations course, or life-career class, continued enthusiastic in 1917. He held that no one force in vocational guidance was as effective. While not denying the advantages, or the difficulties, of other kinds of guidance, he felt that aiding the boy and girl to make decisions and solve fundamental social and civic problems was the more immediate way of spreading enlightenment and effecting results. Aptitudes, interests, and job openings would be considered before enrolling a student in a course. The children's occupational interests would be awakened. The class also provided a place to discuss future problems of adjusting to work; commercial graduates would no longer be dismayed by different equipment and social surroundings. Pre-engineering students would no longer expect outdoor work.

Since so many students dropped out before high school, Brewer recommended that occupations be a sixth grade course. He wanted the text books to be an adaptation of geography books, and reading assignments to be followed by written tests and discussions.

His warning was that at no time should the method be so practical as to tempt boys and girls to leave school. His teaching criteria was only that a successful, interested teacher have a course in vocational guidance. His stand for a separate occupational class was as follows:

There seems no reason why the complex world of occupations in which children are forced to make momentous decisions should not be studied as a separate subject resting on its own merits.\(^7\)

In 1926, Brewer\(^8\) reviewed the past year's growth of the occupations class. The work had spread to thousands of communities; at least one-fourth-million children had studied occupations. He added that this study was usually in the ninth-grade social studies; often it was included in English classes or industrial arts.

"Learning of occupational life is the most important agency in vocational guidance"\(^9\) stated Brewer. But, he warned that there was no quick method of learning. Vocational guidance entailed good teaching methods—adequate time, a course of study, trained teachers, texts, assigned lessons, outside study, class discussions, and measurement of achievement. Good teaching could be supplemented but not replaced by successful business men's talks, slides, and field trips.

Requiring life career classes in the junior high school, according to Frederick Schultz,\(^10\) could practically eliminate the child's ignorance of "things to be done for

\(^{7}\)Ibid., p.180.


a living. He felt that the junior high school was the first place where definite vocational guidance could be pursued. Though studies of interest at that grade level showed little permanence, he believed effective occupational choices should be made by the end of the seventh grade. Therefore, the counselor should show the child various occupational possibilities, collect individual record data, and even resort to psychological tests. "Without a doubt the problem of vocational guidance in the junior high school is the biggest problem in the educational arena today." 11

Schultz recommended that the course be taught by a teacher of some years of successful experience, who, besides being in full sympathy with the adolescent, had a broad comprehensive view of vocations, knowing where and how to secure the details.

The classes should be segregated with topics appropriate to each sex. Schultz pointed out that the girls' vocational guidance field had been more or less studiously avoided. Since most girls aspired to office work, he recommended trying to attract them to nursing, dressmaking, and assistant homemaking.

While plans for separate courses in occupations started before 1910, they were not adopted in many schools for several decades. In 1930, the Joliet, Illinois, high school reported offering two courses in occupations—

11Ibid., p.239.
one for boys and one for girls. It was an extra curricular subject which alternated days with physical education. The plan was to discuss one occupation each recitation period.

"Vocations and Industries", an experimental course of the civics department, was introduced into eight New York City high schools in 1930. Its aims were to teach young men and women "to find themselves" by a careful inventory of aptitude and abilities. It included discussion of present and future employment possibilities in virtually every field of endeavor.

As part of its revised curriculum, Chicago offered a career study course for the first time in 1939. It was a five-day-a-week course for seniors. To qualify for this course, the teacher must have had experience working with seniors, superior classroom teaching skill, a well adjusted personality, and preferably some guidance training such as psychology and vocations. His duties were to assemble student records, and, during the second semester, counsel each student individually.

As the popularity and use of the separate courses in occupations spread throughout the country, other plans, some conflicting, some parallel, also came to the fore. A.H. Edgerton viewed vocational guidance as being either individual guidance or an all-education process, neither phase of which could be accomplished through separate occupations courses.
Although a number of schools have successfully inaugurated separate credit courses in 'occupations', 'vocational information', 'vocational civics', and the like, there is some difference of opinion relative to the necessity of resorting to this practice where broad and flexible programs of enriched studies and vital experiences are offered, and suitable provisions are made for school counseling. Nevertheless, it will be noted that large numbers of these schools are continuing to offer such separate credit courses, either because of the necessity of meeting a period of reorganization and transition, or lack of feasibility of relieving one or more school representatives for individual counseling. 12

Summary

The expressed reasons for organizing separate courses in vocational guidance were to relate school life to work life, to help students choose their career, and to initiate the career motive. Most of the plans included a detailed study of many occupations; a few emphasized the general study of society. Methods of teaching the courses varied from the textbook, recitation, test procedure to the student propelled class activities. In the main, the course was placed at the junior-high level in order to reach early drop outs; it was given one semester for credit; and only boys were enrolled. In a few instances, however, it was given to seniors; it was an extra-curricular course, or girls were enrolled, either with the boys or in segregated classes. No professional requirements were usually set up for the teacher. Teaching experience, sympathy, a well adjusted personality, and a

course in guidance or psychology were all that was specified.
Besides helping to choose an occupation, the course was
claimed to reduce school drop-outs, to effect an adjust-
ment to career problems, and to create a respect for
all of work life.
CHAPTER V
CURRICULAR VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

If separate courses in occupations were thought to be ineffective, too expensive, or too much of an innovation, other plans for group vocational guidance were developed. Instead of introducing a new course into the curriculum, vocational guidance was introduced into an already existing course.

Vocational Guidance through Manual Arts

The first systematic guidance in the schools was through manual training. In 1894, George A. Merrill of San Francisco worked out the following plan of exploratory and try-out courses in industrial arts:

1. Two years of sample exercises drawn from simple work in each of the trades taught by the school, with about half of the time given to such studies as English, civics, math, and science.
2. Study of the individual followed by counseling.
3. Choice by the pupil of a specific trade.
4. Two years of preparation for a trade, including related technical studies.
5. Placement at work, and follow-up.

While there was no systematic study of occupational information and no person designated as a counselor, it was a vocational guidance plan. The method was to have sample projects exploring several specific trades in order

---

to choose a vocation. Vocational education was the emphasis, however, with guidance being only incidental.

By 1906, the realization came that the predominant manual training was unrelated to the skills demanded in industry. So, the courses were converted to industrial arts, a preliminary to vocational education. Here again, the purpose was to discover vocational abilities, not to explore the field of occupations.

M.N. Stratton\(^2\) organized a plan for rotating the boys among the various shops: printing work, metal work, electric work, woodwork, and cement work. The shops were on a practical productive level. Each boy in the seventh and eighth grade had a course in each shop. When he reached the ninth grade, he had to select one shop in which to specialize. The industrial arts group was segregated from the rest of the junior-high though they spent one half of their time in regular academic work.

Another plan for guidance through exploratory activities was devised by Robert H. Rodgers\(^3\) for the Milwaukee Vocational School. Home mechanics and related problems in occupations were explored in the seventh grade, the building trades in the eighth, and the metal trades in the ninth.

\(^2\)Ibid., p. 127.

Besides discovering vocational abilities, discussion of vocational problems was included. The plan for discussion was (1) the function of the occupation, (2) the importance of the occupation, (3) conditions of employment, (4) hygiene of the occupation, (5) economic conditions, (6) entrance requirements, (7) labor demand, (8) mental and physical prerequisites, and (9) opportunities for advancement. It was pointed out that eleven million men in the United States were engaged in manufacturing and mechanics, and that 70 per cent of these were in seven trade groupings: metal, building, textile, lumber, food, shoe, and printing. Thus, besides giving exploratory opportunities, Rodger's plan gave an overview of industrial and mechanical problems and labor demand. The required teacher training was not specified.

"Prevocational" education was started by Anna L. Burdick in 1914.

Prevocational courses which aim to give an occupational round of experience rather than skill, as a means of self-discovery are a most valuable factor in vocational guidance.4

Vocational Guidance in Social Studies

The committee on social studies believes that education as a whole should take account of vocational needs and should contribute to the preparation of the youth for an intelligent choice of vocation and for efficiency in it. As for the ninth year study now under consideration, the committee

is here interested in its vocational guidance aspect only as an incident to the broader social and civic training of youth. If it can be made to contribute anything to his guidance toward a wise choice of vocation and intelligent preparation for it, it is that much gain.  

The social studies committee felt that it was an essential quality of the good citizen to be self supporting and also contribute to the world's progress. But, its main stand for recommending the subject of occupations was to further social efficiency rather than personal success. Thus the foregoing quotation, which ranks vocational guidance as a possible by-product of social studies,  

It was recommended that the social studies unit dealing with occupations be taught in the ninth grade, where it would have a larger audience than at a higher level. Where ninth grade social studies were required, all students would be exposed to vocational information. The most effective approach would be through the examination of occupations and industries in which pupils had direct interest—either through predilection, parents, or local importance.  

Vocational Guidance through English  

Jesse B. Davis developed a plan whereby vocational guidance would be a function of the English curriculum. He gave convincing reasons for his plan of vocational guidance.  


