1952

Evaluation of the methods used in selecting social studies textbooks for grades one through eight at Lewistown Montana

Steve Matthew Matosich

The University of Montana

Let us know how access to this document benefits you.
Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd

Recommended Citation

Matosich, Steve Matthew, "Evaluation of the methods used in selecting social studies textbooks for grades one through eight at Lewistown Montana" (1952). Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers. 7722.
https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd/7722

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at ScholarWorks at University of Montana. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at University of Montana. For more information, please contact scholarworks@mso.umt.edu.
 EVALUATION OF THE METHODS USED IN SELECTING SOCIAL STUDIES TEXTBOOKS FOR GRADES ONE THROUGH EIGHT AT LEWISTOWN, MONTANA

by

STEVE M. MATOSICH
M.E., MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY, 1952

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education

MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY
This thesis has been approved by the Board of Examiners in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education.

Linus J. Carlton
Chairman of the Board of Examiners

J. Blaisde
Dean of the Graduate School

Date Aug 20 1952
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. THE PROBLEM AND DEFINITIONS OF TERMS USED</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The general importance of the problem</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of terms</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A statement of the organization of chapters</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. A HISTORICAL SURVEY OF THE SELECTION OF TEXTBOOKS IN THE UNITED STATES</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The colonial period</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New England Colonies</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Middle Colonies</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Southern Colonies</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From the Revolution to the Civil War</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>States West of the Appalachians</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. A BRIEF HISTORICAL SURVEY OF TEXTBOOK SELECTION IN MONTANA</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montana as a territory</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montana since statehood</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. TEXTBOOK SELECTION IN LEWISTOWN, MONTANA</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization of textbook selection committee</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gathering textbook materials</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER PAGE

Evaluation........................................... 34

V. METHODS OF EVALUATION ACCEPTED AND IN GENERAL

USE THROUGHOUT THE UNITED STATES.............. 39

Various studies......................................... 39

The San Diego Study.................................... 39

The East St. Louis Study............................... 40

Philadelphia Study...................................... 42

Summary.................................................. 43

Analysis forms......................................... 44

VI. EVALUATION OF THE METHODS USED IN TEXTBOOK

SELECTION IN LEWISTOWN............................ 56

Evaluation of criteria................................. 56

VII. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.... 68

Summary.................................................. 68

Conclusions............................................. 70

Recommendations....................................... 71

BIBLIOGRAPHY............................................ 73

APPENDIX A............................................... 75

APPENDIX B............................................... 82
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Outline Aid for Judging All Texts</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Training of Authors</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Proportional Distribution of Subject Matter</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Proportional Distribution of Illustrative Material</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Quality of Illustrations</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Criteria Most Commonly Used To Select Texts</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

THE PROBLEM

The problem involved in this study is to evaluate the methods used in selecting social studies textbooks for grade one through eight in Lewistown, Montana.

Statement of the problem. The purposes of this study are: (1) to give a historical survey of textbook selection in the United States, and in Montana. (2) to evaluate the methods used by the teachers in the Lewistown Schools in selecting social studies texts for grades one through eight; (3) to ascertain if the criteria used by the Lewistown Schools were adequate, and (4) to make recommendations which might assist other social studies textbook selection committees.

Since the earliest days of America's public education, the task of selecting textbooks suitable to the needs of the learner has been a major problem for teachers and school administrators. In the early days of America's settlement the selection of textbooks was simple because few books were available. Too, the school population was small because the home was the primary means of carrying on education. Also, education was simple in terms of the number of subjects taught.

Today the teacher and school administrator find the selection of textbooks much more complicated because of the
printing press which now makes available a tremendous volume of printed matter including textbooks. The teacher today must select textbooks out of a multitude of varieties of brand names, shapes, and sizes, to say nothing of the contents of the texts as they relate to the subject to be covered, and its utility to the learner.

Textbook selection today requires of the person making the selection a wide knowledge of the subject treated. This is absolutely necessary even if there are certain established criteria of textbook selection established for use within a given school system.

The general importance of the problem. Selecting textbooks for use by students is very important because it will determine to some extent the future behavior of the student once he has used the book to gain certain information. Having the future behavior of hundreds of youngsters to think about, the selector should exercise great care in his choices.

Each textbook is different as to size, shape or perhaps the color. What is more important however, is the person (or persons) who write the book. The author becomes a point of great interest to the selector of a textbook because the book will reflect his training, education, and point of view. The philosophy of the author or book should
fit in with the philosophy of the school for which the text is chosen.

The great diversity in the ways in which textbooks treat a given subject becomes a matter of great concern to the selector. Here, again, his judgment may exert a strong influence on the lives of pupils using the text he selects.

Because the choices are many, and the results of choices are important, a good textbook selection cannot be too strongly emphasized.

DEFINITION OF TERMS

Texts. Throughout this study the term, text or texts, will be construed to be synonymous with textbook or textbooks as the case may be.

Textbook selection. The term textbook selection will be used to mean the selection of textbooks by a person (or persons) duly authorized by law or administrative direction, and having the knowledge and resources to do the job.

Textbook selection committee. In this paper the term, textbook selection committee, will refer to the committee which was appointed by the school administration at Lewistown, Montana to select social studies textbooks for use in the elementary grades of that school system.
Social studies. Herein, social studies is used to refer to the following subjects in the following grades: grades one through three, social reading; grades four through six, geography and history; grades seven and eight, history.

The specific need for such a study in Lewistown, There seemed to be some evidence that the committee appointed by the Superintendent of Schools to select social studies texts for grades one through eight used, on numerous occasions, procedures for selection which were questionable. Consequently, this study has been undertaken in order to determine whether or not such procedures and methods of textbook evaluation were in line with those acceptable to authorities in the field.

A statement of the organization of chapters. Chapter One indicates the purpose and importance of the study. It also defines the special terms used and explains the chapter organization of the study. Chapter Two contains a brief historical survey of public school development in the United States as it relates to text selection. Chapter Three presents a brief historical survey of text selection in Montana as a territory, and as a state. Chapter Four shows how the textbook selection committee was chosen and organized in Lewistown, and what evaluative materials were used and
what methods were used by the committee in making final selection of texts. Chapter Five attempts to bring together the methods of evaluation accepted by authorities and in fairly common use throughout the United States. This includes studies that were made in San Diego, St. Louis, and Philadelphia. Chapter Six is an effort to evaluate the work actually done by the Textbook Selection Committee in terms of the criteria set up in Chapter Five. Chapter Seven draws conclusions, summarizes, and makes certain recommendations which may be helpful to other committees charged with textbook selection.
CHAPTER II

HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT LEADING TO THE PROBLEM OF TEXTBOOK SELECTION

THE COLONIAL PERIOD

The plan used in this chapter is to trace the problem of textbook selection as it shows up in the various stages of the development of the American school system. Because of the lack of original sources from which to glean material regarding early textbooks, as well as the methods of their selection, it was decided to survey the history of public schools and from the material attempt to draw certain basic conclusions regarding the selection of textbooks. In addition to tracing the problem of textbook selection, the historical data gleaned should lend itself to add as a base of knowledge to aid in understanding the actual problem of selecting textbooks.

New England Colonies. Textbook selection was not a problem when America was first settled. Training through apprenticeship was the fundamental plan for education in all the colonies during the seventeenth century—a plan which colonists brought with them from Europe. Under this plan of education certain classes were exempt. As Monroe states, "children whose parents were able to give them a
literary education, and whose wealth would keep them from want, were exempt. All other children must receive a training in some vocation."¹

In the early part of the seventeenth century the New England school system was better developed than that of the South. This was true because of its greater density of population, and because of its trading industries which later gave rise to industrial development. However, in Massachusetts in the year 1642, a law was passed which said in effect that children under the care of their parents or masters were to learn to read and write, or learn a vocation. This law was enforced by fining people if they did not conform.

According to Monroe, the first general law providing for schools was passed in 1647 by the Massachusetts Bay Colony. Its motive is indicated in the following passage.

It being one chief project of that old deluder, Satan, to keep men from the knowledge of the scriptures, as, in former times, keeping them from the use of tongues; so that at last the true sense and meaning of the original might be clouded and corrupted with false glosses of graves of our forefathers, in Church and Commonwealth, the Lord assisting our endeavors;²

It being a major endeavor to keep Satan out of their homes, elementary schools were required to be established in every town of fifty families, and a Latin school in every town of one hundred families. The law of 1647 can be regarded as the foundation of the American Public School system. The voluntary custom of most towns was now made obligatory on all towns of fifty or more families.

New Hampshire was a part of Massachusetts at this time and remained so for some time. Upon obtaining a separate legislature, in 1693, New Hampshire, passed a law incorporating the compulsory school provisions of 1647 but with an addition; mainly that building of churches, ministers' houses, schoolhouses, and salaries of schoolmasters in each town should be raised by an equal rate and assessment upon the inhabitants. This then is the earliest free school system in the colonies.

In 1650, Connecticut passed a law patterned after the law of 1647 which did the same for school control as in New Hampshire and Massachusetts. The private school and the Dame School having become universal features were intimately incorporated in the public schools.

It was thus noticeable that a decline in apprenticeship education was taking place while in its place arose a

---

3 Ibid., p. 135.

4 Ibid., p. 124.
new and different type of educational institution. This
decline in apprenticeship education in America was due in
part to the decline taking place in England at that time.
In England the government was no longer desirous of help­ing
the guilds maintain their monopoly. The courts were
indifferent; only London remained a center where guilds
retained their power.

In the colonies guilds did not exist, but the appren­ticeship system was a direct outgrowth of the guild system
in England. The spirit of individual liberty, however, was
developing; labor was fluid; land abundant, and natural
resources were available. Thus the economic system in
America was not to be saddled with a system of "no change"
which was the result of an apprenticeship system.

Down to the close of the Revolutionary war the schools
of the American colonies were largely supplied with English
school books or reprints in this country of works by British
compilers. After the separation from the Mother Country,
American practitioners of the teaching craft were prompt
to compile texts on most of the subjects taught in the
common school. While the break with Great Britain greatly
stimulated the school book industry and gave a greater
variety in texts, in one field, reading, the situation was

5 Will S. Monroe, Early American School Books, A
Brief Historical Survey. pp. 59-60.
different. For instance, Keats, Chaucer, Shelley and others, who were English authors furnished a great part of the content of the readers. Consequently, when their writings were taken out of the readers, the loss was marked.

At the time, the book-making industry was not as centralized as it is today and the titles of books frequently designated the name of the section of the country where the books were printed. Examples of this were the New York State readers, the Vermont spelling book, etc. For nearly half a century school books were printed in villages and towns, where there were newspaper or job printing establishments; and the use of such books tended to be limited to local areas.

Obviously, little selecting or adapting was required under such conditions. In most cases schoolmasters had to accept what books were available or go without. Therefore, textbook selection during this period of time was virtually nil.

The Middle Colonies. The Middle Colonies like the New England Colonies had an apprenticeship system of education. Textbooks were not used at that time, and consequently, textbook selection was no problem. The development of schools, however, brought about the need for some form of basic educational materials. The textbook was an outgrowth
of that particular demand just as the Hornbook was an outgrowth of religious educational teaching.

The Middle Colonies such as Maryland, Pennsylvania, and Delaware, experimented with a church-state school system. Monroe states that the government supported, contributed to, supervised, authorized and tolerated these schools. At the same time the government did not assume full responsibility for them. Thus, the Middle Colonies had moved much nearer to church dominated schools than the New England Colonies. It is reasonable to assume that the Bible, the Psalter, the Hornbook, and other religious books were about the only books used, and therefore, textbook selection by the schoolmasters or the dames was relatively unimportant at that time.

The Southern Colonies. About two hundred years after the procedure of apprenticeship was established in 1642, the state of Virginia passed a law (1846) which established a school for poor apprentices. Under that law, justices of the peace, at their discretion, could bind out children to husbandmen or tradesmen to be brought up in some good or lawful calling. Boys had to serve such an apprenticeship until they were twenty-one; girls until they were eighteen. According to Monroe, in 1701 a provision was

---8---


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
added to the law which stated, "the master of every such orphan shall be obliged to teach him to read and write." Virginia thus got its first law which required literary training.

