

University of Montana

## ScholarWorks at University of Montana

---

University of Montana Course Syllabi

Open Educational Resources (OER)

---

Spring 2-1-2005

### PSC 420.01: Comparative Legal Systems

Louis D. Hayes

*University of Montana - Missoula*, [louis.hayes@umontana.edu](mailto:louis.hayes@umontana.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.umt.edu/syllabi>

**Let us know how access to this document benefits you.**

---

#### Recommended Citation

Hayes, Louis D., "PSC 420.01: Comparative Legal Systems" (2005). *University of Montana Course Syllabi*. 7174.

<https://scholarworks.umt.edu/syllabi/7174>

This Syllabus is brought to you for free and open access by the Open Educational Resources (OER) at ScholarWorks at University of Montana. It has been accepted for inclusion in University of Montana Course Syllabi by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at University of Montana. For more information, please contact [scholarworks@mso.umt.edu](mailto:scholarworks@mso.umt.edu).

All civil societies govern themselves by some form of law. The philosophical foundations and methods of application of these laws have changed throughout history and continue today to vary widely around the world. The system of law found in the United States is not the standard by any means. In fact, most other legal systems, including those in Europe, are significantly different. This course explores two approaches to the subject of law. The first of these is Islamic law. As in the West, there are important differences among Islamic countries in their approaches to the law. But they all have one thing in common. Law has a spiritual rather than a secular source: it is derived from religion, that is, the Koran. The other system to be considered is that of East Asia. Here the source of law is a philosophical and cultural heritage that has existed for millennia. For purposes of this course, this will be called the Confucian tradition.

The meaning of law in Islamic countries is fundamentally different from that of the West. Islam is holistic; there is no distinction between faith and the physical world. It is this difference that explains, in part, the strain in relations between Western countries and the Islamic countries of the Middle East. In this category, there are many countries to study, from Morocco to Indonesia.

The legal systems of Asia are hard to define, at least from the American perspective. They appear either amorphous or authoritarian. We are accustomed to the law as an independent structure. In East Asia, law is an integral part of ethics and culture. Modern Asia, however, has been forced, out of necessity, to incorporate western approaches to law in order to cope with the demands of the contemporary world. Additionally, some countries combine elements of all three legal systems (Western, Islamic and Confucian) such as Malaysia and Indonesia.

### Course Objectives

By means of written exercises, oral reports and discussion, the course should achieve the following:

A general understanding of the historical context out of which contemporary legal systems have evolved

An understanding and appreciation of the moral and ethical foundations of law

A description of the purposes of law

A description of the mechanics by which law is applied

### Assignments

Course requirements include the following:

1. Oral reports on articles and book chapters (10%)
2. Research papers (80%)
3. General discussion of course material (10%)

### Research Paper

There is no set length for each of the two papers but little can be done on these topics in fewer than 15 pages each. The paper should conform to standard manuscript style. Use either footnotes or endnotes based on the Turabian manual of style.

Note the sections of each paper will not necessarily be of equal length due to availability of information. Given that the amount and quality of information available is uneven, it is impractical to try and focus upon one single country in each of the geographical areas. Instead, the areas as a whole can be considered in order to gather data on the subject matter categories listed below.

There should be a minimum of three non-internet sources.

Each of the two legal systems will be examined in terms of four subject matter categories. Given that material is not available for all countries on all topics, not all subjects can be considered in detail. Not much is known, for example, about law enforcement and corrections practices in the Islamic world.

The first paper is due in final form on March 10. The second on May 5.

Papers should cover but are not limited to the following topics

- I. Constitutional foundations
  - A. What is the historical background of the way the polity is "constituted"? That is, how did it come to exist as a state?
  - B. What is the philosophy of "law"? What are its sources?
  - C. What is the authoritative basis of the political system? The authority of government comes from what?
- II. Courts and judicial process?
  - A. What are the methods of adjudication?
  - B. How are the courts organized?
  - C. What is the role of the legal profession?
  - D. How are legal professionals trained?
  - E. What is legal procedure, i.e., due process?
- III. Philosophical and practical aspects of civil rights
  - A. What is the meaning of civil liberties in this system?
  - B. What are gender and disabilities issues and how are they handled in the legal system?
  - C. How is "substance abuse" handled?
  - D. How is "victimless crime" handled?
- IV. Law enforcement and corrections
  - A. How is law enforcement organized?
  - B. How are law enforcement personnel recruited and trained?
  - C. What is the relationship between the police and the community?