6Jesse B. Davis, Vocational and Moral Guidance, (Boston: Ginn & Co., 1914)
First, since English is a required subject throughout school, it would reach all pupils. Second, the study of occupations would supply the subject for oral and written composition—a dearth of many English courses. Third, it would be a subject for serious thought.

His last point, one challenged by critics, was that the vocational study would be a substitute for classic mythology, classic lore, and history of English literature. He qualified this point, however, by adding that the teacher could lead the students to culture by so starting with their present, non-cultural interests.

They come from homes of toil, of little leisure, and of less culture. They have no time to lose, and every lesson must have its application to present needs.  

Davis outlined suggested vocational theme topics, discussion topics, and reading materials for the English course. This course of study covered grades seven through twelve.

The purpose of the seventh grade work was to arouse the ambition of the pupil. Typical topics were "The kind of person I should like to be" and "What I will do when I grow up."

In eighth grade, the emphasis was on the value of an education; some of the topics were "Blind alley occupations" and "The advantages of going to high school." So, linking future success with high school education was

\[\text{Ibid., p.25.}\]
a device for lowering the predominating drop out after eighth grade graduation.

Character analysis was the aim of the ninth grade, and it was to be accomplished through writing on "My natural ability" and "Why, I should succeed".

The tenth grade course attempted to classify occupations and relate individual abilities to them. This study was climaxed by each pupil making a detailed study of one vocation.

The topics of the eleventh grade dealt with specific preparation for a vocation, such as "In what institution of higher education should I continue my education?" and "How may I continue my education if I do not go to college?"

The final units covered vocational, social, and civic ethics. Among the suggested topics were "The special qualities of character and special abilities required in my chosen vocation", "To what extent am I indebted to the social interest of others?" and "The benefit to be derived from belonging to a civic improvement association."

Besides the regular schedule of themes and required reading, Davis recommended supplementary projects. These were (1) free reading periods in a library equipped with vocational material, (2) vocational excursions, (3) stereoptican and moving picture projections, and (4) interesting speakers.
While Davis mentioned that the average teacher has little opportunity to observe or to know from experience much about the vast fields of labor into which her pupils go, he did not specify any requirements which the English staff should meet before teaching vocations.

He also stated that the time spent on vocations should be left to the teacher; the study should not be pushed past spontaneous interest. He did not mention how, with such variable factors, the school could evaluate their vocational guidance services.

Lester W. Bartlett⁸ devised another plan for vocational guidance in English. Activities resembling the specific occupations were introduced into the classroom. Thus, it was the English of the vocation, not about it.

Vocational Guidance in the Homeroom

The homeroom's original purpose of providing desks and taking attendance soon grew to include individual reports, discipline, daily announcements, and parent interviews. Then it further expanded to educational functions—education for citizenship, character, and educational and vocational guidance.

While all teachers were not good guides, neither were they good classroom teachers. Therefore, J.B. Davis⁹

---

⁸Brewer, op. cit., p. 146.

stated that the teachers must be taken as they were. He hoped, through in-service training and more careful teacher selection in the future, to build up a faculty of counselors of youth who were awake to the opportunities for character training and vocational guidance in the homeroom activity period.

Davis listed four guidance functions of the homeroom teacher: (1) Initiate group conferences for free discussion, (2) Confer with the students individually, (3) Aid their choice of high school courses, (4) Refer students to the department head, dean, principal, or to an outside agency for special counsel.

E.D. Allen traced the development of homeroom guidance from a different approach; The school principal delegated some of his guidance work first to the dean and counselor and then to the homeroom teachers. Since there was a need for guidance for all students, but since it was too expensive on an individual basis, Allen thought homeroom guidance was a step in the right direction, even though the staff was not specialized. The homeroom guidance would include the study of educational and vocational opportunities, and individual abilities and interests. This guidance would be charged to instruction, and integral part of education, rather than to overhead.

---

In 1925, Marie McNamara\textsuperscript{11} of New Haven, Connecticut, began an intensive attempt at guidance through the home rooms of the junior high school. She carefully prepared lesson plans and demonstrated them for the teachers; then she supervised the guidance presentations. The results were felt to be favorable.

John Brewer noted that the homeroom was perenially used for all "extras". For most homerooms there were no vocational guidance lesson plans or supervision. Consequently, all teachers were assigned to teaching technical information for which they were unprepared.

Such a plan is convenient in that no disturbance in the present curriculum is necessary and therefore avoids the unpleasantness of faculty discussion as to what studies are most (or least!) worthwhile.\textsuperscript{12}

Assembly Programs and Career Conferences

The easiest method of "vocational guidance" was to invite representatives of business and industry to speak at all-school assemblies. While the speakers were able to impart worthwhile information, many times they gave a distorted picture. D.W. Horton\textsuperscript{13} recommended that the speaker be given an outline of the purposes his

\textsuperscript{11}\textit{Ibid.}, p.61.
\textsuperscript{12}\textit{Brewer, op. cit.}, p.124.
talk was to cover. Most speakers represented the professions; seldom the trade or laboring occupations. The assemblies generated enthusiasm, but were a questionable teaching technique, for the students' written reports of the assemblies were full of inaccuracies.

According to H. C. Krebs, speakers were a valuable guidance tool in rural schools. The farm child had contact only with farmers and teachers; yet he should learn of other occupations. But, Krebs did not feel rural teachers, especially young girls, were qualified to undertake this work. Therefore, he thought it was the job of the supervising principal to give talks and get speakers.

A more intensive attempt at vocational guidance was the career, or vocations, day. I. R. Kraybill describes one school's program. At a general assembly in the morning, the guest speaker, an important representative of business, gave the general requirements and opportunities in business for the non-college boy or girl. In the afternoon the students were grouped according to occupational interests. The fields represented were clerical, retail selling, banking, beauty culture, printing, electrical repair, postal service, automotive mechanics, insurance, household service, drafting, building trades,

---


dressmaking, and metal working. At each discussion table, an experienced consultant described his work and answered the students' questions.

Though assemblies and career days presented an authentic source of occupational information, it was often limited in scope and unrealistic in approach. Such limitations were cautioned:

The purpose in having an outside speaker in the guidance conference is to give the students first-hand information about a particular occupation. The speaker's aim is to present facts as fairly as possible about the working field which he represents, rather than to boost his vocation. It is not the object to attract students to the occupations by an appeal to the romantic side of the work. The speaker should bring with him the impression of success, thereby offering inspiration as to the value of preparation for something worth while.

Another limitation was a lack of student interest. Brewer\(^1\) cites a New England high school questionnaire on which 400 seniors favored vocational assemblies. After all arrangements were made, very few students attended.

**Extra-Curricular Activities**

A growing theory was that vocational guidance could be accomplished through extra-curricular activities. Some schools even required that every pupil be an active member of at least one club.


Nora E. Dodson enumerated ways in which clubs would reveal vocational possibilities. Art clubs, instead of the painting and sculpture professions, should emphasize costume design, dressmaking, millinery, window-decorating, and advertising. Social-welfare clubs should lead to Red Cross or charity organization occupations, foreign-language clubs to teaching or trade, music clubs to teaching or directing, and science clubs to electrical trades. Being on the school publications staff was a step towards journalism, printing, or business. Home-economics clubs prepared girls for their ultimate profession. Vocational clubs took the place of curricular vocational guidance with vocational reports, industrial excursions, and self-study.

Hazel M. Andrews claimed that vocational guidance came through dramatics, for she defined guidance as teaching poise and knowing how to dress.

In a series of articles on "Aspects of Vocational Guidance," T.M. Noon accredited vocational guidance to speech, literature, and manual arts clubs. He reasoned that speech was an asset in any occupation, literature

---

created forward looking thoughts, and manual activities were try-out experiences.

The concept of vocational guidance had expanded to include not only a general study of vocations and self-analysis, but all activities which pertain to specific occupations.

Vocational Guidance through Work Try-Out

In attempting to reduce the drop-out rate, New York experimented in a practical vocational training plan. After a junior high exploratory program of rotating shop courses, the students were given part-time employment in their chosen occupation. In 1918, there were 650 pupils who alternated weekly between high school and industry. A high school teacher (a coordinator) was chosen to link the work with school. Special courses were organized on each type of industry—manufacturing, commerce, and transportation. Besides being able to continue their education and gain work experience, the students were enabled to earn substantial wages.

In 1935, a work try-out scheme for high school students was reported in Lewistown, Montana. For spending three hours a day in some office, store, or shop, the students receive credit for their training and experience, but were not paid. The employers made out progress

Besides working and carrying one or two regular subjects, the students were enrolled in a "social economy" course. This course presented a general background in industrial history, economics, sociology, and current problems. The boys and girls did well in this training curriculum, and the school cost was low. "The real experience in an occupation is the most useful kind of guidance."  

Unusual Vocational Guidance Plans

Two plans, neither one of which gained wide use, were unique enough to warrant description.

One was the trade extension class, a 1921 experiment of the New York city Board of Education. It was really a vocational testing class for the purpose of choosing the high school course. Tests were given to groups of twenty eighth-grade girls for a period of two weeks.