**Summary.** Formal education, from 1607 to 1775, came through provisions of the laws for artificers, apprentices, orphans, and paupers. At the same time the feeling was generally shared that religious, vocational, and literary education was unimportant. However, there was a continued growth of private, charitable, and privately endowed schools. For the upper classes tutors were employed in the home.

Monroe points out that "many of the textbooks used in the schools of the colonial period in America were imported from England or were American reprints of English publications, but by 1800 they were being replaced by the products of American authors." Consequently, "until after 1800 little or no attention was given to the appraisal of textbooks."

**FROM THE REVOLUTION TO THE CIVIL WAR**

**New England States.** After the Revolutionary War,
and especially after the turn of the nineteenth century, many textbooks were available for use by American school children though the number of academic subjects covered were few. Monroe, amplifies this statement when he indicates that the evils of the time intensified the individualism of the method. There was a multiplicity of texts for the entire system, for the pupil, and also for a given subject, school or class. Each child furnished his own book and thus followed his own wishes or that of his parents in selecting it.

While there was a great deal of diversity in the textbooks which children used in school, the years following the revolution marked quite an advance in the number of textbooks by American authors. Monroe also states that one of the earliest American authors was Jedediah Morse. In 1784 he issued his Geography Made Easy, the first American text on the subject. Thus the social studies had its first textbook. In 1789 there followed the American Geography Or A View Of the Present Situation of the United States; in 1797, Elements of Geography and in 1814, Universal Geography.

11 Ibid., p. 349.
Morse, then, was one of the first early-American authors. In view of the type of book he wrote one can with some justification say that his books were of a social studies nature, that is, if one thinks in terms of the subjects taught today in the social studies. There were at this time other American authors in other subjects. Perhaps one of the most influential of these writers was Noah Webster. His book, *Grammatical Institutes of the English Language* was composed of grammar, reading and spelling. His *American Speller*, which was the by product of *Grammatical Institutes*, and which sold seventy-five million copies, attested to the popularity of his books.

Lindley Murray 1745-1826, an educator from New York, wrote books on grammar, reading, and spelling. Murray wrote in virtually the same subject areas as Webster, and a rivalry developed between the two.

The main change in the books published by Morse, Webster, and Murray, as compared with books of pre-revolutionary days, was in the content. The earlier books consisted primarily of the *Catechism*, the *New England Primer*, the *Psalter*, and the *Bible*.

With the increase in the number of books available to the pupils, diversity, as emphasized previously, became an even greater problem. The first attempt to do anything about this problem was made by Horace Mann of Massachusetts.
As secretary of the State Board of Education, Mann gave the district boards the authority to select uniform texts for one school. This authority, however, was a long time granted before being used.

Monroe notes that "in 1846 the Connecticut secretary reported two hundred and fifteen different textbooks in use in the state, of which ninety-two were readers and thirty were arithmetics."\(^{12}\)

Prior to the Civil War the New England States were fortunate in that they had two outstanding American educators in their midst, Horace Mann of Massachusetts and Henry Barnard of Connecticut. These men were aware of the need for uniformity of textbook selection as indicated by Mann's giving authority to local districts to select texts, and by Barnard's report on the diversity of texts in Connecticut. Under the guidance of these two men the New England States lead the way toward uniform and proper selection of textbooks.

**The Middle States.** The New England States and the Middle States differed in regard to the establishment of the type of schools in the two areas. In the Middle States educational control was centralized. For example, in New York in 1841 the office of county superintendent was estab-

\(^{12}\) Ibid., p. 346.
lished. The year 1842 saw establishment of town supervisors and commissioners. A provision in 1856 stipulated the necessity for training teachers. Thus, centralization of control became stronger with the years.

Other states followed a similar course but somewhat later. Pennsylvania, for instance, did not adopt the free school system based on district organization until 1886.

Because of retardation in the Middle States in adopting centralized control of educational facilities, it is understandable that provision for the adoption of uniform textbooks was not prevalent until late in the 1800's when centralization of control was inaugurated.

The Southern States. Because of conflict in Virginia between the aristocratic and democratic forces in regard to the establishment of schools, Virginia, in 1818, established a system of elementary schools of the charity and pauper type. In 1846 a law permitting a county system was enacted. Taxation was left to the counties.

North Carolina, under the leadership of Caleb H. Wiley, established a school fund in 1825; a free school law in 1839, and in 1853 raised the standards of schools and stepends for teachers.

Georgia, established a fund in 1817. A charity school system was established in 1822; a free school system
in 1837. Up to the Civil War there was little change in Georgia's school system.

Other southern states were even more retarded than those mentioned. Retardation in the development of a system of public schools in the southern states is understandable, however, since there was no middle class to give impetus to free public schools.

Since a considerable portion of the southern schools were of the charity type, it may be presumed that a different type of textbook would be used from that used in the free public schools. Monroe lists a number of "proper books" to be used in Charity Schools. A Bible, New Testament, Common Prayer Book, The Church Catechism, Bishop Gaftrel's Christian Institutes, The Church Catechism Broke Into Short Questions, Lewis' Exploration of the Church Catechism, The Whole Duty of Man By Way of Question and Answer, The Anatomy of Orthography were the books deemed proper in the Charity Schools of the first half of the 1800's. Under such an arrangement the selection of textbooks would be nil except by those persons who controlled the school. The public schools did not hold any greater promise than the Charity Schools in this respect since there was little consistency in public school practices.

\[13\] Ibid., p. 90.
States West of the Appalachians. The Middle Western States were not guided by tradition or custom in building their educational institutions. They were able to profit by the experience of the East and the South. Many settlers from New England were influential in helping to establish the necessary machinery for public schools. Ohio, for instance, was able to pass a general school law in 1838. State, county, and permissive district taxes were levied for the support of schools.

In Indiana the early population was drawn from the southern states. Because of the close association to southern education, there was a great deal of resentment against centralized control of education. As a result of this attitude, private schools, subsidies by the state, and a decentralized district system developed. Indiana, however, was the first state to make constitutional provisions for a general system of education ascending in regular gradation from township schools to a state university. \[14\]

Illinois followed a pattern similar to that of Indiana, but the differences between the southern part of the state, which adhered to private schools and decentralization of control, and the northern part which had more centralized control were pronounced.

\[14\] Ibid., pp. 289-93.
The best illustration of outside influence was Michigan which experimented with French and German ideas in shaping her school laws. Despite the many differences among these states, during the 1850's many of them adopted new constitutions and made liberal provision for public schools.

In view of the fact that states west of the Appalachian mountains were much younger as compared to the states along the Atlantic Seaboard, they gained much from the experiences of the older states. Too, they became states at a period of time when American textbook writers were beginning to enter the field in greater numbers. Thus, these states were saved the experience of having books imported from England and having such imports cease when the Revolutionary War brought on a distaste for everything British.

About the time when the Middle Western States were adopting new Constitutions, (the 1850's) James Monteith, S. S. Cornell, and Francis McNally published several series of three, four and five graded books.15

The following list of early texts was compiled from Monroe's Early American School Books.16

15 Will S. Monroe, Early American School Books, A Brief Historical Survey. (p. 64.)
16 Ibid., pp. 59-65.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of book and author</th>
<th>Date published</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author unknown</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hornbook</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>about 1450</td>
<td>Consisted of a board with handle upon which was a sheet of paper; included the alphabet, benediction, and Roman numerals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEOGRAPHY TEXTBOOKS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Jedediah Morse</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Geography Made Easy</td>
<td>1784</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Elements of Geography, or A View of the Present Situation of the United States</td>
<td>1789</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Elements of Geography</td>
<td>1797</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Universal Geography</td>
<td>1814</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Elijah Parrish</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Universal Geography</td>
<td>1807</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. New System of Modern and Sacred Geography</td>
<td>after 1807</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Nathaniel Dwight</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Comprehensive System</td>
<td>1810</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By J. A. Cummings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction to Modern and Ancient Geography</td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Joseph Worcester</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Geographical Dictionary</td>
<td>1817</td>
<td>His three dictionaries competed with those of Noah Webster for many years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Elements of Geography</td>
<td>1818</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Scriptural Geography</td>
<td>1828</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. School History</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Daniel Adams</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Geography--A Description of the United States</td>
<td>1823</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of book and author</td>
<td>Date published</td>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Wm. C. Woodbridge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>Rudiments of Geography</em></td>
<td>1822</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. <em>Universal Geography</em></td>
<td>later</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Jesse Olney</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>Common School Geography</em></td>
<td>1834</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By James Montieth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>First Lessons in Geography</em></td>
<td>1850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montieth, S. S. Cornell and Francis McNally started a three, four, and five graded series.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Arnold Guyot</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>Physical Geography</em></td>
<td>after 1854</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Swinton, Redway, Appleton, Harper</td>
<td>1870-1890</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>Geographies</em></td>
<td></td>
<td>Most popular at this time. A lot like those of Montieth, McNally and Cornell.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Alexis E. Frye</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>Child and Nature</em></td>
<td>1888</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. <em>Primary Geography</em></td>
<td>1894</td>
<td>Had a great deal of success.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. <em>Complete Geography</em></td>
<td>1895</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISTORY TEXTBOOKS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Benjamin Harris</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>New England Primer</em></td>
<td>1687</td>
<td>One of the first books on history.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Mrs Emma Hart Willard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>History of the United States</em></td>
<td>1828</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of book and author</th>
<th>Date published</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Universal History</td>
<td>1837</td>
<td>By 1853 had twelve editions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. English History</td>
<td></td>
<td>followed those above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. History of the Republic of America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Ancient History</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Wm. Swinton</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. First Book of History for Children and Youth</td>
<td>1832</td>
<td>Compiled some eighty school books, published a dozen histories under his name and pseudonym &quot;Peter Parley&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. American Child's Pictorial History of the United States</td>
<td>1865</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Condensed School History of the United States</td>
<td>1871</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the foregoing compilation one can readily realize that selecting textbooks, especially in geography or history, during the period from 1678, (the New England Primer to a Complete Geography 1895) would not be difficult since there were scarcely more than one or two important books printed at any one time. Taking note of the fact that textbook printing in this country has now reached a volume many times greater than any time previous to 1900, it can be expected that the problems of textbook selection one hundred or even fifty years ago were not as many nor as complex.

The following chapter is concerned with the history.
of textbook selection in Montana. Because the study is concerned with selecting textbooks in Lewistown, Montana, it seemed pertinent that a better understanding of the problem could be had by finding out the methods of textbook selection which have been used in this state.

Because textbook selection in Montana was centered around the State Textbook Commission, which was the duly appointed body to secure uniform texts, most of Chapter Three deals with the history of that commission.
CHAPTER III

A BRIEF HISTORICAL SURVEY OF THE TEXTBOOK COMMISSION
IN MONTANA

Montana as a territory. In the first regular session of the governing body for the Montana Territory which was held in 1864 very definite instruction was given school directors regarding textbooks.

It shall be the duty of the directors to visit the schools of their respective districts at least once each term. They shall endeavor, in connection with the county superintendent, to procure the introduction of a good and uniform system of school books in the district.17

This law was the first enacted in the Montana Territory pertaining to school books and their uniformity. Obviously, the execution of such a law was almost impossible due to vast distances between schools, hard winters, lack of personnel, as well as to the fact that parents had to buy the books. Because families had to buy their books, there was great heterogeneity in school books used by pupils. By 1870 the problem had become important enough that the legislature more or less gave the territorial superintendent of public instruction complete charge of the matter and he set about to select a uniform series of books for the schools of the territory.

In the Biennial Report for the years 1872-73-74 Cornelius Hedges\(^{18}\) states that he based his selection of books upon the comparative number of any one kind available, and those which would accommodate the most and discommode the smallest number of pupils. He realized that these were not very sound principles of selection, but transportation, communication, and prices being what they were a person was hard put to select by merit alone. Hedges realized, too, that his selections were only of a recommendatory nature.

Westby states that, "A careful perusal of the statutes of the territorial legislature during this time (1870-78) reveals nothing that would enable the authorities to enforce any uniform textbook adoption."\(^{19}\) Wright,\(^{20}\) in his Biennial Report for 1877-78 bemoans the excessive varieties of textbooks. He also recommended that a textbook commission be appointed which would secure a uniform system of textbooks for the use of the public schools.