- D. What are the philosophy and methods of corrections?
- E. What is the relationship between law and morality?

**Attendance is mandatory. Three absences will be allowed. Additional absences will result in a 5% grade reduction per absence.**

### Calendar

#### Part 1

January 25 - February 3 The Study of Comparative law

The first week will be devoted to gathering bibliography and exploring different data sources

#### Part 2

February 8 - 24 Islamic Law

Reports on article and book assignments

March 1 - March 24 Islamic Law

Presentations of research findings

#### Part 3

April 7 - April 21 Asia

Reports on articles and book assignments

April 26 - May 5 Asia

Presentations of research findings

#### Part 4

May 11 (8:00-10:00) Final review

## COMPARATIVE LAW

### Bibliography

#### ISLAM

"Abortion" Social Science and Medicine October 1998, 1089

"Islamic Fundamentalism" Political Science and Politics March 1998, 52

Abdo, Nahla. "Gender and Politics" Journal of Palestine Studies Winter 1999, 38

Al'Alwani, Taha. "The Testimony of Women in Islamic Law," The American Journal of Islamic Social Sciences Summer 1996, 173-96

Al-Khalifa, "Religiosity and Islam," American Journal of Islamic Social Sciences Spring 1994

Arzt, Donna. "Religious Human Rights in Muslim States of the Middle East and North Africa." Emory International Law Review (Spring 1996) on line

Baderin, Mashood. "Establishing Areas of Common Ground between Islamic Law and International Human Rights," International Journal of Human Rights v. 5 N. 2 (Summer 2001), 72-113.

Berger, Maurits. "Conflicts Law and Public Policy in Egyptian Family Law: Islamic Law Through the Backdoor," The American Journal of Comparative Law v. 50 (2002) 555-594.

Brown, Nathan. "Shari'a and State in the Modern Muslim Middle East," International Journal of Middle East Studies August 1997, 359-76.

Chaudry, Zainab. "The Myth of Misogyny" Albany Law Review Winter 1997, 511-55

Hamzeh, Nizar. "The Duality of the Legal System in Qatar," Middle Eastern Studies January 1994, 79

Hoffmann, Murad. "On the Development of Islamic Jurisprudence," The American Journal of Islamic Social Sciences Spring 1999, 73-92.

Kazemzadeh, Massoud. "Allegory of the Rule (Hukm): Law as Simulcrum in Islam?" History of Religions August 1998, 1

Kelsey, John. "Al-Shaybani and the Islamic Law of War." Journal of Military Ethics v. 2 N. 1 (2003), 63-75. \*

Kennedy, S. "Islamization in Pakistan: Implementation of the Hudud Ordinances," Asian Survey March 1988, 307

Khizr Muazzam Khan. "Juristic Classification of Islamic Law" Houston Journal of International Law August 1983, 23-35

Kian, Azedeh. "Gendered Occupation and Women's Status in Iran" Middle Eastern Studies July 1995, 407 (missing)

Koraytem, Tabet. "Arab Islamic Developments on Human Rights," Kluwer Law International v. 16, n. 3 (2001), 255-262. \*

Kozlowski, Gregory. "Islamic Law in Contemporary South Asia," Muslim World July-October 1997, 221

Luney, Percy R. Jr. "The Judiciary: Its organization and Status in the Parliamentary System" Law and Contemporary Problems Winter 1990 135-162

Mutalib, Hussin. "Islamic Revivalism in ASEAN States," Asian Survey September 1990,

O'Sullivan, D. "The Death Sentence for Mahmoud Muhammad Taha: Misuse of the Sudanese Legal System and Islamic Sharia Law" International Journal of Human Rights v. 5 n. 3 2001 45-70

Prince, Daniel. "Islam and Human Rights: A case of Deceptive First Appearances," v. 41, n. 2 (2002), 213-25. \*

Radford, Mary. "The Inheritance Rights of Women under Jewish and Islamic Law," Boston College International and Comparative Law Review v. 23, n. 135 (2000)135-184 \*

Rehman, Javaid. "Accommodating Religious Identities in an Islamic State: International Law, Freedom of Religion and the Rights of Religious Minorities," International Journal on Minority and Group Rights Vol 7, No. 2, 2000: 139-165

Rezaei, Hassan. "The Iranian Criminal Justice under the Islamization Project," European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice v. 10 n. 1 (2002) 54-69.