During the first week the girls spent twenty-five hours in the commercial department where they tried the chief branches of the work—stenography, typing, filing, and switchboard operating. In each branch they were given some elementary instruction, some practice, and

---


a test. The teacher rated each girl good, fair, or poor in each field.

The second week was spent in the industrial department trying out sewing, running a power machine, and pasting. Here again the girls were rated.

The tests were criticized as being insufficient basis for vocational guidance, but acclaimed as being better than finding work blindly.

Another unusual method was to employ the services of commercial correspondence schools in providing vocational guidance and training in the public schools. With the vast number of occupations it was impossible for the high schools to offer training in all of them. By adding a correspondence-study department to the high school, all types of training could be offered. This department required a director, a room with desks, and a reference library. When the student had chosen his vocation, the director would purchase a vocational unit for him at the correspondence school. The work would be completed under the director's supervision.

Summary

Seven functions of the school became the mediums of group vocational guidance. These functions were regular courses in manual arts, social studies, and

English; the homeroom; assemblies and career days; extra-curricular activities; and the school-work program. Guidance methods included tryout experiences, written composition, group discussion, business and professional speakers, and work ethic lessons. In all cases, vocational guidance was only a side issue, and the teachers or speakers were not qualified to give an occupational overview. While the plans integrated school and work life, the lack of teachers trained in occupational information put vocational guidance on a non-professional level.
CHAPTER VI

WAR AND PEACE: FACTORS AFFECTING VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

Wars, depressions, booms, and discoveries may make marked and sudden changes in the size and distribution of the labor force. Every factor which affects labor in turn affects vocational guidance. Thus, to understand the past changes in vocational guidance, one must analyze the changes as they are related to wars, the general employment level, government action, and technological change.

World War I

War changed the whole occupational structure. State rights gave way to federalized, socialized control; labor asserted and maintained equal footing with capital; there was a rebirth of patriotism. W. Carson Ryan predicted the role of vocational guidance;

The problem of organizing human labor resources has suddenly emerged, like so many other social and economic problems, from the realm of the academic into that of the immediate and practical, largely through the stimulation of war necessity. Through selective training under the War Department, besides the vocational rehabilitation laws, the United States has undertaken, as never before, to control and distribute human services.1

---

Vocational guidance was necessarily bound with vocational training; the war demanded that boys be directed to work in shipyards and defense plants. Another problem was the adjustment of draftees to military life.

Guidance was also bound with vocational education. The Smith-Hughes Act of 1917 was a war measure; it provided federal aid for industrial, agricultural, and home economy training in the high schools. Brewer held that, if the writers had wanted, they could have given similar assistance to vocational guidance. ²

Besides changing the occupational structure and providing federal aid for vocational education, the war had yet another effect on vocational guidance. It was claimed that the data assembled from the army camps on the Army Alpha tests furnished occupational intelligence standards for vocational counseling and occupational selection.

The scores were so presented as to indicate that in all probability an individual must have an intelligence rating within the score range for achievement in the occupation, with the further probability that he should be above the score average to be sure of sufficient intellectual capacity for the occupation.³


Strong considered the work of the psychologists during the war. They had developed new short cuts and accomplishments in selecting and placing men where they would be of the greatest value, though not necessarily happiest. Strong thought this development should be modified and applied to education. (1) Education should concern itself with the personnel problem. It should study individual differences and train boys for the position which was best for themselves and for society. (2) Education should use intelligence and trade tests, rating scales, and expert interviewing. (3) Schools should develop scientific vocational guidance throughout education in connection with efficient public employment services. (4) The problem of morale should be studied. Teaching can to be happy in work is as important as the work itself.

New educational factors were as much a consequence of the war as were the profound changes in economic life, government, social life, art, and religion. Before the war, the ideal had been equal, universal education on a level that could be comprehended by all. The two new factors were: (1) There were individual hereditary differences in pupils, and (2) There was a difference in the stations they would occupy.

---


Let general intelligence tests be applied to all the pupils and a minimum requirement set up. Thus determine their academic or other schooling capacity. It was not many years until educators seriously objected to the war confidence in depending entirely upon tests for guidance. Viteles' stand was that intelligence tests had little significance in vocational guidance. He especially disdained using tests as the single criterion and that observed behavior, special abilities, and temperamental and character qualities were more important. He also warned that ability grouping in the schools, a career determinant phase of guidance, should not relieve the instructor's responsibility for student achievement.

Forbes thought the occupational-intelligence table more likely to mislead than to serve a useful purpose. A boy of superior intelligence who was working in the shops could work up to the top. A school teacher had a blind alley job. Therefore, a bright boy, looking for opportunity, should select the occupation from which the greatest number of superior persons had advanced, not choose his initial job on the basis of his intelligence.

---

6Ibid., p.191.


The Post-War 1920's

The aftermath of World War I was characterized by industrial strife and social unrest. Industry was able, during the first half of 1919, to absorb the 4,000,000 service men and 11,000,000 war workers who returned to the civilian labor force. But, there followed bitter strife between employers and employees over wage scales, and costly strikes and lockouts resulted.

A price recession spiraled during the early 1920's, and unemployment again became prevalent. Though the vocational guidance movement and classes in occupations were still expanding, their effectiveness was being questioned. Industrial technology and the occupational structure were changing more rapidly than were the guidance functions.

Scudder maintained that since one-third to one-fourth of the country's boys and girls would be forced to earn a living at machine processes of a routine nature, little vocational training was possible. He was apprehensive about the permanent arrival of the machine method, and he questioned the amount of monotony and routine a worker was able to take. His suggestion to the schools was that they take a more wholesome view of the person's importance in industry; a wider conception of his individual.

---

relationship to the organization he served and the commodity he produced.

Kawin expressed a similar point of view; the counselor felt an utter futility of trying to "guide" in the growing chaos of competitive society. Every year youngsters by the thousands poured out of the schools into factories, shops, and offices, to make up an army of restless, discontented workers that were the important factor in the labor problem.

The fault was not primarily theirs but the system. Either the industrial system into which these young people are being forced was not adapted to their inherent needs and capacities as human beings, or, if harmonious adjustment were possible, they were not being adequately prepared to make it by the education received in the schools, or by the vocational guidance that we were able to offer them.

The trouble with the vocational movement was that it had failed to face the basic facts of this conflict. The movement for vocational guidance and vocational education was founded on the theory that young people must be trained—educated—for industry. The great need for skilled workers was argued. . . .

And all the time the truth was that for at least a century the invention and introduction of automatic machinery had been steadily destroying the need for skilled workers in one industry after another. Machine production had superseded craftsmanship, and for the vast majority of workers, production was becoming more and more automatized. In the face of that, what a dramatic failure of a whole movement to deal with reality! What a contradiction of fact and theory! In our vocational work of the early days we talked a great deal about blind alley jobs, dead end occupations. Is the phrase one, which, without our realizing it, has come to describe the vocational movement itself? 10

The foregoing quotation is evidence that, even before

the big crash and depression of 1929, the original claims of vocational guidance, to match the worker and the occupation, were held in derision. In 1929, the esteemed value of vocational guidance went with the downward economic surge of the depression. By 1930, in order to survive, vocational guidance had need to change its emphasis.

The Changing Emphasis of Guidance

The opinion arose that intelligence and ability were less important than personality. Cunliffe\(^{11}\) believed that most workers failed not because they could not do the thing they were employed to do but because they did not want to do so because of a clash between personalities and jobs. The reasons for the failures were: (1) inability to get along with superiors, inferiors, and associates, (2) misunderstanding of the true nature of the vocational world, and (3) lack of an intelligent work philosophy.

Cunliffe laid the latter adjustment difficulties to the changes of the recent decades, including increased power and productivity, changes in consumer demand and distribution, the shift in the major occupational groups, and the new science and technology which applied to shop, store, and office situations.

Occupations which a few years before had seemed stable suddenly declined. Manufacturing, mining, and agriculture employed fewer workers. Even physicians and veterinarians found their services in low demand. Professions, trades, and assembly line occupations all required highly developed specialization and division of labor; but, since skills and jobs changed so rapidly, the objectives of vocational training and guidance were uncertain. Also, many jobs required only a short period of training, and this could best be done on the job. Thus, the problem of vocational guidance ceased to be one of making a single adjustment, or "Choosing an occupation". Instead, it became one of making a long series of adjustments.

There is failure for the man who is not shifty on his feet and can not change his plans and objectives to meet well every changing situation that confronts him.\footnote{bid., p. 676.}

Believing that guidance was basically a teaching problem, Cunliffe recommended that, in the teaching of occupations, personality adjustment be emphasized.

Link\footnote{Henry C. Link, "Wheat and Chaff in Vocational Guidance", Occupations, XII, (February, 1934), pp. 18-26.} held that educational guidance should supersede vocational guidance. He would reverse the procedure of choosing a specific occupation by studying occupational eccentricities and the economic system. Instead, he would start with the individual, his abilities, and his aptitudes. Vocational guidance would be incidental to
educational guidance.