\(^{20}\) C. Wright, Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction for the Years 1877-78. p. 6. Copy to be found in the Montana Historical Library, Helena, Montana
No action was taken on Wright's suggestion, however, until 1885 when an act to create a school textbook commission was undertaken as is shown by Wylie's Biennial Report of 1885, Section I states,

There is hereby created a commission to be known as the school textbook commission. Said commission shall consist of the territorial superintendent of public instruction, and two other persons, one of whom shall be a practical teacher, to be appointed by the governor, by and with the advice and consent of the legislative council. They shall hold office till the end of the session of the next legislative assembly.21

During the same year the legislature passed a law which required each school district to make a yearly report which served as an affidavit that the required books were being used. If the adopted textbooks were not used, the county was to forfeit twenty-five percent of the county fund.

As far as selection of textbooks in the Montana Territory was concerned, it must be recognized that uniformity was impossible as long as parents were required to provide the textbooks. Not until 1897 was the first provision written into law allowing for free textbooks. This set the stage for uniform textbook adoption. The textbook commission and state legislature were more apt to agree on the necessity for uniformity of texts than many parents who did not understand the need for uniformity of

texts among students.

Though it is mentioned in the law of 1864 that the superintendent was to endeavor to procure uniform texts, there was no actual means of enforcing such a law because there was no law making specific requirements of enforcement mandatory. Because of this, the superintendent could only recommend that certain textbooks be used.

**Montana since statehood.** It should be noted that Westby mentions the textbook commission as an advisory group. There is nothing specifically mentioned in the law which bears this out, but the work of the commission was obviously of an advisory nature, because there is nothing in the law which empowers it to be otherwise. It functioned along those lines until 1897, when the house passed another bill to create a textbook commission which was to be composed of seven members; the Superintendent of Public Instruction, Attorney General, Presidents of the State University and College, and three public school teachers to be appointed by the governor.

Upon its re-creation in 1897, the commission was to meet yearly on the first Monday in May and was empowered to select uniform textbooks for the state. This re-creation gave it a much more permanent and official capacity. Also included in the law was the first provision for free text.

-----22-----

Westby, op. cit., pp. 15-17.
books, if by majority vote the voters of a district so desired. Thus the selection of textbooks and the provision for free textbooks was assured by the law of 1897.

In 1903 some changes were made in the law of 1897. The meeting dates were changed (from May to the first week of October), length of terms, and oath of office. In 1905 the law was changed so that five of the seven members had to be teachers. Also, the term of office was lengthened from three to five years. No further changes were made until 1913 and those were of a minor nature. From 1913 to 1941 textbook selection continued with little or no change. In 1941 the legislature enacted into law a code to set up a state textbook library. The law requires that any company selling textbooks in Montana must file a copy with the State Department of Education and post a bond concerning prices and other data.

The law further stipulates that textbooks for all schools shall be selected by the district superintendent or principal with the approval of his board of trustees. Textbooks for one and two room schools shall be selected by the county superintendent of schools upon the recommendation of a committee of three who shall be actively engaged in school work.

---

23 Session Laws of Montana, Chapter 138, 1941
24 School Laws of Montana, Chapter 111, Section 2, 1949, p. 111.
25 Revised Codes of Montana, Volume 4, Section 75-3510., 1947, p. 927.
Today the Montana State Textbook Library acts as the depository for school books being sold by book companies. The Superintendent of Public Instruction compiles lists of such books annually and they are sent to school officials throughout the state. This greatly facilitates the opportunity of school administrators to compile lists of texts to be evaluated for selection.

In summary it should be noted that textbook selection in Montana has changed from a state function to a state and local district function. By this is meant that the state, which prior to 1941 actually did select lists of books from which textbooks had to be chosen, presently functions only as a depository of such books as publishers have to sell. Thus, the state acts as a guardian for the local districts by setting definite laws and standards which textbook companies must meet before selling books in Montana. On the other hand, the district is responsible for the actual selection of the textbooks to be used.

The next chapter will discuss the formulation of the Lewistown Textbook Selection Committee, and what steps were taken to gather materials and to evaluate the texts chosen for recommendation to the administration.
Organization of textbook selection committee. It was the feeling of the teachers from the various schools in Lewistown that the social studies texts being used throughout the system were old and dilapidated. About ten years had elapsed since any major textbook selections in that field had been made. The fact that a major war had been fought in that period certainly contributed to the obsolescence of the texts. Hard use by many students provided the other reason for change.

The teachers let it be known to their principals that there was a need for new social studies texts. The Elementary School Supervisor (and Principal of the Junior High School) presented the teachers' views to the Superintendent. The Superintendent indicated that for the following year there would be available enough money to buy textbooks. Therewith, a committee composed of the following people was chosen by the administration to study the situation and make recommendations for the new texts: Glenn Darling, chairman of the committee; Steve Matosich and Harriet Cole from the Junior High School; Earl Rohrbaugh, Alice Allison and Lena Duncan from Highland Park School; Hazel Joslyn and
Marion Jones from the Garfield School; Bruce Rafn and Ann Donahue from the Lincoln School; and Helen O'Dea and Carrol Eliason from the High School.

The textbook selection committee was told to work within two administrative policies:

1. That geography be dealt with as a separate subject between the grades three through six; but that where possible history and geography be parallel.

2. That selection be made on a series basis at least through grade six.

The committee did not set up a regular schedule of meetings, but thought it best to hold a series of meetings from four to six weeks apart. Meetings were to be called upon notice from the chairman, Mr. Darling.

The committee held its first meeting in November, 1950. The preliminary meeting was designed to consider as a group the philosophy behind the social studies program, and the types of textbooks which would best fit into such a philosophy. It was generally agreed that only a vague idea of what is meant by school philosophy existed among teachers in the school system. It was agreed that faculties ought to try to come to some understanding regarding their school's philosophy at the beginning of a school year so individual teachers could teach in reasonable harmony with such a philosophy. This idea was not developed any further, however.
In selecting textbooks it appears to be important that the selectors understand what particular educational philosophy is accepted by teachers and administrators of the system. There can be little question as to the importance of this. Educators do lay stress upon the importance of selecting textbooks which have a philosophy in line with the school and community. As Oberholtzer\textsuperscript{26} suggests, there should be assurance that the organization, philosophy, and point of view are in harmony with that of the educational program. J. J. Straight, Superintendent of Schools, Fairmont, West Virginia, backs up Oberholtzer when he says, "Content should conform to philosophy of teaching in the school system."\textsuperscript{27}

The chairman of the Textbook Selection Committee desired that a check list for use in making the selection be compiled in the preliminary meeting. This, however, was tabled until the following meeting.

The second meeting was held December 12, 1950. At this meeting objectives for teaching a social studies course were agreed upon, and a checklist devised. (This will be covered more thoroughly later in the chapter.)

\textsuperscript{26} Superintendents, "How Should Textbooks Be Selected." \textit{Journal of Education}, 123:52-83, February, March 1940.

\textsuperscript{27} Superintendents, op. cit.
Gathering textbook materials. The Elementary Supervisor, who was also chairman of the committee, made a list of textbooks from other lists submitted by the Superintendent of Public Instruction, the State Textbook Library, the County Superintendent, and by textbook companies through their representatives. The list was then compiled, dittoed and sent to members of the committee. (See Appendix A.)

The question often arises as to whether or not it is necessary to notify publishers officially that textbooks are being selected. Nothing is mentioned in the School Laws of Montana, Chapter 111, 1941, which is the latest information on school laws regarding textbooks, to the effect that publishers have to be notified. However, the law does state that:

The superintendent of public instruction shall annually, and at such other time or times as he may deem expedient, beginning on or before August 1, 1941, send to each school official within the state a copy of all lists of school textbooks then on file in his office, showing the prices at which such books may be purchased. 

It is reasonable to assume, therefore, that since textbooks have to be filed with the state superintendent's office, there is no need of official notification. Company representatives can keep informed of the requests to the superintendent's office by administrators and thereby know which schools

28 School Laws of Montana, op. cit., Section 8, p. 112.
are planning to select new texts.

On the other hand, it is worthwhile for administrators to notify publishers of their intention to select new textbooks in order to get first hand information from them regarding their textbooks. The importance of selecting texts demands thoroughness in every way, and not to give a publisher a chance to properly display his wares would interfere with a textbook committee's proper performance of its function. Thus, the methods used to collect textbook materials have a bearing on the possible quality of the item finally selected.

**Evaluation.** As was mentioned previously, the second meeting of the committee was on December 12, 1950. At that meeting a check list was formulated. Teaching objectives for a social studies course were also agreed upon. The check list produced by the committee is in part original. Other parts are adaptations from various sources which the teachers had at their disposal. Following is the check list set up by the committee:

1. Appeal to students.
2. Vocabulary and style. Reading difficulty should be one year below grade level.
3. Kind and value of teaching aids.
   
   A. Maps. Should contain pertinent details, and good colors. Should also include polar and air projection.
B. Illustrations. Should actually be teaching aids.

C. Projects at the end of the chapter should be meaningful.

C. Good table of content.

4. Content. The content material should meet the objectives as set up by the Textbook Selection Committee. The philosophy of the book (or books) should be in harmony with the philosophy of the school. There should be a balance in the presentation of the content. Concepts should be fully developed.

5. Success of the author in selecting and organizing materials in terms of aims and objectives of the course as defined by the teachers.

6. Mechanical qualities
   A. Cover
   B. Binding
   C. Paper and color
   D. Printing: Type and illustrations.

7. Organization
   A. A few large significant units— not encyclopedic.

   B. Problem approach

8. Integration of series
   A. Vertical. Are ideas developed from previous
experiences well planned from the lowest to the highest grade?

B. Horizontal. In as far as possible, are geography and history presented as somewhat parallel; in other words, world history and world geography should be together? Is there a history or geography series that present these areas simultaneously?

9. Recency. Copyright should be as recent as possible.

10. Student evaluation. When used in the upper grades it can be of great value.

The following are the teaching objectives which it was hoped the textbooks selected would aid the teacher in putting across to the student.

1. Interdependence. Man upon environment, man upon man, man upon home, man upon the community, community upon the state, state upon the nation, and nation upon the world.

2. Conservation. Should be in the broadest sense.

3. Democracy. Not a definition, but the development of attitude and skills for use in a working democracy.


5. Appreciation of other peoples and cultures. Understanding of common drives of all men. Seeing cultural patterns as growing out of environment.

6. Understanding and awareness of contemporary
problems

7. Geographic skills or relationships.
   A. How to use a map.
   B. World in space.
   C. Interaction of man and environment.
   D. Economic patterns in various parts of the world.
   E. Geographic patterns in various parts of the world.
   F. Geopolitics.

Evaluation of textbooks by the committee followed the development of the check list and the objectives enumerated above. Before actually beginning to evaluate the textbooks listed, the committee was broken into smaller groups with the expressed purpose of making the groups more functional and at the same time making it possible for them to cover the rather large project. Teachers were assigned to areas with which they were most familiar, thereby lessening the chance of haphazard selection. The Primary Committee was composed of Hazel Joslyn, Alice Allison, Marion Jones and Lena Duncan. On the Intermediate Grades Committee were Earl Rohrbaugh, Ann Donahue and Bruce Rafn. The Upper Grades, or Junior High School Committee was Harriet Cole and Steve Matosich.

By the date set for the committee's second meeting,
December 12, most of the textbook companies listed had placed copies of their textbooks with the supervisor who made them available to the various sub-committees.

It should be mentioned here that all the members of the committee had full teaching schedules except Mr. Darling, who had a full administrative schedule. Mr. Rafn, Principal of the Lincoln School, had a full teaching schedule plus all the administrative duties. Miss Joslyn, Principal of the Garfield School, had a similar load. This is mentioned because it would appear that the time available from the formation of the committee in November to the final recommendations on May 1, was hardly adequate.