Sfeir, George. "Source of Law and the Issue of Legitimacy and Rights," The Middle East Journal Summer 1988, 436

Shaham, Ron. "A Woman's Place: A confrontation with Bedouin Custom in the Sharia Court," Journal of the American Oriental Society April-June 1993, 192

Smirnov, A. "Understanding Justice in an Islamic Context" Philosophy East and West July 1996, 337

Souryal, Sam. "Hand Amputation" Journal of Criminal Justice June 1994, 249-65

Vaziri, H. "The Quest for Gender Justice in the Islamic Republic" Journal of South Asian and Middle Eastern Studies v. 25, n. 1 2001 48-61 (missing)

Wiechman, Dennis, et al. "Islamic Courts and Corrections." International Journal of Comparative and Applied Justice v. 19, n. 1 (Spring, 1995), 33-46.

### Asia

Angle, Stephen C. "Did Someone Say Rights?" Philosophy East and West October 1998 623-52

Araki, Nobuyoshi. "The Flow of Criminal Cases in the Japanese Criminal Justice System" Crime and Delinquency October 1985 601-629

Arup, C. "Lawyers for China-The Impact of Membership of the World Trade Organization on legal Services and law in China," Journal of World Intellectual Property v. 4 n. 5 2001 741-766

Alford, William P. "Law, What Law?" Modern China October 1997 398-420

Baker, Beverly G. "Chinese Law in the Eighties" Albany Law Review Spring 1982



Berkeley, G.W. "'Comparisons and Contrasts of the Legal Systems of the People's Republic of Korea and the People's Republic of China" Asian Profile August 1991 293-302

Bowen, John R. "Qur'an, Justice, Gender: Internal Debates in Indonesian Islamic Jurisprudence," History of Religions August 1998, 52

Bryant, Tami. "Marital Dissolution in Japan: Legal Obstacles and their Impact," Law in Japan v. 17, 1984, 73-97. \*

Chan, Adrian. "Confucianism and Development in East Asia" Journal of Contemporary Asia March 1996 28-46

Dikotter, Frank. "Crime and Punishment in Post Liberation China" The China Quarterly March 1997

Elegant, Robert. "The Singapore of Mr. Lee: 'Confucian Ethics, Asian Values'" Encounter June 1990 21-30

Feinerman, James V. "The Rule of Law ... with Socialist Characteristics" Current History September 1997 278-82

Foote, Daniel H. "The Benevolent Paternalism of Japanese Criminal Justice" California Law Review March 1992 317-390

Fox, Russell. "Confucian and Communitarian Responses to Liberal Democracy" The Review of Politics Summer 1997

Fukuyama, Francis. "Confucianism and Democracy" Journal of Democracy April 1995 20-34

Garon, Sheldon. "The World's Oldest Debate? Prostitution and the State in Imperial Japan" American Historical Review June 1993 710-33

Haley, John O. "Apology and Pardon: Learning from Japan" American Behavioral Scientist March 1998 842-867

Halliday, Fred. "Relativism and Universalism in Human Rights" Political Studies Annual 1995

Hamayotsu, Kikue. "Islam and Nation Building in Southeast Asia: Malaysia and Indonesia in Comparative perspective," Pacific Affairs v. 75, n. 3 (fall 2002) 353-375.

Helms, Udo. "Obscenity and Homosexual Depiction in Japan,"  
Journal of Homosexuality Vol 39, No. 2000: 127-

Hood, Steven J. "The Myth of Asian-style Democracy" Asian Survey  
February 1998 177-

Itoh, Hiroshi. "Judicial Review and Judicial Activism in Japan"  
Law and Contemporary Problems Winter 1990 169-179

Kamata, Taisuke. "Adjudicating and the Governing Process:  
Political Questions and legislative Discretion" Law and  
Contemporary Problems Winter 1990 181-99

Kausikan, Bilahari. "East and Southeast Asia and the post-Cold  
war International Politics of Human Rights" Studies in Conflict  
and Terrorism October-December 1993 241-62

Kazuyo Morita, "The Eugenic Transition of 1996 in Japan: from  
Law to Personal Choice," Disability and Society v. 16, N. 5,  
2001, 765-771.