The Depression

As unemployment became ever more widespread, the idea of vocational guidance assumed an irony. In speaking to a 1933 high school graduating class, Morgan predicted that relatively few of that year's million graduates would find places in occupational life; they would swell the army of the unemployed or take blind alley jobs or jobs sorely needed by older people. Since he believed that unemployment resulted from men's replacement by machines and the relative increase of adults in the population, he thought that the unemployment of children had become a permanent condition in American society.

The mounting insecurity of business and industry had its impact on rural life. No longer could the farm youth migrate in mass to the cities.

Suddenly like a huge avalanche damming waters of a river, the gates of the city became crowded, and many migrants returned to the land, thereby piling up youth on the farms.

During the depression only one-fifth as many as formerly migrated to the city. Of the ten-million rural youth, a third of them were not needed on the farms. Leaders in the farm field could see only one way out:

---


We must educate young folks on farms to live in cities because at least a half of those on farms today will migrate tomorrow.\textsuperscript{16}

But, the cities did not need them. Citypeople said, "Keep farm youth at home".

Melvin suggested a program in the rural schools whereby rural occupations would be emphasized. Data on rural occupations showed an increasing diversity including road work, electricity, plumbing, auto mechanics, and repair work. These occupations should be encouraged, for the facts, as Melvin faced them, were: (1) The volume of youth migration was not likely to be resumed. (2) Millions were destined to live in rural areas who would have migrated. (3) Agriculture would have no need for 25 to 40 per cent of the rural population that reached the productive age. Since even the effectiveness of city guidance was decreasing, he did not see how rural youth could be helped to compete with city youth.

The pessimistic outlook on employment opportunities was not the only reason for a vocational guidance decline. School budgets were cut, and in the program of retrenchment, the newer types of activities were eliminated first. Guidance functions were considered an embellishment.

On the other hand, Proffit\textsuperscript{17} observed that the depression brought to vivid consciousness the need of

\textsuperscript{16}\textit{ibid.}

\textsuperscript{17}Maris M. Proffit, "Guidance", \textit{School Life}, XIX, (June, 1934), p.209.
planning for the selection and distribution of workers in the different fields of employment, and that consciousness pointed to the further development of guidance as a regular function of the public schools.

But, the guidance that was pointed to was in conflict with the traditional American ideology that every individual could rise above his birth station. Hutson\textsuperscript{16} gives the new guidance ideals: (1) All occupations offer a rich, cultural existence which is demanded by the democratic ideals. (2) There should be harmony between persons and occupations. (3) Humans vary in their potentiality for service. He felt that the occupations on the lower rungs should not be slurred over. Instead, it should be emphasized that workers are needed at every level in order to maintain a secure and orderly society.

A year later, 1934, Hutson\textsuperscript{19} hailed the New Deal as being a boost to vocational guidance. He sighted two vital changes which confronted the vocational counselor as a result of the social reconstruction.

The first change was that progress had been made toward the creation of conditions in which guidance could really work. Social control pointed toward a society in which there could be a rational plan for matching


\textsuperscript{19}Hutson, "Guidance Faces the New Deal", \textit{School Life}, XX, (September, 1934), p.4.
individuals and occupations. Before this, choice was made on the basis of wages and social prestige; consequently choice was defeated, and placement was determined by employment need and the supply and demand for workers. The laws for minimum wages, agricultural adjustment, abolition of child labor, and the promotion of collective bargaining raised the humbler occupations out of the depths of degradation. The Federal Security Act restrained the "scandalous" profits of entrepreneurs.

If those who discharge the humbler economic functions can enjoy general prosperity, particularly in the social and material culture, vocational choice can be made on a rational basis.20

The second change to confront the counselor would be the alteration in the exercise of guidance. Before, it had been strictly informative, advisory, and monitory, the vocational counselor exercising relatively little influence in the distribution of young people among occupations.

Actually the conception of individual freedom is illusory in character; the heritage of social conditions which no longer exist. Control over the distribution of workers is a fundamental concept in social and economic planning. The social purpose defines each man's role; the individual subordinates himself to the socialized program.21

That the school would take a major part of the responsibility for social planning was inevitable, since it was concerned with the training and development of youth.

20 Ibid.
21 Ibid., p. 27.
Hutson added that a planned society would not tolerate the waste of educating individuals for occupations in which they lacked native equipment. A planned society would conserve and distribute educational energy for the social welfare.

Increasing specialization made occupational planning necessary in any type of economic order. "Freedom of choice" was only hypothetical, anyhow, so planning would not affect it.22

When there is a deliberate attempt to find occupations for all the people and to allocate them to the jobs where they will produce the maximum of happiness for themselves and the greatest good for society, we have the process of vocational guidance and the desirable outcome—occupational adjustment.23

Occupational Adjustment Plan

Even with the industrial recovery in 1937, young people were still not employed. There was a move, sponsored by the National Occupations Conference, to stimulate a plan for "occupational adjustment" in the schools. Actual employment was the central object. While the schools could not create jobs, occupational surveys followed by guidance, training, and placement shortened the post-graduation period of inactivity.


The three essential points in occupational adjustment recommended by representative of the N.C. were:

1) Skilled counseling and guidance for every pupil, 2) Occupational training in school or through supervised apprenticeship, 3) Job placement and follow-up.

Although we are convinced that it would be inadvisable to offer intensive vocational training in the high school, we recognize the need for more realistic guidance of high school students along occupational lines.24

The Defense Program

In 1939, the war which was sweeping Europe changed the industrial picture of the United States. Within the first month, the employment volume increased; factories alone hired 300,000 additional workers. But, it was not considered a long range change, Kitson warned:

When the warring is completed, we shall face another depression in which the need for vocational adjustment on the part of American workers will demand vocational counseling as never before.25

But, 1940 saw increased industrial production. Defense orders brought a direct increase of four million workers, and two million more were employed in industries which were indirectly affected.26


25 Harry D. Kitson, "Wanted—Vocational Counselors", Occupations, XVII, (November, 1939), p. 120.

By 1941, guidance workers were regretting their failure to foresee the defense program developments. During the 1930's, there had been inadequate provision for apprenticeship and skilled trade education. The emergency training program was hindered by a lack of instructors and equipment.\(^27\)

Efficient machinery for bringing together people and jobs was vital to the defense program. Vocational guidance workers were also concerned for the efficiency of the draft and its affect on the careers and morale of the youth whom it affected. In order to adapt to the changes, schools coordinated their guidance efforts with government and voluntary agencies.\(^28\)

**World War II**

For the second time, war transformed industrial and economic life. The armed forces swelled from a few thousand to twelve million. Women in the labor force went from eleven million to eighteen million. Manufacturing of metals and chemicals tripped; all other manufacturing was curtailed.\(^29\)

The geography of population distribution changed as people moved to new industrial centers. The


\(^{28}\)Ibid., p.265.

manufacturing employment doubled in four Western cities and increased more than fifty per cent in twelve other cities. The heavy demand for war workers drew hundreds of thousands of young people from school. Even students of promise were lured away by high wages. Since defense jobs assured employment for the duration, but held little for the future, vocational guidance had to adapt to the emerging conditions.

Weigh the advantages of steady employment for several years, with the consequent opportunity to develop good work habits and discipline against the disadvantage of almost certain dislocation when the war is over. Stability of the first job is possibly more important than landing in an occupation with an assured distant future but with an assuredly unstable immediate prospect.

Kitson took the view that, though the first duty was to win the war, youth could serve both their country and themselves by acquiring one of the mechanical skills which were needed both in war and peace. Especially the boys who would soon be in the service should be encouraged to learn skills which would qualify them as technical specialists.

Pre-induction orientation was delegated to the schools. The boys needed to know the nature of military occupational life: the induction, classification, assignment, and training. They needed to know the specific

---

31 Ibid., p. 504
32 Kitson, "Vocational Guidance in Aid of Victory", Occupations, XX, (March, 1942), p. 447
needs of the services and how to qualify for them. Studebaker recommended that, since selection was the watchword of civilian occupations and the military forces, the schools should be ready with complete test records. It was a vocational guidance procedure to pick the best candidates for each job.

Post-War Period

With the war's end, the possibility of mass unemployment was a worry. If it had come, no group would have been harder hit than the high school students; they lacked both experience and the war veteran's claim for training. Besides having priority at the crowded colleges and universities, veterans got 90 per cent of the apprenticeships.

But, mass unemployment was averted. Eleven million veterans found civilian jobs, and other millions of war workers transferred to produce peacetime goods and services. Some occupations--operatives, clerical, and service--declined in relative importance after the war; professions, sales work, and non-farm laborers increased. The number of proprietors, officials, and craftsmen continued the wartime rise. Thus, the gains overbalanced the losses.