As the books were received by the sub-committees they were evaluated by each member. Upon completing the survey of the books for a particular grade area the members got together and decided upon the three best from those evaluated. April 9, was designated as the date for recommending the three best series or three best books as the case might be. The recommendations were to be in written form and were to include reasons for each choice. This procedure is in line with techniques suggested by J. J. Straight\(^\text{29}\) that the committee should, for final analysis reduce the number to three or four. This was done and at

\(^{29}\) Superintendents, op. cit.
the meeting of April 9, reports were made by sub-committee chairman regarding their selections.

As some of the sub-committees did not have time to list their selections as first choice, second choice, and third choice with accompanying recommendations, May 1, was set as the date for all final reports to be made to the superintendent.
CHAPTER V

METHODS OF EVALUATION ACCEPTED AND IN GENERAL USE THROUGHOUT THE UNITED STATES

Various studies. The purpose of this chapter is to review the procedures and criteria used by outstanding textbook committees in adopting textbooks. Common procedures and criteria used by these groups will be used as yardsticks against which to measure the work of the Lewistown Textbook Selection Committee.

First, the work of committees in three major cities, San Diego, St. Louis, and Philadelphia, will be reported. Following these, criteria as developed by various authorities will be presented.

The San Diego Study.

While there seems to be no single "best way" or even "best organization" in selecting and adopting basic textbooks, a general outline of desirable characteristics may be useful in judging any specific organization.

1. Representative teachers working in a given field should be the ones with the deciding voice in the selection of books for recommendation to the superintendent and through him to the legally constituted governing body which officially adopts basic textbooks.

2. Selections should be based upon the degree to which the books contribute to the objectives of the course for which they are being considered.

3. In basic adoptions a minimum of four months is
needed for careful evaluation of the most likely three or four titles. Trial sets should be used in class during this time.

4. School systems should attempt to conserve the time of the teacher groups by providing for them clerical help, statistical help, expert aid in the use of objective measurements of books, and other assistance.

Suggested: Substitutes be hired, or at least free the teacher on textbook committees from extra curricular and other committee responsibilities.

5. Treat all publishing houses and their agents fairly and equally, playing no favorites. No matter what is involved, book selection should be a professional, not a political matter.30

The East St. Louis Study.

In selecting books, a number of factors should be scientifically considered.

1. Mechanical makeup of the books: (a) size approximately 5" x 8"; attractive; paper should be substantial, unglazed and in type large enough to be easily read. Lines should not be broken by pictures, inset which detract from the usability of the book. Fine print should be reduced to a minimum.

2. Authority: Note author and date of publication. Author should be a recognized writer in the field. The publishing house should be recognized in so far as we recognize this axiomatic fact that generally the best publishers get the service of the best authors that have done work in recent times.

3. Objectives: Keep objectives of the courses given in the East St. Louis High School clearly in mind. The book is a tool which is used in achieving specified goals. The book must be the one which best fits the course.

4. Contents: The contents of the book should be analyzed. This analysis should be made to determine the quality of the material, its accuracy, and its adherence to the essentials of the curriculum. The contents should be measured precisely in terms of the written course of study.

5. Pupil Helps: Attention should be given to those parts which enable the student to become independent. (1) table of contents, (2) material on subject matter, (3) index, (4) preview and review, (5) summary, (6) points covering different phases of the subject, (7) bibliography, (8) practical exercises.

6. Units of Work: Books should be selected on the philosophy of the school which is based on so many units to be mastered. Thus the book selected should allow for teaching by the unit method.

7. Illustrations: Should be clear, pertinent, in close juxta position to related reading material. Maps should be accurate, graphs pertinent, and other material should have a functional value. Illustrations should not be used for padding.

8. Vocabulary: Should be judged according to Thornkike's vocabulary list. It should be carefully studied to see that it is in keeping with the intellectual level of students in the school.


10. Functional Subject Matter: No book that does not mold human character and promote the objectives of public education should be considered at all.

Procedure: Chairman of departments call teachers together to discuss the following:

1. Name of book in use and when it was introduced.
2. Courses now offered where change is necessary.
4. Orders for sample books that would liked to be had.
5. Detailed report on such meetings due (specific time), 15th in this case.
Scoring Textbooks: Every book examined will be scored on the above ten points. The book will be rated from zero which is total inadequacy to ten which represents a perfect score in the element being considered. Complete score; between zero and one-hundred. These ratings will be the first factor in affecting the decision. The second factor will be the vote of the department. The book with the highest rating will be the officially adopted book.

Rating book company representatives: (1) accuracy, (2) thoroughness of knowledge of text, (3) ability to do business with time limit set, (4) accuracy of presentation, (5) ability to present salient features briefly and consistently, (6) absence of criticism of competitive texts. 31

Philadelphia Study.

Philadelphia teachers not only may use any one of a number of approved books, but they also evaluate books and select those to be placed on the approved list.

Book listing committees are formed in each of the major divisions in the elementary school (grades 1 to 6, and kindergarten and nursery school), the junior high school (grades 7-9), and the senior high and vocational technical schools (grades 10-12). Committees are composed of from five to eight teachers, principals, and/or supervisors chosen because of ability in the area.

Thirty-three committees operate in the following areas:

Elementary textbook listing committees:


Junior High School textbook listing committee:


Senior High-Vocational Technical School textbook listing committee:


Summary. It would seem that in Philadelphia some of the committees overlap in function. Too, there being three committees of each kind requires much more articulation than would be required if committees were integrated.

The East St. Louis study is much more comprehensive than either of the other two presented. However, it is a much older study and it does not necessarily follow that the same practices are being carried on today. However, there is a lot of material in the study which can be assimilated into any set of criteria which may be formulated by other textbook selection committees.

The San Diego study is not really a study of the criteria which are usually used in textbook selection. It is more a study of what methods to follow when selecting texts.

The three studies presented are not intended to give the latest criteria for text selection, but are to provide examples of what has been done in the field by various school systems.

Analysis forms. Fowlkes has made quite a comprehensive form to follow in compiling data for selecting textbooks. Presented here are portions of the form with some variations.

TABLE I

OUTLINE AID FOR JUDGING ALL TEXTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Publication</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Title</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Authors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Reputation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Authority</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Other writings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE II

**TRAINING OF AUTHORS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degrees</th>
<th>Date Rec'd</th>
<th>Names and location of Institution that granted degrees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.B.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.A.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position held</th>
<th>Name and location of Inst.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Before book was written a.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. When book was written a.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. After book was written a.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE III

**PROPORTIONAL DISTRIBUTION OF SUBJECT MATTER**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>No. of pages</th>
<th>% of book</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Topics covered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Discovery and Exploration.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Colonization of New World. (1607-1763)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE IV
PROPORTIONAL DISTRIBUTION OF ILLUSTRATIVE MATERIAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Representation</th>
<th>No. of Illus. of each size</th>
<th>Total Pages</th>
<th>% of Book</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Double P.</td>
<td>Full P.</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photographs</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diagrams</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maps &amp; etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE V
QUALITY OF ILLUSTRATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Representation</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Colored</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photo</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diagrams</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maps</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graphs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The forms presented on the previous pages are perhaps the most usable portions of the long, elaborate, and comprehensive form which Fowlkes has compiled. In fact, there is some question whether or not all of his form could actually be used. He must be given credit, however, for the very thorough job he did in trying to get objective answers for the many criteria used in textbook selection.

**Rating Scales:** In evaluating a textbook something more is necessary than the mere perusal of the book in question. From the need for objective criteria arose the rating scale which assigns quantitative values to the criteria used to choose a book. Such a rating scale was developed by Burr, Director of Research, Lynn, Massachusetts, and is reproduced below.

**Suggested rating scale for textbooks.**

I. General or constant factors-----------------300

A. Authorship and general considerations-------150

1. Author's scholarship in this special subject.
2. Author's familiarity with scientific investigation.
   a. In this particular subject field.
   b. In reading (which is involved in all texts.)
   c. In word lists (which is involved in all texts.)
   d. In the technique of textbook construction.
3. Author's classroom experience.
4. Is the text in the language and style best suited for pupils who will use it?
5. Is the copyright date a recent one?
6. Does the school correlate positively with our school objectives?

B. Mechanical makeup-------------------------150

1. Appearance and color of binding including cover design.
2. Durability of binding.
3. Quality, finish and color of paper.
4. Size, clearness and attractiveness of type.
5. Size, clearness and attractiveness of page.
6. Attractiveness, appropriateness and usefulness of illustrations.
7. Accuracy and usefulness of diagrams, charts, or maps.
8. Dependability and usability.

II. Factors which vary with the situation---------700

A. Subject matter and technique------------------450

1. Selection of subject matter-------------------150
   a. Scientific grading of material.
   b. Adaptability of material to class needs.
   c. Adaptability of material to community needs.
   d. Relative value of material.
   e. Variety of applications to life situations.
   f. Abundance and grading of material to meet individual and group abilities and needs.
   g. Sufficiency of detail in presenting material.

2. Organization and presentation of subject matter--------------------------------------------150
   a. Adaptable to an activities program.
   b. Psychological sequence.
   c. Possibility of omissions without destroying sequence.
   d. Degree of emphasis on topics.
   e. Plan for problem solution.
   f. Systematic development of reasoning power.
   g. Distribution, amount and balance of drill.
   h. Variety and effectiveness of diagnostic testing.
3. Technique----------------------------------150
   a. Attractive to teacher and pupil.
   b. Recognize present day Psychology.
   c. Provision for meeting individual differences.
   d. Natural life situations for motivation.
   e. Use of games plays and projects.

B. Teaching helps and aids to instruction--------250

   1. A preface of information for the teacher.
   2. Teacher manual or guide book.
   3. Adequacy of table of contents.
   4. Adequacy of index.
   5. Adequacy of glossary.
   6. Adequacy of appendicies.
   7. Adequacy of illustrations, charts, or maps.
   8. Effectiveness and appeal of illustrations.
   9. Summaries and reviews.
  10. Study helps for pupils.
  11. Norms for tests.
  12. Norms to recognize ability grouping.
  13. Suitable and adequate accompanying forms.

III. Total possible valuation------------------------1000

No definite number of points is assigned to any one criterion because the importance of various factors will vary from school system to school system, and from community to community. Therefore, anyone using the above rating scale would have to determine the number of points to assign to each of the various factors.

Norris' score card is largely concerned with the social studies and is therefore, particularly pertinent to

this study. In addition it was developed for use in a junior high school. The score card developed is as follows:

I. Score Card

A. Title of text
   Publisher and price
   Author
   1. How does he rate in his profession?
      high———mediocre———unknown——
   2. How does he treat topics of a controversial nature? fairly—partisan—sectional——
      ignores——
   3. Does he emphasize one phase (political, economic, social, military, etc., of history at the expense of others?)

B. Mechanical makeup
   1. Type
   2. Quality of paper
   3. Binding
   4. General appearance

C. General plan or organization
   1. Traditional or many chapter divisions
   2. Unit plan

D. Divisions of content
   1. Exploration and colonization
   2. Revolution
   3. Establishment of new nation
   4. Sectional conflict
   5. Expansion
   6. Industrial revolution
   7. Social and cultural phases
   8. Modern times

E. Visual aids (If maps or pictures are numerous or profuse, rate good; if they are of varied subjects, graphic, in color, rate good or/ as the case may be.)
   1. Maps
      a. Number
      b. Kind
   2. Pictures
      a. Number
      b. Kind

F. Style
   1. Interesting
   2. Purely factual
G. Language
   1. Words—within pupils ability
   2. Language—are sentences simple and clear or long and complicated?

H. Special features
   1. Study aids
   2. Suggestive activities
   3. Suggestive checks
   4. References and reading lists

I. General impression or summary view

J. Scoring: In C, if a book is organized as 1, check as poor; if it is the Unit plan, rate as good, fair, or poor. In D, rate each item as to sufficiency of time given. In F, if style is 2, rate as poor. G should be studied in the light of vocational level. Checks: very good—|—each check is for six points; good—|—each check is for five points; fair—|—each check is for three points; poor—|—each check is for one point; very poor—|—no checks, and no points. Possible: one hundred and twenty points, or over.35

The score card, in many instances, is used where there is a limit on time or number of people to select. It is not so detailed, nor is it so time consuming as some of the other plans, and therefore, has a place among the many devices used to help choose textbooks.