Kent, Ann. "Waiting for Rights: China's Human Rights and China's  
Constitutions, 1949-1989" Human Rights Quarterly May 1991

Kim, Yung-Myung. "'Asian-style Democracy': A critique from East  
Asia" Asian Survey December 1997 1119-1127

Komiya, Nobuo. "A Cultural Study of the Low Crime Rate in Japan"  
British Journal of Criminology Summer 1999 369-

Lee, Seung-hwan. "Liberal Rights and/or Confucian Values"  
Philosophy East and West 367-80

Ling, L.H.M. "Rationalizations for State Violence in Chinese  
Politics" Journal of Peace Research November 1994 393-406

Liu, Zehua. "On the 'Human' in Confucianism" Journal of  
Ecumenical Studies 313-36

Luney, Percy R. Jr. "Traditions and Foreign Influences: Systems  
of Law in China and Japan" Law and Contemporary Problems Spring  
1989 129-150

Makoto, Kurozumi. "The Nature of Early Tokugawa Confucianism"  
Journal of Japanese Studies Summer 1994 337-76

Marfording, Annette. "Cultural Relativism and the Construction of Culture: An Examination of Japan" Human Rights Quarterly May 1997 431-

Nakatani, Yoji. "Psychiatry and the Law in Japan," International Journal of Law and Psychiatry Vol. 23, No. 5/6, 2000: 589-604

Nomani, Moh. "The Human Rights Environment in India: Legal Precepts and Judicial Doctrines in Critical Perspective," Asia Pacific Journal of International Law Vol 5, No. 2, 2000: 113-134

Orts, Eric W. "The Rule of Law in China," Vanderbilt Journal of International Law v. 34 n. 1 (April 2001) 43-

Pak, Katherine. "Foreign Workers and Law Enforcement in Japan" American Journal of Sociology May 1998 1745-1747 (missing)

Pan Wei. "Toward a Consultative Rule of Law Regime in China," Journal of Contemporary China v. 12, n. 34 (2003), 3-43.

Peerenboom R.P. "Confucian Virtue: Achieving a Humane Society" International Philosophical Quarterly March 1990

Potter, Pitman B. "The Chinese Legal System: Continuing Commitment to the Primacy of State Power" The China Quarterly September 1999

Pye, Lucian. "Civility, Social Capital and Civil Society" The Journal of Interdisciplinary History Spring 1999 763-

Pye, Lucian. "The State and the Individual: An Overview Interpretation" The China Quarterly September 1991 443-67

Radetski, M. "From Communism to Capitalism in Laos: The Legal Dimension" Asian Survey September 1994 799-806

Roy, Denny. "Singapore, China and the 'Soft Authoritarian' Challenge" Asian Survey March 1994 231-243

Scherdin, Lill. "The Creation of 'Strangers' and Punishment in Japan" Social Justice Summer 1994

Sellmann, James D. "The Origin and Role of the State According to the Lushi Chunqui" Asian Philosophy November 1999 193-

Sugawava, Ikuo. "Disputes in Japan: A Cross-cultural Test of the Procedural Justice Model" Social Justice Research June 1994 129-144

Tetsuya Obuchi, "Role of the Court in the Process of Informal Dispute Resolution in Japan," Law in Japan v. 20, 1987, 74-101.

Vaughn, Michael, et al. "Drug Abuse and Anti-drug Policy in Japan: Past History and Future Directions" British Journal of Criminology Autumn 1995 491-524

Wallace, J. Clifford. "Judicial Education and Training in Asia and the Pacific." Michigan Journal of International Law Vol 21 No. 4, Summer 2000: 849-

West, Mark. "Prosecution Review Commissions: Japan's Answer to the Problems of Prosecutorial Discretion" Columbia Law Review April 1992 684-723.

Zhang Xuejun, "Amendment of the Marriage Law in China," International Journal of Law, Policy and the Family v. 16, 2002, 399-409.