---

35 Kitson, "Washington Flashes", Occupations, XXIII, (September, 1943)
Extensive occupational shifting accompanied the post war industrial redistribution. Despite the expanding agricultural output, migration continued away from the farms to the urban centers. The industrial scene was characterized by labor-management disputes and demobilization lay-offs. But one year after the war, employment had regained its end-of-war levels.37

The success of personnel services in the military and in industry caused an expansion of vocational guidance in the post war period. All of the services had used group techniques in orientating and re-orientating, and such guidance was found to help each individual.38

The Veterans Administration counseling program improved civilian testing techniques. After World War I, there had been only seventeen tests which had high degree of validation; now there were innumerable tests with high claims of validity.39

The problem of prejudice received increased attention. Dix40 believed the school counselor should prepare the minority groups for the experience of being the victim of discrimination. If they could look at it objectively,

---


they would be better able to cope with discrimination. Every youth helped toward refusing to accept unfair prejudice aimed at himself would become a fighter for American democracy. A counselor should also persuade the majority groups of fair play.

In 1949, when an employment decline seemed possible, the nation again began defense preparation. There were cutbacks in the manufacture of civilian goods, but defense production further swelled the size of the labor force. In 1951, employment broke all records with 62.6 million.\(^{41}\)

In the face of full employment, vocational guidance faced a different situation. With the attraction of high paying jobs, youths were tempted to leave school prematurely. Industry needed teen-aged workers, so there was a closer relation between industry and schools. The cooperative work program got a push. There was less discrimination against women and Negroes.

Counselors could do a real job, for there was a wider range of choices. Young people would be helped in choosing careers within the range of their abilities and interests, and there would be less concern about opportunities.\(^{42}\)

---


Summary

World War I necessitated the efficient control and distribution of human services, both in civilian and military occupations. Consequently, tests to distinguish between people of different abilities were developed and widely acclaimed.

After the war, the validity of the testing methods were questioned. In fact, the whole of vocational guidance was questioned since machines increasingly replace skilled workers, and the routine jobs of running the machines did not demand education. Instead of vocational guidance, the emphasis came to be on educational or personality guidance.

During the depression, vocational guidance accompanied the employment decline. City youth were out of jobs; farm youth stayed idly home instead of migrating to the cities. Guidance services were eliminated from the school budgets. But, the social control of the New Deal gave guidance a boost. It made occupational planning possible and raised the prestige of the humbler occupations. By the time of the recovery, educators were spreading the "occupational adjustment" movement, the central thought of which was job placement.

Through World War II, the schools aided industry by evaluating students' aptitudes and abilities with tests and records. They also gave pre-induction orientation to the boys. Since war-time guidance services were successful...
in industry and the services, they gained in prestige. More valid testing methods were developed. Post-war full employment brought better cooperation between industry and the schools. Vocational guidance problems centered around school drop-outs and employment discrimination practices. Since there was a wide range of occupational choices, guidance workers could be optimistic in preparing youth for the working world.
CHAPTER VII

RESEARCH AFFECTING VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

Progress becomes possible through criticism. But critical interpretation of guidance is difficult. It is even difficult to list the problems and techniques to use.

Kefauver\(^1\) listed the types of guidance evaluation studies which were discernible: (1) Measure the need for guidance. (2) Relate practices to objectives. (3) Compare practices to a standard program. (4) Compare pupils before and after guidance. (5) Measure pupil characteristics after guidance.

The purpose of this chapter is to outline the research which has been done in vocational guidance, for the findings of research were a factor contributing to its development.

The Need for Guidance

Two of the main reasons for the occupational choices of twenty-thousand boys and girls were "best money makers" and "respected occupations". Conclusions of the study were that vocational guidance courses should (1) incorporate exact data with regard to financial returns of

numerous occupations, and (2) modify illusory hopes with data on vocational demand.  

A New York State high school survey questioned 1,641 graduates or withdrawals; 55 per cent had received no educational or vocational guidance.  

Only 60 per cent of 1,211 California high school students confessed to know the requirements of their chosen occupations. Of the 1,211, forty-two per cent chose professional occupations (against seven per cent hired); ten per cent manufacturing (against 20 per cent); six per cent agriculture (against 15 per cent); and 18 per cent clerical (against eight per cent).  

The result of questioning 1,425 Rochester, New York, high school students was that 56 per cent felt a need for occupational information, and 57 per cent wanted help in estimating their qualifications.  

Occupational questionnaires were given to 2000 students in 22 Illinois and Wisconsin high schools. The majority knew the necessary abilities, salaries, hours, and employment trends of their chosen occupation, but not the

---


4Ibid.

needed preparation nor age or sex restrictions. They were the victims of little information rather than misinformation. 6

Relating Practices to Objectives

A 1922 survey of seniors of Washington concluded that high school work was a relatively unimportant factor in vocational guidance. Relatives and friends were ranked first as an aid to occupational choice. 7

The life-career motive had no practical effect on school work in a study of 160 boys. Those without vocational decisions did as well, relative to their mental capacity, as did boys with vocational decisions. 8

A follow-up of 1,003 Newton, Iowa, graduates showed that the occupations followed the first few years after graduation were close to those prepared for in high school, but that most never reached their vocational objectives. 9

This study was conducted during the depression, so the results are overly pessimistic.


The Austrian psychologist, Büsler, concluded that the meaning of life as a problem seldom came to the child till he was sixteen or seventeen. Therefore, vocational guidance should be postponed till that age; the guidance program, carried out in the junior high, would fail or even harm.10

A nationwide investigation of 72,143 positions in 2,630 separate occupations classes revealed that students were still being trained according to job specifications of from four to twenty years previous.11

Reports from parents of 7,000 high school seniors rated vocational guidance lowest among twelve school services which they were asked to rank.12

To determine how effective school guidance had been, opinions of 17,000 industrial leaders were sampled. A fifth rated the programs as being poor, weak, and ineffective. The others qualified their endorsement with the following criticism: (1) There was too much emphasis on intelligence and other tests, (2) Counselors mastered the definitions of occupations but did not know the types of work available for beginners or the training required, (3) The school should carry on yearly industrial surveys.


11Clark, op. cit., p.39.

12Kitson and Margaret Crane, "Measured Results of Vocational Guidance", Occupations, XVI, (June, 1938), p.840.
(4) Students should be taught to fill out application blanks. 13

Comparing Practices to a Standard Program

Of 1,100 high schools surveyed in 1936, 68.5 per cent provided some kind of occupational information. Of these, 43.8 per cent had separate courses, while 51.3 per cent provided it as part of other courses. Throughout the nation, schools reduced their costs by using regular officers and teachers as guidance functionaries.14

By 1939, under the encouragement of the Occupational Information and Guidance Services, 1297 public high schools had appointed counselors for either full or half time. Seven states had authorized state guidance supervisors.15

In 1947, there were 6,600 full and part time counselors employed in 29 states. A third of the states required counselor certification.16

In his survey of educational and vocational guidance


in Montana high schools, Sorensen\textsuperscript{17} found that the 1950 trend was to offer occupational information through other courses such as English, social studies, home economics, and life-adjustment. The formalized course was becoming a thing of the past; while 67 per cent of the first class schools offered such a course in 1930, only 16 per cent offered it in 1950. However, 67 per cent claimed to give vocational guidance either in separate courses or in occupational units. Forty-three per cent of the schools reported that the course was not satisfactory.

The use of occupational textbooks and vocational assemblies dropped since 1930, but occupational files, motion pictures, and industrial tours increased.

Before and After Guidance

A course in occupations given to 388 ninth graders of Minneapolis showed some effect on their vocational and educational plans. Before taking the course, 77.6 per cent of them could state their occupational choice; after the course, 96.9 per cent had a choice.\textsuperscript{18}

Two groups were given the Brever-Lincoln vocational and educational information test. One group was given a

\textsuperscript{17} Eugene Sorensen, \textit{Mid-Twentieth Century Re-Survey of Educational and Vocational Guidance in Montana Public High Schools}, (M.S.U. thesis; unpublished, 1951).

twenty-week course in careers; then both groups were retested. Both groups showed improvement, with the career class doing better than the group without the class. 19

Post-Guidance Characteristics

A 1936 study compared 391 senior high school students who had had "Life-Career" courses with 250 who had not. The basis of comparison was a battery of tests on occupational and educational information and adjustment. There was no significant difference between the two groups. 20

In 1939, Thornkide conducted a ten year follow-up on eighth grade aptitude examinees. He concluded that vocational guidance did not guide. His critics, also psychologists, said that neither Thornkide's test nor the aptitude idea were valid, for aptitude tests could not be considered vocational guidance. 21

The Worcester Boys' Club made a follow-up study of 200 past members; 100 had had vocational guidance in 1931 and 100 had not. In 1936, forty-five per cent of the advised boys were still in school as against 22 per cent on the non-advised. Of those who were working, the advised boys averaged 1.22 job changes per year compared with 1.77

---

19 Kitson and Crane, op. cit., p. 840.
20 Ibid., p. 841.
job changes for those not advised. 22

Follow-ups contradict the proposition that the
school should train students for specific jobs. Of the
123 who graduated from the Pittsburg trade school in 1947,
less than a third in 1951 were working in a trade related
to their training. Union membership, trade experience
requirements, and employment practices, which included the
fear of draft eligibility, prevented youth from entering
their chosen field. 23

Summary

Research on guidance was limited, for few guidance
people were trained in research, and a worthy study takes
years. Even the studies which were published were so
limited in scope that they were little help to the front
line counselor. 24

Studies measuring the need for guidance showed
that students based their occupational choice on earnings
and prestige; they did not know the requirements, and they
felt the need of vocational guidance.