In conclusion, attention is directed to the fact that textbook selection is not an easy task in view of the many criteria which may be used to measure the qualities of a given textbook. As Averill points out, difficulties in selection include:

--------------

1. The large number of publisher's offerings in every subject.
2. The undeniable merits of each textbook or series of textbooks which has already met the exacting demands of a modern publishing house.
3. The convincing arguments of publisher's representatives, and the ability of demonstrators to show that their books will function in the classroom.
4. The time-consuming nature of any worthwhile examination of the books by committees or by individual appraisers.
5. The fact that many teachers are not trained in the techniques of comparative appraisal.
6. The frequent relegation of this important task to after-school and evening hours.
7. The large role played by subjective opinion and by preferences as well as prejudices for and against specific textbook features.
8. The inadequacy of available criteria for judging the suitability of textbooks for a given subject or grade.
9. Considerations of cost, personal contacts, and other factors unrelated to the respective merits of the books.36

Summary. In textbook selection many factors must be considered. The person or persons selecting textbooks must always do the best job possible, because the decision or decisions made are likely to exert considerable influence upon those who will be using the product thereof.

The ensuing chapter discusses the various criteria used by the Lewistown Textbook Selection Committee. As a means of comparing the criteria developed in Lewistown with those commonly used by other systems or suggested by author-

ities, the studies reported were analysed to determine the most commonly used factors in textbook selection. The factors are arranged in a table in order from the one being used in the greatest number of cases to the one being used in the least number of cases. The parenthetical explanations under each factor are not to be regarded as complete. They are merely suggestive of sub-topics which could be used.

TABLE VI
CRITERIA MOST COMMONLY USED TO SELECT TEXTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria used to select texts</th>
<th>Total number of studies</th>
<th>Number using this criterion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Mechanical Qualities (binding, paper, graphs)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Vocabulary (level of student)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Content (quality and distribution)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Appeal (color, print, presentation)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Objectives of Book (fit in with course)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Author (experience &amp; education)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Organization (chapters, units, chronological, topical)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Illustrations (maps, graphs, pictures)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criteria used to select texts</td>
<td>Total number of studies</td>
<td>Number using this criterion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Pupil Aids (index, bibliography, tables)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Teacher Aids (projects, questions, summaries, film lists)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Philosophy of Book (fit in with school's)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Recency (copyright)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER VI

EVALUATION OF THE METHODS USED IN TEXTBOOK SELECTION IN LEWISTOWN

Evaluation of criteria. The methods used in selecting textbooks for the Lewistown Schools seemed, on the whole, to be as good as or better than, the methods used in the thirteen cases reported. As a means of evaluating the methods of selection used at Lewistown, the items on the check list used there will be compared to the criteria used in the studies reported.

Appeal to students. The first item on the check list of the Lewistown Textbook Selection Committee was, "appeal to students." The necessity for the presence of this item among the various criteria is obvious because one of the fundamental steps to learning is the stimulation of interest which is essential to learning. The purpose here is not to show that interest and appeal are the same. However, it is desirable to show that appeal and interest are closely related. Franzen and Knight point out that:

The interest which students have in the texts is not the only criterion to be used in deciding which one of two possible books to use. Other things being at all equal, however, it is better psychology and sounder common sense to prefer interesting material over material of no interest.37

To further test the appeal of a book as a factor in textbook selection, seventh and eighth graders in the Lewistown Junior High School were asked to answer the following question: Does the book appeal to you? The three books selected for final examination by the textbook selection committee had the greatest appeal to the students. Appeal as a criterion for text selection ranks fourth in frequency of mention in the thirteen studies. It should also be mentioned that the poll of junior high school students was made by the author for his own information, and not as a part of actual committee procedure. Other questions were also asked the students in the poll. (The information regarding the poll may be found in Appendix B.)

On the other hand, there are arguments that appeal has nothing to do with the quality of the material in a book. Some may argue that appeal has little to do with the author's ability to write a book. Many arguments can be offered against appeal to students of a textbook as an important factor in selection.

**Vocabulary and style.** The committee stipulated that the reading difficulty of any text selected should be one year below the grade level for which it was intended to serve. The Textbook Selection Committee made this stipulation because the consensus was that, as a rule, students are behind about one year in their reading ability from the
grade level in which they find themselves.

Most educators agree that vocabulary level is important. In Table Six, Chapter Five, vocabulary level is one of the most often mentioned criteria. Where to draw a line regarding vocabulary is another question. Compton asks, "Is the vocabulary well chosen? Does the style of writing appeal to the students for whom the text is being considered?" Norris asks, are the words within a pupil's ability? Is the style interesting or purely factual? Thorndike's vocabulary list has been used for years to determine the adequacy or inadequacy of vocabulary in textbooks. The Lewerenz technique is a more recent method of determining vocabulary needs. Vocabulary is important in selecting a textbook and it must be given proper consideration by any textbook selection committee.

Kind and value of teaching aids. In the past, this particular area has not been considered as important as other areas. For instance, out of the thirteen sources that listed criteria for textbook selection only three mentioned teaching aids as a factor to be considered.


Teaching aids in a textbook are limited, but the mere fact that such aids are present helps the teacher immeasurably. Such aids could be: film lists, examples for projects, summary questions, graphs, bibliographies, and the like.

**Content.** It seems obvious and reasonable that the content material of a textbook should be the focal point around which other criteria for textbook selection should center.

In surveying the thirteen sources for factors most common to textbook selection, content is ranked third. The two factors preceding content (mechanical qualities and vocabulary) are probably ranked higher because they are items which are tangible and thus more obvious. Content, on the other hand, is composed of many intangible items which are not so easily recognized.

The main purpose of any textbook is to act as a source of information; therefore, the content of a book is basically more important than any of the more mechanical criteria used in textbook selection. The Lewistown Committee clearly recognized this.

**Success of the author.** The author should be proficient in selecting and organizing materials in terms of
aims and objectives of the course as defined by teachers.

There is little disagreement about the importance of the author of a text. A textbook is only as good as its author, or, as Norris says, "In the choice of a textbook may lie success or failure for a teacher or pupil." 40 Averill mentions three qualifications which should be considered regarding the author; "(1) education, (2) experience, (3) teaching experience in the grade for which the book is written." 41 The author, then, is one of the major factors to consider when selecting a text. From the thirteen sources surveyed regarding criteria, the importance of the author is ranked sixth.

**Mechanical qualities.** Another very important factor is the mechanical qualities of a textbook. Such qualities include: cover, binding, paper, print, and size of type. Few school boards can afford to buy books which have to be replaced shortly because of mechanical deficiencies. If a book is worth selecting, it should be mechanically sound. Mechanical qualities are ranked first in importance in Table Six.

40 Ibid., p. 69.

Organization. Organization of any text is important because there are certain laws of learning upon which it should be based. For instance, vocabulary should move from simple to complex as grade level of text goes up. Continuity is better for some than skipping around from one topic to another. Age must be considered because attention span changes with age. Also, there is a maximum or a minimum amount of work for which a student should be held responsible in a given unit. Burr mentions the following organizational factors: "(1) adaptable to an activities program, (2) psychological sequence, (3) possibility of omissions without destroying sequence, (4) degree of emphasis on topics, (5) plan for problem solution, (6) systematic development of reasoning power." From these factors one gets some idea of the scope of materials to be covered in organizing a text. The way it is done, therefore, is of great importance in selecting a textbook. Organization of a text is ranked seventh in importance in Table Six.

Recency. Most laws regarding adoption of textbooks set a maximum number of years for which a text should be adopted. Montana, (as explained in Chapter Three) set the

---

number of years for which a book should be adopted at five. Young points out that, "In general, at the end of the normal life of a book, that is, about five years, the whole field is reexamined."43 Dalthrop,44 expresses the same view when he suggests that texts not be selected more often than once in five years.

Recency is important in selecting books. First of all it takes time to select a book. In this regard, usually a year has elapsed from the time of selection to inauguration of the book in class. Consequently, if the normal life of a book is established at five years, one year has already been used. Secondly, if a book is selected that is already three, four, or five years old, a part of its normal life has already been expended. In this regard, the taxpayer, as well as the student is not treated fairly. Therefore, a textbook selection committee should be very conscious of the recency of the book it selects.

OTHER FACTORS IN TEXTBOOK SELECTION

Time allotted for study. In regard to time for textbook selection, Eye points out that, "A thorough study of


44 Ibid., p. 83.
textbooks in any subject cannot be accomplished in a few weeks time. Several months should be reserved for the careful study of the books submitted.\textsuperscript{45} Nuttall has mentioned several elements to be considered in textbook selection and then goes on to say, "Be sure that sufficient time is taken to consider all of these elements in relation to the purpose for which the book is selected."\textsuperscript{46} Young also states that "Selecting textbooks or making courses of study is never a hurried procedure."\textsuperscript{47} Another idea which should certainly be given greater consideration is the idea expressed by Jensen when he says, "The data indicate that in the majority of cases the work of the textbook committees is an added duty to the members present work, and where time is alloted, a substitute teacher is employed to release the committee member."\textsuperscript{48} A good deal of thought should be given to that statement because selecting texts does consume a good deal of time. In Chapter Four of this paper it was mentioned

\textsuperscript{45} Glen G. Eye, "Who Should Choose Textbooks," \textit{Nation's Schools}, 20:41, October, 1937.

\textsuperscript{46} Superintendents, op. cit., p. 54.

\textsuperscript{47} Ibid., p. 55.

that the time allowed for the Lewistown study was not sufficient even though on the surface it appeared adequate. In further explanation it should be pointed out that the work of the committee was done after school and on weekends. Also, as was mentioned, all the people on the committee had full working schedules; two were teaching principals and one a supervisory principal. The time which supervisory or teaching principals have to put into such extra duty is virtually nil. The National Education Association Journal, gives a very good account of the time used during the week by principals. The Teaching Principal averages about forty-five hours per week, not counting those hours after school. After utilizing time for administration, supervision, personnel, clerical, teaching, community and miscellaneous duties, the Supervisory and Teaching Principal have only eight and seven hours respectively left for relaxation.49

The teacher with a full teaching schedule has very little more time than the teaching principal if she utilizes her time to do a good job. As has been pointed out, textbook selection is an added duty. Therefore, selecting textbooks as the Textbook Selection Committee did by taking time during the evening or on weekends (mostly Sunday) is not

sufficient. Also, it is not fair to expect the teacher to work nine hours a day (8 a.m. to 5 p.m.) and then use what little free time she would normally have to do other work such as textbook selection.

Who should select textbooks? In the past, states have reserved the right to select textbooks to themselves. Many states still do, but the trend is toward selection at the local level. Montana has changed from state selection prior to 1941, to local selection, thereafter. State adoptions usually displease some people at the local level. As Eye mentions, "Often the sentiment registered is in opposition to statewide adoptions. Occasionally these outbursts are emotional and exaggerated." 50 He goes on to say, "If the trend is in the direction of abandoning state adoptions, a safe procedure would be first to exempt first-class districts extending this exemption to others gradually." 51

Sterk and Purdy have a word to say about teacher participation when they point out that, "Textbook selection by legislative agencies, state or local boards of education, superintendents, specially appointed research staffs, or supervisors, without any regard for the experience or the

50 Glen H. Eye, op. cit., p. 41
51 Loc, cit., p. 41
judgment of the classroom teachers who use the books, has not proved satisfactory." Superintendents are recognizing the necessity for teacher participation in textbook selection. Reed says, "The most effective method of selecting textbooks is based upon the fundamental democratic principle that the teacher of the subject should have an active part in the selection of teaching materials." Chenoweth says, "The people who actually use textbooks should have a voice in their selection." According to King, "A teacher prefers to choose his own textbook—he is interested in the style of the book, its composition, its vocabulary." The superintendents mentioned, herein, are only a few of the many who agreed with the principle that teachers, who use the books, should be instrumental in their selection.

Pupil evaluation. It should be mentioned briefly that pupil evaluation of texts was used in the seventh and eighth grades. As was mentioned, the three books given


53 Superintendents, op. cit., p. 83.

54 Ibid., p. 52.

55 Ibid., p. 53.
final consideration by the committee, were also the three books having the greatest appeal and interest to the students.

Student evaluation should not be the sole criterion for selection, but it can be used to aid in the selection of texts. Student participation in evaluating texts also gives the teacher a better understanding of the qualities of a book which appeal to students. This procedure is an actual working principle of democracy and should not be neglected if educators are going to practice what they preach.

Summary. The evaluation of the methods of textbook selection in Lewistown has shown quite clearly that teachers and principals working together can formulate procedures and criteria, and select textbooks to be used in a school system. That is not to say that the selection of the texts is successful because a follow-up study would have to be made to determine such a factor as success. At the present time there are no known plans for such a follow-up study and it should be given attention to make the job of textbook selection complete.
CHAPTER VII

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary. In summarizing this study, each of the purposes stated in Chapter One will be briefly reexamined.

The first purpose was to review textbook selection historically in the United States and in Montana. In furthering this purpose a brief survey was made of the development of the American public school system. The survey covered the time from the first settlements in America to about nineteen hundred. Textbook selection practices, actual or implied, were described.

Since this study was primarily concerned with the evaluation of methods of textbook selection in Montana, a brief survey of the history of textbook selection in this state was made. The survey considered the situation existing in Montana as a territory, and Montana as a state. Both surveys were not intended to be comprehensive, but rather, to serve as a background for the main body of the study.

The second purpose of the study was to evaluate the methods used by the Lewistown teachers in selecting social studies textbooks for grades one through eight.

This part of the problem was dealt with by showing what procedures were used in the organization of the selec-
tion committee, the scheduling of meetings, the formation of a check list, and the stating of objectives to be sought in teaching social studies in the elementary grades.

After completing the preliminary details, textbooks had to be gathered, studied, and evaluated. To do this, it was necessary to study the factors involved in the process of evaluation, to break up into sub-committees for more intensive study, and to make a selection of three texts, from which one was finally chosen. Recommendations, in written form were sent to the superintendent to be acted upon by the school board.

The third purpose of the study was to ascertain whether or not the criteria used in Lewistown were adequate.

It is difficult to measure abstractions. Consequently, to fulfill this need various studies of methods, procedures, and criteria used in other places were compared to those used in Lewistown. These measures were shown to be valid for textbook selection, in so far as they are used in many places in the United States, and are commended by authorities in the field of textbook selection.

The last purpose of the study was to make recommendations for future social studies textbook committees, which will be discussed later in this chapter.
CONCLUSIONS

From this study the following conclusions arise:

1. During the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries textbook selection was virtually nil.

2. The Revolutionary War was not only significant for military and economic independence, but it was important because it freed the United States intellectually, and spiritually as well. This intellectual and spiritual freedom was responsible for the growth of our educational system which has created the demand which has been responsible in great measure for our tremendous bookmaking industries.

3. Because of the demand, our bookmaking industries have been responsible for the tremendous number and diversity of textbooks, and thereby have made textbook selection an extremely complicated process.

4. Because of the complexity of textbook selection today, it has become necessary to formulate criteria by which to judge books as to their fitness for classroom use.

5. The authority for the selection of textbooks in Montana resides with the district superintendent of schools, or principal if there is no superintendent, subject to the approval of the board of trustees.

6. This study has demonstrated that teachers who use the books ought to be a part of any textbook selection com-
mittee.

7. While the length of time allowed for text selection cannot be fixed definitely, most authorities agree that from three to six months is desirable, and agree further that the procedure is not to be hurried.

8. Textbook selection should be no haphazard undertaking. Rather, the selection of one text in preference to another can and should be a matter of deliberate choice, based upon sound scientific criteria in regard to quality.

10. To a member of a textbook selection committee, two opportunities arise: (1) to select a better textbook than has been used before, and, (2) to broaden his education and experience.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are made in the hope they will benefit others selecting textbooks.

1. There should be no administrative curtailments or requirements regarding choice of books placed upon a textbook selection committee.

2. The committee should be formed early in the fall and final recommendations made on or before May 1, of the following year.

3. The teachers and/or the teaching principals for
whose subjects or classes the books are being selected, should make up the textbook selection committee. The chairman should be a non-teaching supervisor or principal who should be responsible for gathering and disseminating the materials to be evaluated.

4. Before textbooks are selected to replace those in use, it is recommended that an evaluation be made of the texts in use at the time.

5. After new texts have been selected and used for a time, an evaluation of them should be made to determine whether or not they are as good as, or better than, those replaced. Too few times books are selected without any knowledge of how effective were the books replaced; too often no follow-up study is made of books selected.

6. It is recommended that members of textbook selection committees be given time off during the day, either from study halls or extra curricular work where substitutes will more easily fit without impairing the educational program.

7. It is recommended that a textbook not be selected because it has one or two outstanding features. Rather, the textbook which is the best qualified all around should be chosen.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Wright, C., *Report of the Superintendent of Public Instruction for the Years 1877-78.* Copy to be found in the Montana Historical Library, Helena, Montana.


*Session Laws of Montana., 1941.*

*School Laws of Montana., 1941.*

*Revised Codes of Montana., 1947.*


Sterk, Clara K., Beatrice Purdy., "A Plan for Teacher Participation In the Selection of Textbooks," Elementary School Journal, May, 1941


APPENDIX A.

A LIST OF SOCIAL STUDIES AND GEOGRAPHY TEXTS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Laidlaw</td>
<td>Gilmartin—Skehan</td>
<td>3-4</td>
<td>Great Names in American History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beeby, Hannan &amp; McClure</td>
<td>4-5</td>
<td>Our Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>McClure, Scheck &amp; Wright</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>World Background for the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>McClure, Scheck &amp; Wright</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Background of Modern Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>McClure, Yarbrough</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>The United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blough, Switzer</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>Fundamentals of Citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winston</td>
<td>Wilcockson</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Nancy's World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wilcockson</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Tom's Town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wilcockson</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Other Places</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Snedicker</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Toward Better Living</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Snedicker</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>The Story of Our Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>We Depend on Our Neighbors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Our Country's Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Quest of a Hemisphere</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scribners</td>
<td>Moore, Cook</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Working and Playing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scribners</td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(Copy on way)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Moore, Lewis, Painter &amp; Carpenter</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Building Our Town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Building Our Communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Building Our America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Building Our World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>Building A Free Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heath</td>
<td>Emerson, Chase &amp; Nevins</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Pioneer Children of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Eaton, Chase &amp; Nevins</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Leaders in Other Lands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Lansing, Chase &amp; Nevins</td>
<td>5-6</td>
<td>Makers of the Americas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Hartman, Nevins &amp; Saunders</td>
<td>5-6</td>
<td>Builders of the Old World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Lansing, Chase &amp; Nevins</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>America in the World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Hartman, Ball &amp; Nevins</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>America, Land of Freedom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rand McNally</td>
<td>Hugley</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Everyone Wants a Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Hugley, Cordier</td>
<td>1-2</td>
<td>Many Homes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Hugley, Cordeir</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Friendly Neighbors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Hugley, Cordeir &amp; Robert</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>All Around America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rand McNally</td>
<td>Robert, Cordier</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>History for the Beginner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert, Cordier</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>History of Young America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert, Cordier</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>History of World Peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>History of the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ginn</td>
<td>Tieggs, Adams &amp; Thomas</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Stories About Linda and Lee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Stories about Sally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Your Town and Mine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Your People and Mine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tieggs, Adams &amp; McKenzie</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Your Country and Mine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Your World and Mine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Your Country and World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Your Country's Story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Your Life As A Citizen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webster</td>
<td>Ames, Qusley</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Now and Then Stories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ames, Ames, &amp; Qusley</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Stories of My Country's Beginnings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ames, Ames, &amp; Qusley</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Stories of My Country's Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webster</td>
<td>Ames, Ames</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>America of Yesterday</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ames, Ames &amp; Staples</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>My America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Houghton</td>
<td>Wilder, Ludlum &amp; Brown</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>This Is My Story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>America</td>
<td>Capen, Melchoir</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>My Worth to the World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iroquois</td>
<td>Southworth &amp; Southworth</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>American History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>GEOGRAPHY SERIES</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winston</td>
<td>Smith, Sorenson</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Our Neighbors At Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Neighbors Around the World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Neighbors in the Americas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Neighbors in the United States and Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Carls, Sorenson</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Neighbors Across the Seas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silver Burdett</td>
<td>Barrows, Parker &amp; Sorenson</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Our Big World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Doris, Trapp</td>
<td>2-3</td>
<td>Learning to Look At One World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barrows, Parker &amp; Sorenson</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>The American Continents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Old World Lands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>A World View</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allyn, Bacon</td>
<td>Pierce</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>The Community Where I Live</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Stull, Hatch</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Many Lands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>North America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Europe and Europe Overseas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>Asia, Latin America, United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rand, McNally</td>
<td>McConnell, Hugley</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Geography Around the Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>McConnell</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Geography Around the World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>McConnell</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Geography of the Americas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>McConnell</td>
<td>6-7</td>
<td>Geography of Lands Overseas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>McConnell, Harter</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>Geography of A Working World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MacMillan</td>
<td>Whipple, James</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Our Earth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Using Our Earth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Living On Our Earth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>At Home On Our Earth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follet</td>
<td>McIntire</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Billy Lives In Neighborhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>McIntire, Hill</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Workers At Home and Away</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Meyer, Sorenson &amp; McIntire</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Friends Far and Near</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Geography Series

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Follett</td>
<td>Meyer, Homer</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>The New World and Its Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Meyer, Gray &amp; Hancock</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Our American Neighbors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>6-7</td>
<td>Our Northern and Pacific Neighbors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott Foresman &amp; Co.</td>
<td>Hanna, Hoyt</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Hello David</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cross Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Book Co.</td>
<td>Wilson, Wilson, Erb &amp; Clucas</td>
<td>5-6</td>
<td>Out of the Past</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Wilson, Lamb</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>America's History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iroquois</td>
<td>Southworth &amp; Southworth</td>
<td>5-7</td>
<td>Long Ago in the Old World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>5-7</td>
<td>Early Days in the New World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>Thurston, Faigle</td>
<td>7-8</td>
<td>World Geography</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX B.

REPORT OF RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE SUPERINTENDENT
ON THE SELECTION OF TEXTS
Recommendations to the Superintendent

on the Selection of Social Science Texts.

This committee appointed at Mr. Githens’ request worked within two specific administration policies:

1. That there be distinct history and geography work at least between grades four through six.

2. That selection be made on a series basis at least up through grade six.

The committee did considerable preliminary work in setting up objectives of the Social Sciences, and a check list for Text Book Selection. Mrs. Pittman gave advise on print, paper, bindings, maps, and illustrations.

The committee was subdivided for the actual examination of texts into three sub-committees. A report from each of these committees follows.

The committee left some unfinished business which it feels a curriculum committee of Social Sciences might well delve into next fall:

1. It recommended no text for the Seventh Grade. It had contemplated a Civics Text here; but found the high school teaches a certain amount of civics. The committee feels that the curriculum committee might well determine where the responsibility for teaching civics should be placed and might then determine what in the way of Social Sciences should be placed in grade Seven.

2. The committee feels a unit on Montana history and geography should be located in the grades; but is at a loss to find good teaching materials.

A summary of the recommendations of the committee is as follows:

Grades I through VI - The Ginn Series
   I Stories About Linda and Lee = Thomas
   II Stories About Sally = Thomas
   III Your Town And Mine = Thomas
   IV Your People And Mine = Mackenzie
   V Your Country and Mine = Brown
   VI Your World and Mine = Dawson

Grades IV through VI - Silver Burdett Geographies
   IV Our Big World = Barrows, Parker, and Sorensen
   V The American Continents = Barrows, Parker, and Sorensen
   VI Old World Lands = Barrows, Parker, and Sorensen
The committee suggests that if it is financially impossible to go into a complete social science program this coming year, that the three primary grades could get along with half the full number of books, or if necessary with only a teacher's copy for a year. It feels there is more urgency about getting a good program set up from Grade IV up.