Vocational guidance was not accomplishing its
objectives, for students ranked relatives and friends as

22 Robert C. Cole, "Evaluation of a Boys' Club

23 Carson McGuire, "Social Effects and Correlates
of Education", Review of Educational Research, XXII,
(February, 1952), p.28.

24 Kitson, "More and Better Research in Vocational
the most influential factors in occupational choice. Parents ranked vocational guidance the least important school function, and industrial leaders felt it was out of touch with industrial needs.

While certified counselors and state supervised guidance programs were increasing, most schools used regular teachers.

The follow-up studies showed that guidance programs had a limited effect on the student.
CHAPTER VII

EFFECT OF CONFLICTING PHILOSOPHIES

Educators were often indifferent or even opposed to the introduction of vocational guidance. Even worse was the uncertainty and lack of harmony among vocational guidance advocates.¹

The conflict seemed to hinge on three points:
(1) What method of vocational guidance was the most effective, (2) What was the purpose of guidance, (3) Whether vocational guidance had a purpose at all. This conflict, which has existed throughout the history of vocational guidance, may have had opposing effects. It may have hindered the coordinated development of vocational guidance, or it may have stimulated the adjustment of vocational guidance to the changing needs.

Methods of Vocational Guidance

Elmer Bess² maintained that vocational guidance could be effective only when rendered by a specialist on the individual basis; mass methods needed to be modified. The specialist could see, better than the young person,

what direction was best for that person.

Brewer's view was that guidance required a broad, healthy, social school program with the aid of every teacher. There was no definite point in a person's life when he could, with the aid of an expert, make a definite decision. Hagie hoped a desperate effort would be made to require guidance courses for all teachers so that every classroom could assist the children in analyzing themselves.

Jones' stand was that vocational guidance was interwoven with every part of education, but that this concept was too diffuse to be of practical value. While education was not confined to school, one could not depend on the outside to achieve educational objectives. So unconscious teacher help was not dependable guidance.

Baer believed that optimum results came when the individual and group approach were coordinated as complementary parts of the vocational guidance program. The distinguishing values of the group method were: (1) Speeding orientation, (2) Focusing attention on those in need of guidance, (3) Stimulating the demand for individual counseling, (4) Helping establish rapport, (5) Saving money, (6) Adapting effective educational means.

---

3 Brewer, "Are We Neglecting the Pupil's Curriculum?", Occupations, XXVI, (February, 1948), pp.282-4.


5 Jones, op. cit., p.15.

6 Max F. Baer, "Vocational Guidance in Group Activities", Occupations, XXV, (May, 1947), pp.530-34.
Revealing group behavior, (8) Developing positive attitudes, (9) Pooling experiences.

Jager\(^7\) believed that the personal interview was the only means of making the principles and practices of vocational guidance work for the individual. While vocational guidance was not an exact science, the same standards of service and the freedom of the individual should underlie the practices everywhere.

Carl Rogers\(^8\) motivated the non-directive counseling movement. Besides emphasizing the one-to-one counseling relationship, he held that the counselor should not make any positive suggestions. Encouraging the subject to freely express himself would lead to counselee-made decisions.\(^9\)

Purpose of Vocational Guidance

In 1915, Leavitt believed that the real purpose in vocational guidance was to motivate curriculum enlargement, and decrease the drop-out rate. "Vocational guidance means guidance for education, not guidance for jobs, though jobs may be the ultimate goal."\(^9\)


Brewer\(^{10}\) held that all guidance was vocational, educational, and individual. He also believed that all education was guidance.

While Jones\(^{11}\) conceded that guidance was unitary, only one phase at a time should be singled out for special consideration. Vocational guidance was the phase most commonly singled out, and should not be concerned with health, character, home membership, citizenship, or self-development except as these would help in the job.

I cannot subscribe to the proposal of vocational guidance in our schools—a method of placement, finding jobs, and steering pupils into channels of industry. It measures success by working permits, instead of by the number it succeeds in keeping in school.\(^{12}\)

The response to Linsdale's accusations queried whether graduates were better able to find jobs for themselves than with counsel, and whether any school was able to hold its low intelligence, low financial group,\(^{13}\)

Lorge contended that while the counselor's purpose was to make a success of the counselee, there was no clear concept of vocational success. Therefore, the only justification of guidance was that it was a way of regulating

---


\(^{11}\)Jones, op.cit., p.18.

\(^{12}\)J.E. Linsdale, "Social Needs in Vocational Education", School and Society, XX, (September 27,1924)p.152.

\(^{13}\)"Discussion", School and Society, XX, (October11, 1924)
future conduct on inductions from past experience.\textsuperscript{14} Nelson challenged the official definition; Vocational guidance is the process of assisting the individual to choose an occupation, prepare for it, enter upon it, and progress in it. This definition connoted specific prediction instead of preparing the individual to change plans in a changing economy. It implied an orderly progression from the initial choice to progress in it.\textsuperscript{15}

Developing a concept of the socially acceptable person was Strang's basis of vocational guidance. To be socially acceptable, one must choose a socially useful vocation. Consequently, she classed the social value as an essential part of occupational information.\textsuperscript{16}

Another concept was that vocational guidance was part of a developing social science; a body of knowledge which sought to apply to social problems an attitude or approach similar to that used in the physical sciences. One purpose was to make an objective evaluation of the individual using psychology, sociology, and economics. Another purpose was to provide information for social planning.\textsuperscript{17}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{15} A. Gordon Nelson, "The Definition of Vocational Guidance", \textit{Occupations}, XXVII, (November, 1948).
\item \textsuperscript{16} Ruth Strang, "Social Aspects of Vocational Guidance", \textit{Education}, LI, (June, 1931), pp. 629-45.
\item \textsuperscript{17} Erwin W. Fellows, "Social Aspects of Vocational Guidance", \textit{Occupations}, XXVII, (December, 1948), pp. 242-4.
\end{itemize}
Standing of Vocational Guidance

People are everywhere endlessly searching for panaceas, for educational 'get-rich' quick schemes, and easy short cuts. Even though they have been fooled again and again, they still remain gullible. Lured by extravagant claims, school authorities and others got the notion that vocational guidance was going to solve the educational and industrial ills and remove the possibility of the misfit. When the claims weren't made good, suspicion fell on the entire movement. 18

In 1931, Chester Maxey regretted that the problem of vocational guidance in the schools was not abandoned. But, educators even declared that compulsory vocational guidance was the only means of making education truly serviceable. Maxey held that educators were not in touch with the "work-a-day world", high school salaries made qualified and experienced counselors impossible, and even representatives from service clubs gave an unbalanced picture. 19

In the 1930's, vocational guidance had become a "fetish" of educational circles and civic and government groups. While Clement Williams 20 thought it highly desirable to place vocational information before young people, he felt guidance was wrong. Guidance placed youth at the mercy of their elders, influenced tomorrow unduly by

---

18 Jones, op. cit., p.13.
yesterday, and was a tool for an autocratic government.

Conner Reed\(^2\) believed that teenagers could not
know themselves, for few of them had marked talents. He
recommended that youth suspend making their final vocation-
al decision; if they could go to college, take a general
course; if not, take any job they could get, and look around.

Dora Damrin\(^2\) maintained that vocational choice was
one of the most prominent problems in the minds of high
school seniors. When she had a few measuring devices
which helped students to evaluate their aptitudes, she
was determined to use them.

William Corney\(^2\) felt that the general humanities
education was so important and needed so much time that
little was left for specific education. Educators exalted
conformity and sought the well adjusted child, but progress
frequently came from people who were reluctant to adjust-
ment and little concerned with security of employment.

Summary

Vocational guidance has evoked many conflicting
philosophies. Convictions as to the best guidance methods
ranged from individual to group; from directive to

\(^2\)Conner Reed, "Vocational Guidance Too Much

\(^2\)Dora E. Damrin, "No Let-Up on Vocational Guidance",

\(^2\)William H. Corney, "Bread or Hyacinths", School
non-directive; from a specific function to an all-education function.

The purposes which have conflicted include occupational adjustment only or occupational, educational, and personality adjustment; occupational direction or occupational enlightenment; preparation for a specific occupation or preparation for a changing field of occupations; creation of the socially acceptable person or the scientific solution of the problems of society.

The negative views were that vocational guidance was wrong in trying to control the future, that it was too exacting to ever be practiced in the schools, that teenagers were too young to determine their vocations, and that adjustment was too highly exalted. Positive views held that vocational guidance made education meaningful and climaxed in the vocational adjustment of the individual.
CHAPTER IX

OTHER FACTORS AFFECTING VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

It has been shown that the economic cycles affected vocational guidance. Whether a matter of cause or effect, vocational guidance and educators' research studies and philosophies bore a close relationship. Now, some of the other influential factors will be enumerated.