Social Science Textbook Selection Committee

Glenn Darling
Steve Matosich
Harriet Cole
Earl Rohrbaugh
Hazel Joslyn
Bruce Rafn
Alice Allison
Ann Donahue
Marion Jones
Lena Duncan
Helen O'Dea
Carrol Elliaison
Report of the Primary Committee:
Hazel Joslyn
Alice Allison
Marion Jones
Lena Duncan

Choice of books:

Grade I. Billy and His Family, Billy goes to School, Billy and His Friends by McIntire, Follett Publishing Company.

The readiness would tie in nicely with the reading readiness unit. The book Billy and His Friends contains a simple vocabulary which would go hand in hand with the primer. Billy goes to School is more advanced and should be used when the children are on the first grade reader level. Concepts are developed logically and they build up fine attitudes. The print is very good and pictures are attractive. The last two books are well bound. The first is cheaply bound. These books fit its well with the Home Unit.

Second Choice - Stories About Linda and Lee by Eleanor Thomas, Ginn Publishing Company.

This is not as complete as the McIntire set but is well organized. Through its use fine concepts and attitudes should be developed. There is less reading to be done by the children but much picture interpretation. Print is good and pictures are attractive. Book is well bound. Logical development of ideas, ties in well with the Home Unit. So many pictures on a page that it confused the child. Book rather large.

Grade II. Stories About Sally by Eleanor Thomas, Ginn Company.
Most popular book among the children. It suited the lower reading group better than the other books. The upper groups thought it quite easy. Book is well bound. It has good print and the pictures are colorful and attractive. It correlates nicely with the Community Unit and meets the needs of the children of that age. It emphasizes the knowledges, understandings and attitudes which will aid the children of that age in living in their enlarging world.

Second choice - Friendly Neighbors by Hugley-Cordier, Rand McNally Co. It fits in nicely with the Farm and Community units. The children enjoyed the stories. The pictures are attractive, although not as colorful as some of the books. The type is unusually good and also the paper. The book is well bound. The stories are very interesting and much history and geography can be brought into the work. It has many possibilities for various units revolving around community life in Lewistown. It follows the State Course of Study for second grade better than some of the other books. There was not much difference in the decision of the second grade teachers in this book and the one for first choice. Mrs. Greco said it was liked by all of the children and they enjoyed the humor and interesting stories. I really think there is more to it than the one that was selected for first choice.
Third choice, Hello David by Hanna-Holt. Scott, Foreseman Company. This book was very popular with all of the children. It was easy reading for all of the class. The units fit in nicely with the work for second grade and has many possibilities for unit work and correlation. Type, paper, pictures, and print are very good.

Grade III. First choice. The Community Where I Live, by Pierce, Allyn and Bacon Co.

Very good for the first introduction to Geography. Has very good drill work and word study. Good units on community life, shelter, food, clothing, and other things which are presented in third grade. Type is very good. Book is well bound. Pictures are all in black and white but are attractive. Think it is a book that will give the children a chance to do a lot of thinking.

Second choice, Your Town and Mine by Eleanor Thomas, Ginn and Company. Very good material for the units to be used in third grade. Is easy reading and vocabulary is not too difficult. Type is very good. Book is well bound. Paper is good. Book was well liked by the children.

Suggested Supplementary for third grade history.

Now and Then Stores, Usley, Webster Co. Binds closely past and present by comparisons of now and earlier times. Vocabulary is easy. Pictures are attractive and the type that will make a child desire to read the stories. The book could be used nicely for a supplementary reader in third grade.

Other Books examined by the committee:

Nancy's World (1) Wilcockson - Winston Company
Tom's World (2) Wilcockson - Winston Company
Other Places (3) Wilcockson - Winston Company
Working & Playing (1) Moore, Cook - Scribners
Building Our Town (3) Moore, Lewis - Scribners
Pioneer Children in America (3) Emerson Heath
Everyone Wants a Home (2) Hugley Rand McHally
Many Homes (1) Hugley-Cordier Rand McHally
All Around America (3) Hugley-Cordier Rand McHally
Billy Lives in Maplewood (2) McIntire Follett Co.
Workers At Home and Away (3) McIntire Follett Co.
Intermediate Grades Committee
Earl Rohrbaugh
Ann Donahue
Bruck Rafn

Social Studies

Ginn Series (Intermediate Grades) - First choice.

Binding, paper, print.
Excellent and attractive, print large and clear. Excellent use of bold type. Double column print for easy reading. Large print of 4th grade book tends to show through pages somewhat.

Illustrations.
Excellent. Good use of color. Both drawings and photographs are purposeful aids in assimilating the material.

Maps.
Very good. Some of the political maps of small areas have insets showing the particular area in relation to the whole continent. Maps are simple, easy, and uncluttered and large enough to be read easily.

Teaching Aids.
We have not seen pupil workbooks. Achievement tests are available.
Teachers manuals. Based on examination of grade 3 manual, they should be excellent. They set up objectives and suggestions for each chapter are given.
End of chapter activities. Excellent. Questions on content, concepts and understandings. Questions for discussions are thought provoking and induce original thinking. Individual and class activities are excellent and promote further investigation and bringing in of outside material. Has also an excellent book reading list after each chapter. Has definite exercises building toward furthering reading and language skills.

Content.
Refer to pamphlet S-301 for information as to organization and content.
Intermediate series has a good general appeal as to appearance, vocabulary and style. The sixth grade book begins each chapter with a story of the time and place before going into the historical investigation. The "Hilltop Views" are excellent summaries.
We feel that this series (grades 4, 5, and 6) has more to offer pupils of all ability levels than any other series under consideration.
The 5th and 6th grade books are up to date, doing an objective job on the U. N., the Korean War, and Communist China.
Book contains no glossary, meaning of italicized words are given in content.
Scribner Series (Intermediate Grades)

Binding, paper, print:
Binding excellent, paper excellent. Print is of good size but fine. Full page printing i.e. not double column.

Illustrations:
Fair-mediocre. Large majority of black and what photographs and drawings. Colored pictures are few and are garish. In books 5 and 6 there was not a continuity of illustrations. Prints of the time were used but are not as effective as illustrations can be.

Maps:
Fair. Sometimes small, hard to read and cluttered. No color.

Teaching Aids:
Workbook fair. We have not seen teachers manuals. Activities at end of chapter. Come are meaningful while others are just busywork. Questions varied similarly. Each chapter has a reading list with notations as to the difficulty of the book.

Content
There is a break between the 4th and 6th grades from the story form to the traditional presentation, of facts including a jump in vocabulary. There is no past W. W. II material. The glossary and specialized vocabulary is not made clear.

Heath

Binding, Paper, Print
Bindings are good, paper is good quality semi gloss with a clear medium size print. Covers are sturdy and attractive.

Illustrations:
The series is profusely illustrated with outline drawings done in two or three colors. No photographs are used. Drawings are attractive and illustrate materials in the text.

Maps:
Maps are done in black and white. They are clear and uncluttered but may lose their purpose because of their small size and limited area.

Teaching aids:
End of chapter activities are varied and interesting. They consist of questions for discussion, things to do, an outside reading list and a short self quiz.
Content of the series is interesting and accurate. The one fault of the textual material is that it is descriptive only and does not really offer possibilities of building a scientific analysis of the social scene.

Rand McNally
The committee chose to reject this book as a possibility for selection on 3 counts:
1. The reading level is difficult
2. The 4th grade book begins an academic study of world history
3. The books are not attractive enough in appearance and presentation to overcome the other drawbacks.

Other series surveyed and rejected as recommendations for basic texts were:
Laidlaw Brothers, Publishers
Iroquois Publishing Company
American Book Company
Webster Publishing Company
Fottet Publishing Company

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Silver-Burdett - First Choice.

Binding, paper, print.
Binding good, paper is a good quality, semi gloss paper. Print is clear, large and double columns for quick and easy reading. Covers are attractive with pictures illustrating subject content of the book.

Illustrations
Excellent. Pictures serve a variety of purposes. They are attractive, interesting and purposeful. The Silver-Burdett literature makes claims for a planned picture reading program. Both photographs and drawings are used. Colored pictures are excellent and are preferable to color photos in other series.

Maps
Fourth grade book builds an excellent map study background. The maps used in the series are clear and meaningful. The sixth grade book offers some polar views. Maps are used for a purpose. The book is not loaded with meaningless maps.

Teaching Aids.
Teachers manual is excellent. It contains an overview, a time allotment and a guided study section which is good. An objective testing program is offered. No norms are given. A supplementary reading program is offered. Teaching aids in the book are somewhat lacking consisting mainly of check up questions.

Content
The fourth grade book is in story form. It seeks to develop concepts of the relationship of man and his environment. The fifth grade book covers the highlights of historical geography as a background for the U.S. today. It also covers Canada and Latin America. The appearance of the book is very attractive. The text seems oriented toward concept building plus the necessary facts rather than the accumulation of voluminous facts. The vocabulary seems well suited to the grade level.
Winston - Second Choice

Binding, paper, print.

Binding, good; paper used is good quality semi-gloss paper with large, double column print for easy reading.

Illustrations

Some use is made of color drawings. Good use is made of black and white photos to illustrate text material on the page. This series has made excellent and fairly extensive use of graphic presentation of statistics.

Maps.

Many different type maps are used. They are presented in a simple and easy to read manner. The "Routes Between Neighbors" maps in the 6th grade book are excellent. Special maps are used to a good advantage. An excellent Atlas section is presented in the 5th and 6th grade books. Hamatosine and polar projections are given.

Teaching aids.

The 4th grade book has a combination glossary and index. In the 5th and 6th grade books there is no glossary but important special words are italicized and the meaning given in text. End of chapter and end of unit activities serve mainly as a check up on reading though there are some discussion and thought provoking questions. The 4th and 5th grade books have more extensive and varied end of chapter activities.

Content

The 4th grade book is a narrative form of presentation of representative types of life in varying geographical areas. The fifth grade is concerned with the United States and American Neighbors; the sixth with an area by area study of the rest of the world. This series presents more than facts. It gives an understanding of the relationship of people to their environment as well as factual material. It has a good section in the sixth grade book on conservation.
Rand McNally - Third Choice

Binding, paper, print.

Binding very good, paper good, printing is double columned but rather small. Covers attractive and sturdy.

Illustrations

Extensive use is made throughout the books of black and white photos, also small maps of various kinds. While they do illustrate the textual material, they are not especially attractive nor significant. A few good pictures are worth many insignificant ones.

Maps

6th grade contains an Atlas section of 15 pages. Maps in this section are of the Homolosine rather than Mercator projection. Maps are frequently used throughout text i. e., area maps, products maps etc. Some are of little value either as interest or concept builders.

Teaching Aids

Each unit ends with a "Geography Workshop." This section contains extensive activities of various kinds. Some of the activities are constructive but many seem the hard way of doing a thing that could be easily done. (See pg. 210) The workshop is designed to take care of individual differences according to Rand McNally literature.

Content

The 4th grade book builds a knowledge of geographic fundamentals. The series is based on understanding of areas of similarity rather than nation by nation. The books have worthwhile reference sections for both teacher and pupils.

Some words of special meaning are italicized though no text meaning or glossary is present. The main drawback of the series is the reading difficulty. The series embodies an up to date, functional philosophy of organization but presents it is a too difficult, subject matter centered matter.
Stull and Hatch

The intermediate committee chose to reject the Allyn-Bacon geography on numerous counts. First the philosophy of the series seems to be a dressed up version of the encyclopedic, subject matter centered geography of many years standing. The paper is a glossy finished paper with fine print. Illustrations are plentiful but not attractively or meaningfully presented. The overall appeal of the book and its adaptation to grade level in terms of vocabulary etc. is generally poor.

Whipple and James (Mac Millan)

The Mac Millan series is an attractive, interesting and different approach to the study of man's environment. It is not the travel type of presentation but rather an almost anthropological study (in the 5th grade) of cultures ranging from simple to the complex. The 6th grade book presents the U. S. and the British Empire. It does not seek to set geography as the only determinant of the patterns of society. The organization of this series does not correlate with the social studies series, therefore we are not considering it as a basic text. We would like to recommend it as some type of supplemental series, the nature of which is not decided upon.
REPORT
by
SOCIAL STUDIES TEXTBOOK SELECTION COMMITTEE
JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL
Steve M. Matosich - Harriet Cole

. AMERICA LAND OF FREEDOM Hartman-Ball Nevins Heath (1946)

GOOD QUALITIES:

Binding, good; print, good; Vocabulary, not too high. Teaching Aids such as questions, projects, plays, etc., were good.