Federal Legislation

While the Smith-Hughes Act of 1917 gave appropriations to vocational education, and several forthcoming acts increased this Federal aid, not till the George-Barden Act of 1946 was provision made for vocational guidance.¹

The Division of Vocational Education, which was organized to make studies and surveys, also was to develop a guidance program. It matched state and local funds which were spent to supervise the state guidance program, to train vocational counselors, to pay school counselors, and to purchase equipment and supplies.

The professional effects of this program were the adoption of specific qualifications for guidance workers.

National Conferences

The White House Conference of 1931 adopted recommendations for vocational guidance which included an every community program, specially prepared counselors, cumulative records and testing, and occupations classes. The National Occupations Conference of 1938 dealt with improving occupational adjustment. As a result, the occupational information and Guidance Service of the Office of Education was organized. Its purpose was to collect and disseminate occupational information and to promote the school information and guidance program. The purpose of the program was not to set exact patterns in this field, or to change accepted philosophies and procedures which had developed throughout the country as an evolution from local conditions.

By 1948, forty-four states supported a school guidance program, most of which used Federal funds under the


George Barden Act and professional assistance from the Occupational Information and Guidance Service. Four thousand high schools carried on specialized guidance programs directed by 8,000 counselors. Out of 26,000 public high schools, this was not a good showing.6

Outside Agencies

Ninety-three national organizations had demonstrated an interest in the vocational guidance field prior to 1939; 984 clubs carried on vocational guidance.7

Lee8 felt that occupational adjustment could be accomplished only through cooperating with these clubs and organizations. They ranged from parent-teacher associations, local labor unions, and chambers of commerce to groups like Rotary, Kiwanis, Lions, B'nai Brith, Business and Professional Women, and Associated University Women. They also included the Y.W.C.A., government offices, and the agencies of the depression—N.Y.A., and C.C.C.

Brewer9 warned that vocational guidance must be preserved as an entity unhampered by over-control by other agencies if its effect on the local community and on youth

---

6Jager, op.cit., p.486.
was to be good.

Y.M.C.A. Besides conducting guidance services and try-out experiences in their own center, the Y.M.C.A. of Cincinnati arranged for business and professional men to come to the high schools for individual counseling with junior and senior boys.  

**Depression Agencies.** The National Youth Administration operated junior employment offices which administered mechanical aptitude, interest, and intelligence tests. It also subsidized part-time work experiences in the high schools. The Civilian Conservation Corp camp advisers lay more and more stress on counseling and guidance. They used group discussions and camp meetings where the boys were all present to present employment trends and application procedures.

**U.S.E.S.** In some cities, the Public Employment Service conducted the junior placement for all people under 21; in other cities it was affiliated with the schools. In either case, it obtained the cumulative records and references from the high school. The Maryland

---

employment service placed a guidance supervisor in the Department of Public Instruction, and his services were available to the superintendents and teachers throughout the state.\textsuperscript{14}

In 1952, Max Baer\textsuperscript{15} reported that the U.S.E.S. had counseled 120,000 school-aged youth the previous year. The policy was to encourage the schools to counsel the ninth, tenth, and eleventh graders and those twelfth graders who were going on to college. The biggest dearth was in the rural areas where the school guidance programs were weakest.

\textbf{National Groups.} In 1938, the Business and Professional Women sponsored a campaign for appointing vocational counselors in the schools.

At the same time, 754 Kiwanis clubs were administering vocational conferences, personality and aptitude testing, find-yourself campaigns, and employment bureaus.\textsuperscript{16} The members provided first-hand information and counsel through occupational group conferences and individual counseling. The club issued a bulletin which gave an organized outline for conducting the conference. Members also assisted the schools by providing part-time work


\textsuperscript{16}"Recent Guidance Activities of National Groups" \textit{Occupations}, XVII, (October, 1938), pp. 40-42.
opportunities in plants and offices.\textsuperscript{17}

Unfair employment practices made it necessary for B'nai Brith to assist Jewish youth in finding employment. Group meetings in occupational information were supplemented by individual counseling.\textsuperscript{18}

Industry. Industry assumed some guidance responsibility in Pittsburg when the Bull Foundation opened an office in the school where it counseled 360 students a year.\textsuperscript{19}

Commercial Guidance. Metropolitan papers carried adds like "Come to us and by means of psychological tests, we'll tell you what your aptitudes are", or, "Plan your occupational future intelligently. Vocational guidance by scientifically trained vocational experts. Personal interview not necessary. Fee $5." \textsuperscript{20}

Such commercials threw suspicion on the entire guidance movement. A step recommended to counteract the suspicion was qualified, professional counselors in the schools.


Teacher Preparation

The first course in vocational guidance was at Harvard in the summer of 1911. It emphasized the need for guidance, cooperation between the schools, and employers, how to organize guidance, and how to teach vocations.\(^{21}\)

By 1925, thirty such courses were offered in colleges and universities; in 1928, 70 courses; in 1941, 264 courses in 52 institutions.\(^{22}\)

The Eighth National Conference of State Supervisors of Guidance Services and Counselor Trainers set up the competencies which a counselor should have: They should be able to classify and describe the world of work; understand the effect of socio-economic changes; know in-training and placement facilities; and collect, evaluate, abstract, file, and use occupational information with groups of students.

The counselor may have varied degrees of responsibility in giving occupational information to groups. Some of the activities in which he must be competent to use information are as follows: Visits to industrial or business establishments, displays of materials, career days, community occupational surveys, follow-up studies, adaptation of materials for newspapers, or hobby clubs.


\(^{22}\)Brewer, op.cit., p.213.


\(^{24}\)Ibid.,p.26.
By 1951, nineteen states had set up formal requirements for certification of guidance counselors. Since only twelve states required business experience, Lerner thought counselors' information was grasped bookishly and vicariously. Only 100 of 930 colleges and universities which graduated counselors offered a course in occupations.

Summary

With Federal funds under the George-Barden Act and professional assistance from the Occupational Information and Guidance Service, there was a growing trend for state-supported guidance programs.

Civic groups, government agencies, and industry all took responsibility for youth guidance. They did testing, individual counseling, and placement, and conducted career conferences. Some of their activities supplemented school guidance; some of them replaced it. Profit-minded commercial guidance brought suspicion on the guidance movement.

In order to regulate school guidance, specific teacher competencies were listed and an increasing number of states required counselor certification.

CHAPTER X

RECENT DEVELOPMENTS

Now that the beginnings of vocational guidance and the factors which have affected it have been discussed, there is the question of its present status. The present trends and some current practices will be described, and some authoritative recommendations listed.

Trends

Thirty-eight schools which state supervisors rated as doing a superior job gave evidence of the following trends in teaching occupational information: (1) The twelfth grade had caught up with the ninth grade in popularity. This was the trend because so many were graduating from high school. (2) Self appraisal by psychological tests, checklists, and autobiographies was the most frequently reported technique. (3) Classes were taught by counselors rather than by social studies teachers, thereby integrating group and individual guidance. (4) Occupational information was a required course in 29 schools and an elective in nine. (5) It was a separate subject in 23 schools and a unit in other subjects in 13. (6) Total clock hours of the course ranged from ten to 180. (7) Stated purposes were self appraisal and learning of
community work opportunities, sources of occupational information, and skills in finding work. The methods were self evaluation, job surveys, filmstrips, leaflets, and career conferences.¹

The Federal requirements for guidance services subsidy allowed each state maximum freedom in patterning a program uniquely adapted to the needs of the individuals within its boundaries. It was the trend within states to set up a criteria for duties, standards, and qualifications of counselors; to require counselor intern experience; to specify certification requirements; to develop pilot-service where the state supervisor set up and demonstrated a local guidance program; to require schools to maintain a guidance service in order to be accredited; and to evaluate the programs with the bulletin put out by the Occupational Information and Guidance Service, Criteria for Evaluating Guidance Programs in the Secondary Schools.²

Current Practices

Seniors who had been recruited for a special class studied careers in a Brooklyn, New York, high school. Their first project was to write to alumni members asking for first hand information on career progress. Guest speakers


from many occupations came to class for career conferences. The students wrote autobiographies and took interest and aptitude tests. Field trips, periods for browsing in the occupational library, and a vocational term paper completed the course. Lowenstein felt the study resulted in self-evaluation, realization of important socio-economic factors, and the field-level concept.

Twenty-eight picked students of Newark, New Jersey, spent a field day in the Kresge-Newark store. The visit was preceded by careful planning and orientation. Each student spent the morning observing and helping in his chosen department—advertising, commercial, art, controller's office, merchandising, receiving and marking, restaurant, or sewing and alterations. After lunch in the employees' cafeteria, the students toured the store. The students, employers, and the employees recognized the educational and vocational purpose of the day.

In order to develop the civic and social aspects of the part-time student's life, occupational adjustment classes were taught in the Cooperative Training High School of Beaumont, Texas. The first few months were the most critical period for part-time students; confusion, fear, and lack of experience played on his emotions. The adjustment classes attempted to build confidence and

---

create a desirable attitude, for employers evaluated the beginning worker on attitude, fitness, and loyalty. The topics were presented by class discussions with one of the students leading.\(^5\)

Integrating the many types of industrial education and traditional education, the core curriculum cut across all departmental boundaries. Since finances dictated an early vocational choice, the junior high was used for exploring occupations and the high school for trade skills and knowledge.\(^6\)

The occupational adjustment emphasis is being supplanted by the life adjustment movement. Its purposes are to encourage personality growth and socially acceptable patterns of behavior and to develop a sense of values for happiness and social good. It is an integrated curriculum which, besides several specified courses, requires a point-rated achievement project. Projects include scholarship, home service, part-time work, life-planning, and community service. Each student in the curriculum must earn 200 points. In 1951, the Billings, Montana, high school graduated its first class under this plan.\(^7\)

---


\(^7\) J.G. Ragsdale, *Life Adjustment Curriculum*, (Billings, Montana: school manual)
Recommendations for Group Vocational Guidance.

Even though industrialization and economic cycles may bring many surface changes to the occupational structure, the broad fields of occupations change little from decade to decade. In the last fifty years, the percentage of workers in manufacturing, mining, construction, transportation and public utilities, and service industries have varied less than three points each. An increase in the professions from 3.1 to 7.2 per cent, and a decrease in agriculture from 34.3 to 12.8 per cent are important changes. Also the increase in semi-skilled labor from 16 to 22 per cent and the decrease of unskilled labor from 15 to 6 per cent should be noted by the counselor.

In spite of the publicity for new inventions and new industries, their effect on the occupational structure is not great or immediate. This stability encourages the possibility of vocational guidance, and should be brought to the students' attention.

The local conditions should be emphasized in the occupational information class, for many people tend to remain near their home communities. This can be accomplished by close relations between school and business and practical instruction in work situations. Belman's


plan was as follows: (1) Organise an advisory committee of business men. (2) Coordinate the teaching staff. (3) Provide supervised work experience through diversified education and on-the-job-training. (4) Provide a diversified education for diversified occupations. (5) Study occupational trends. 10

The principles of vocational guidance should be in the foreground: (1) It should enable the individual to make an intelligent choice, for guidance is not a selection or distribution function. (2) It is a right under the scheme of free education. (3) It necessitates cooperation between school, labor, and employer. (4) It requires trained personnel. 11

With the foregoing principles in mind, Baer gives the distinguishing principles of group vocational guidance: (1) Vocational guidance for groups and for individuals are complementary approaches to the same ultimate objectives. (2) Group activities should be purposeful. (3) They should be pervaded by a democratic spirit—a minimum of lecturing and a maximum of group discussion. (4) They should be adapted to the needs, interests, and maturity level of the specific group. The counselor should seek information about each member. (5) Activities should be


integrally related to other school, work and social activities of the group. (6) They should be conducted in small, natural, homogeneous groups with a common interest. (7) They should focus on experience in making plans and decisions—not merely factual information. (8) They should be conducted on an impersonal basis by citing fictitious or anonymous cases. (9) Outcomes should be validated against vocational guidance objectives.\(^1\)

Summary

It is the trend for states to require trained guidance services in the schools. Occupational information classes are increasingly taught in the twelfth grade by the school counselor. Courses emphasize self-analysis more than occupational information.

There is a closer relationship between school and business. It is evidenced in school-work programs and student field days. Adjusting personality to work takes precedence over learning trade skills. Adjustment to life takes precedence over adjustment to work.

Accurate occupational data, both local and national, should be presented in the schools. The counselor should heed the principles and objectives of guidance, and integrate group guidance methods with the objectives.

\(^{1}\)Max F. Baer, "Vocational Guidance in Group Activities: Distinguishing Values and Principles", Occupations, XXV, (May, 1947), pp. 530-34.
CHAPTER XI

CONCLUSION

This brings to a close the study of group vocational guidance. From the first class in occupational information, the methods have been traced down to the latest school techniques. From the industrial problems of the early 1900's to the latest defense program, the background of vocational guidance has been described.

An attempt has been made to keep the study within the bounds of group vocational guidance in the secondary schools. It was not the purpose to explore the field of individual guidance, industrial guidance, or personality guidance.

The term group guidance has been used in a loose sense throughout. The original concept of the term was a class-room agenda of detailed occupational information. The present concept departs from the information aspect.

Vocational guidance is taken as meaning a program of activities which are not instructional in nature and which have as their ultimate purpose the individual.

The original purposes of vocational guidance were to direct boys to jobs in which they would be able to advance, be financially ahead, and be happy. A secondary

---

purpose was educational motivation. To these ends instruction was organized, both in separate courses and in units in other courses. Textbooks and theme contracts were the main teaching devices; guest speakers, field trips, and group discussions were also used. It was strictly a boy's field of study.

The years brought ups and downs to the vocational guidance movement. Unemployment of the depression years made vocational guidance seem futile. If guidance survived, it was directed towards education or personality.

The wars emphasized the selective and directive phases of vocational guidance, thus making it less democratic. Vocational guidance was also an apt tool for socialistic regulations.

Research studies of guidance programs showed them to be ineffective. Even educators could not agree on the purposes and practices of vocational guidance.

Schools were not prepared with staffs who were qualified to guide youth toward the world of work, so representatives of the world of work came to the schools. In career conferences, counseling, and placement, the working men's objectives were short-sighted and limited.

In spite of vocational guidance defects and its decline, the occupational maze kept it in demand. So its supporters obtained a Federal subsidy for its development. They drew up standards for counselors and for guidance programs. They organized a central occupational
information and guidance service. With more secure footing, vocational guidance is again attempting to build up its reputation. Group guidance, under qualified counselors, can supplement the work of individual counseling.

Suggestions for Further Studies

Follow-up studies of guidance programs are fragmentary or lacking. In recent years, the Review of Educational Research has cited occupational studies, a tool for vocational counselors, but not follow-up results, the rationalization for vocational guidance.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Belman, Harry S., and Evans, Rupert N. "Wanted; A Sound Program of Education for the 60 Per Cent", Nation's Schools, XLVI, September, 1950. 24-6.


Brewer, John M. "Are We Neglecting the Pupil's Curriculum?", Occupations, XXVI, February, 1948. 382-4.


Brewer, John M. "Vocational Guidance through the Life-Career Class", School and Society, VI, November 10, 1917. 541-5.


Corney, William H. "Bread or Hyacinths", School and Society, LXXII, July 8, 1950. 17-20.


Dodson, Nora E. "What Are the Vocational Possibilities in Extra-Curricular Activities?", School Review, XXXVII, December, 1929. 767-70.


Fellows, Erwin W. "Social Aspects of Vocational Guidance", Occupations, XXVII, December 1948. 242-4

Forbes, A.W. "Occupational-Intelligence Standards: A Reply to Mr Fryer", School and Society, XVI, October 7, 1922. 414-16.


Haugen, Melvin, and Douglass, Harl R. "The Effect of a Course in Occupations on the Vocational and Educational Plans of Ninth Grade Children, School Review, XLV, October, 1937. 585-91.


Hinrichs, A.F. "Occupational Outlook and the War", Occupations, XX, April, 1942. 499-505.


Kitson, Harry D. and Crane, Margaret, "Measured Results of Vocational Guidance", Occupations, XVI, June, 1938. 837-42.


Leavitt, Frank M. "Vocational Guidance as an Essential Adjunct of Vocational Education", School Life, IX, April, 1924. 190


Lee, Edwin A. "Occupational Adjustment from Coast to Coast", Occupations, XVII, June, 1939. 799-806.


Lott, Nervill B. "When Is a Job a Real Job?", Educational Review, LXX, November, 1925. 201-10.


Luchinger, Leland S. "Units in Occupational Adjustment for Industrial Co-operative Training", Industrial Arts and Vocational Education, XLI, January, 1952. 4-6.


Maxey, Chester C. "A Postscript on Vocational Guidance", Education, LI, June, 1931. 629-34.


Melvin, Bruce L. "Youth Migration and Vocational Guidance", Occupations, XVII, June, 1931, 786-9.


Mowry, Duane. "Vocational or Cultural Education—Which?". Education, XXXIII, February, 1912. 373-76.


Rainey, Homer P. "Guidance and Placement for America's Youth", Occupations, XV, June, 1937. 838-44.


Scudder, Kenyon J. "The Schools and Industrial Adjustment", School and Society, XXX, August 24, 1929. 252-7.


Sears, J.B. "Occupations of Fathers and Occupational Choices of 1,039 Boys in Grades Seven and Eight of Oakland Schools", School and Society, I, April, 1915. 750-56.


Williams, Clement C. "Limitations to Vocational Guidance", *School and Society*, XLVIII, November 5, 1938, 577-81.


Woods, Robert A. "Does the Present Trend Toward Vocational Education Threaten Liberal Culture?" *School Review*, XIX, September, 1911, 466-75.


Zehrer, Frederick A. "War Service Counselors in the Schools", Occupations, XXII, December, 1943. 16407.