NOT SO GOOD

Illustrations, fair and somewhat small; Paper, only fair; Maps, few, little color, small. Appeal to students was mostly negative with the students. Reason; too much the same style as old book. Recency, copyright 1946 which makes the book already five years old. Organization, much the same as old book, primarily chronological.

. AMERICA IN THE WORLD Lansing-Chase-Nevins Heath 1949

GOOD QUALITIES

Binding, good; Print, good; Vocabulary, all right. Teaching Aids such as questions, projects, maps, plays, etc., good. Appeal to students, good. Recency, within reason.

NOT SO GOOD

Content as written in the Table of Contents was not as good as some other books. Paper, only fair. Organization, not so good, chronological and topical but not as meaningful as it should be. Style, much the same as old type book and material set up in the same old manner.

. LONG AGO IN THE OLD WORLD Southworth & Southworth Iroquois 1950

This book is on World History which is another course from the one being considered.

. AMERICAN HISTORY Southworth & Southworth Iroquois 1946

GOOD QUALITIES

Binding, Print, Paper are all good. Vocabulary would be in range of the students. Organization of materials is from the chronological to the topical with a good deal of story form. A short resume of each event.

NOT SO GOOD

Illustrations, not of the meaningful type. Maps, not well illustrated, small, small print, not colored. Appeal to students not good. Reason: "Too old fashioned." Teaching Aids, questions, projects, etc., not in sufficient detail to be of any great help.
5. **EARLY DAYS IN THE NEW WORLD** Southworth & Southworth 
   
   This book deals primarily with the first part of American History and thus is not adequate to our needs.

6. **THE STORY OF OUR AMERICA** Southworth & Southworth

   **GOOD QUALITIES**

   Binding, print, illustrations, paper are good. Vocabulary, fairly good. Some students did not understand many words but not considered necessarily bad. Organization from the typical and chronological to the eventful, recency, 1951. A work book and manual are available with the book. Appeal, good.

   **NOT SO GOOD**

   Maps are small, not colored, small print. Teaching Aids not as well developed as some other books in regard to detail and type of project. Style of this book is not anything new. It follows the old familiar line in physical structure; short and blocky.

7. **THE U. S. OF AMERICA** McLure & Yarbrough Laidlaw

   **GOOD QUALITIES**

   Binding, print, paper, are good. Vocabulary good for seventh and eighth grade students. Well organized. Table of content meaningful. Appeal to students, good. Illustrations are of good taste.

   **NOT SO GOOD**


8. **BACKGROUND OF MODERN NATIONS** McLure, Scheek, Laidlaw

   **GOOD QUALITIES**

   Table of content is interesting. Maps, Illustrations, pictures, etc., are good. Vocabulary seems to be at a level. Binding, print, paper, good. This book could cover a good background along geographical and historical lines for the course taught in American History. This is a good book on all the countries of Europe and Asia.
5. EARLY DAYS IN THE NEW WORLD  Southworth & Southworth  1950

This book deals primarily with the first part of American History and thus is not adequate to our needs.

6. THE STORY OF OUR AMERICA  Southworth & Southworth  1951

GOOD QUALITIES

Binding, print, illustrations, paper are good. Vocabulary, fairly good. Some students did not understand many words, but not considered necessarily bad. Organization from the topical and chronological to the eventful, recency, 1951. A work book and manual are available with the book. Appeal, good.

NOT SO GOOD

Maps are small, not colored, small print. Teaching Aids, not as well developed as some other books in regard to detail and type of project. Style of this book is not anything new. It follows the old familiar line in physical structure; short and blocky.

7. THE U. S. OF AMERICA  McIlroy & Yarbrough  1945

GOOD QUALITIES

Binding, print, paper, are good. Vocabulary, good for seventh and eighth grade students. Well organized. Table of content meaningful. Appeal to students, good. Illustrations, are of good taste.

NOT SO GOOD

Maps are not too good. Material not clearly depicted. Projects at the end of the chapter not so well defined, material not in detail. Physical structure, small and coarse. Students, "too bookish." Recency, 1945. Not so good because it makes the book too old to start out with.

8. BACKGROUND OF MODERN NATIONS  McIlroy, Schrock, Wright  1946

GOOD QUALITIES

Table of content is interesting. Maps, illustrations, pictures, etc., are good. Vocabulary seems to be set tenth. Binding, Print, Paper, good. This book could offer a good background along geographical and historical lines for the course taught in American History. This is a good book on all the countries of Europe and Asia.
Recency, 1945. This makes the book too old to start as a new text. Appeal to students was not so good. Students, "too much about Europe." Seventh graders felt it was too much like sixth grade geography. Projects and Teacher Aids not adequate nor presented in a meaningful way.

9. MY AMERICA  
Ames-Ames-Staples  
Webster 1947

GOOD QUALITIES

Illustrations are from good to fair. Vocabulary all right for the majority. Organization is simple and adequate to the material in the book. Print on the Maps is good. Teaching aids are good.

NOT SO GOOD

Binding is weak. Print is small. Maps are small but otherwise all right. Appeal to students was not so good. Recency of book, 1947. Too old. This text is short in material on World War I, and from War I to War II.

LO. AMERICAN HISTORY  
Wilson & Lamb  
Am. Bk. Co. 1951

GOOD QUALITIES

Binding, Print, Paper; are good. This book is just coming off the press which will make it as up to date as possible. Vocabulary is all right. Majority of students did not have any trouble with it. Teaching aids are good, except for some of the projects at the end of the chapters. A work book and Teachers Manual go with it.

NOT SO GOOD

Illustrations are not what they ought to be in a book of this calibre or recency. Drawings are not as meaningful as they should be. Maps are not in color nor are they shown in a global perspective. Maps of colonies are small and they have small print. Material dealing with War I and War II is not as complete as it should be. Physical structure is about 7" by 9" which is good. Comments were "same old type of book."

SUMMARY

The ten foregoing history texts were given ample consideration in the total of thirteen which were reviewed. However, as is noted by the foregoing evaluation, most of these ten books have as many "NOT SO GOOD" characteristics as "GOOD QUALITIES." Therefore it was considered necessary to eliminate these books from further consideration. Three books were chosen for closer examination and one of these three recommended for use as a basic eighth grade textbook.
Building A Free Nation, after careful consideration has been eliminated. When this book is compared with the other two mentioned above, it shows a lacking in many things. (1) It does not have the maps, illustrations, pictures, and etc., which the other two books have to explain the material presented. (2) Material at the end of the chapters is not adequate in scope nor adequate in detail to lend meaning to exercises which would have to be done by the student. (3) The treatment and organization of materials is not sufficiently different, along with the other defects to warrant any further consideration.

Living In Our America will next be given consideration. The mechanical qualities of this book are excellent. Binding, print, maps, illustrations, vocabulary, and illustrations are covered in the survey. Again however, these qualities are unsurpassed.

Teaching aids in this book are unusually fine. There is a wealth of material for those who like to write; for those who like to make things; for those who like to speak or act; for those who like to draw, and there is information on selection of committees. Reference books are listed; Films that can be used also are given. These aids are found in each chapter and at the end of each unit.

Content: The period of exploration is treated in one chapter. This tends to keep the material moving without omitting any. Colonization in this section there is a comparison made among the colonies in a summary which adds to the meaningfulness of work. Independence: this is well treated and illustrated. The different phases of history are covered in the same manner. There is one thing which is noticed in going through this book and that is the organization. From exploration to colonization and expansion there is a continuous thread that is, there is not a lot of miscellaneous material thrown in to alter this undertaking. From the settling of the east coast to the settlement of the west there is sequence. Then the internal problems and other questions related to our development as a nation are considered. Lastly the acquisition of new land and the responsibilities we have undertaken as a nation.

Correlation: There is a good correlation of social studies and geography as well as literature.
This Is America's Story is the last book to be given consideration in this group of three.

Mechanical qualities in the book are excellent. Binding, print, maps, illustrations, and paper are excellent. The print is smaller than in either of the other two. There are some illustrations which are not as good as Living In Our America and some are better. Qualities covered in the survey are appeal, projects, vocabulary, and content indirectly. These qualities except for projects are unsurpassed. On this one thing there is not enough to give the material presented in the Unit a fair coverage.

Teaching aids and projects fall in this category, are lacking, one thing which does stand out along this line is the test which is included at the end of the Unit. There is also a time graph throughout which is good.

Content: The period of exploration is covered in much more detail than in Living In Our America. Colonies: In this unit there is adequate treatment of the subject and many fine illustrations to bring out the material. There are no comparisons made among the colonies which does not stress many things. Independence: This is covered in ample detail and in good illustration. Upon completion of this Unit the authors go into a short detour to take up the efforts of South American patriots to gain liberation from the Spanish. Inventions and internal development are considered next and then to the differences between North and South.

There is a good deal of jumping around from subject to subject and from one era of time to another. One gets the feeling that the authors are trying to stuff material into the book.

CONCLUSION

(1) The teaching aids are not as good. (Important)
(2) The organization of material is not so well adapted to the seventh and eighth grade level as Living In Our America.
   (a) Vocabulary is more suitable to the eighth grade than to the seventh.
   (b) Concepts are not so well developed.
   (c) Since certain phases of history are treated by retroaction, understanding is less thorough.
(3) No logical break in the organization of the material to allow for usage in various semesters of either the seventh or eighth grade. For instance, in Living In Our America, can be used in either semester or either grade.
(4) The amount of space devoted to certain periods of history not considered "really important," such as Exploration, is given excessive treatment. (Opinion)

SUMMARY

The differences between This Is America's Story and Living In Our America are not so great that one can say unequivocally which is the better book. However, when one compares the qualities presented objectively as possible, with the welfare of the welfare of America as the most suitable text for eighth grade students in mind, it is with sincerity that the committee recommends Living In Our America as the most suitable text for eighth grade students.
If there is the possibility that *Living In Our America* cannot be had, due to unforeseen reasons, then the committee recommends *His Is America's Story* as an alternative.

SUGGESTION: The teacher should have a copy of both of these texts because either will supplement the other and students will benefit from the use of both.
Students in all eighth grade social studies classes and two seventh grade classes were asked specific questions in regard to the textbooks' qualities. Following is the survey, books ranked from left to right with the most positive answers to all questions.

**QUESTIONS**

1. **Does the table of content make the book seem interesting?**
   - **Building a Free Nation**
     - 7th: NO 3
     - 8th: 2 15
   - **This is America's Story**
     - 7th: NO 4
     - 8th: 2 14
   - **Living in Our America**
     - 7th: NO 3
     - 8th: 4 13

2. **Does the book appeal to you?**
   - **Building a Free Nation**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 1 16
   - **This is America's Story**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 1 15
   - **Living in Our America**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 1 15

3. **Would you be interested in the projects at the end of the chapter of Unit?**
   - **Building a Free Nation**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 4 13
   - **This is America's Story**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 2 14
   - **Living in Our America**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 3 14

4. **What do you think of the maps, illustrations, pictures etc.?**
   - **Building a Free Nation**
     - 7th: NO 3
     - 8th: 2 15
   - **This is America's Story**
     - 7th: NO 4
     - 8th: 1 15
   - **Living in Our America**
     - 7th: NO 4
     - 8th: 3 14

5. **Check a given page for vocabulary and state the number not understood.**
   - **Building a Free Nation**
     - 7th: 2
     - 8th: 4
   - **This is America's Story**
     - 7th: 0
     - 8th: 2
   - **Living in Our America**
     - 7th: 5
     - 8th: 1

6. **Would you like to have this book next year?**
   - **Building a Free Nation**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 4 14
   - **This is America's Story**
     - 7th: NO 2
     - 8th: 4 14
   - **Living in Our America**
     - 7th: NO 3
     - 8th: 3 14

**Total**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7th</th>
<th>8th</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Building a Free Nation</strong></td>
<td>3 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>This is America's Story</strong></td>
<td>11 78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.